POST KEYNESIAN MONEY SUPPLY ENDOGENEITY IN MALAYSIA: AN EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATION

SABRI NAYAN

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
UNIVERSITI UTARA MALAYSIA
2010
POST KEYNESIAN MONEY SUPPLY ENDOGENEITY IN MALAYSIA: AN EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATION

By

SABRI NAYAN

Thesis Submitted to the Centre for Research & Post Graduate Studies, College of Arts and Sciences, Universiti Utara Malaysia, in Fulfillment of the Requirement for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy
In presenting this thesis in fulfilment of the requirements for a post graduate degree from Universiti Utara Malaysia, I agree that the University Library may make it freely available for inspection. I further agree that permission for copying of this thesis in any manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purposes may be granted by my supervisor or, in their absence, by Dean of Research & Post Graduate, College of Arts and Sciences. It is understood that any copying or publication or use of this thesis or parts thereof for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission. It is also understood that due recognition shall be given to me and to Universiti Utara Malaysia for any scholar use which may be made of any material from my thesis.

Request for permission to copy or to make other use of material in this thesis in whole or in part should be addressed to:

Dean of Research & Post Graduate  
College of Arts and Sciences  
Universiti Utara Malaysia  
06010 UUM Sintok  
Kedah Darul Aman
ABSTRAK

Kestabilan, kemajuan dan kebajikan umum sesuatu ekonomi akan sangat bergantung kepada tahap penawaran wang dalam ekonomi tersebut disamping polisi kewangan yang dilaksanakan oleh pihak berkuasa kewangan ekonomi tersebut. Dengan demikian maka isu pokoknya ialah, apakah kuaniti penawaran wag menentukan tahap-tahap kegiatan ekonomi dan pengeluaran, atau apakah kegiatan-kegiatan ekonomi dan pengeluaran yang menentukan tahap penawaran wag di dalam sesuatu ekonomi?


penemuan empiris kajian ini boleh diringkaskan kedalam lima perkara pokok utama: Pertama KDNK Malaysia adalah penyebab kepada penawaran wag (iaitu M1,M2 dan M3). Kedua, pinjaman bank adalah penyebab kepada penawaran wag agregat iaitu M0, M1, M2 dan M3). Penemuan ketiga kajian ini ialah bahawa kadar bunga polisi atau kadar bunga antara bank (IBR) adalah penyebab kepada tiga jenis kadar bunga: Kadar bunga dasar (BLR), kadar bunga bil perbendaharaan (TBR) dan juga kadar bunga sekuriti kerajaan Malaysia lima tahun (MGS5R). Bahawa deposit menjadi penyebab kepada rizab adalah penemuan ke empat kajian ini. Penemuan yang terakhir bagi kajian ini melibatkan pertainial antara pinjaman bank dan pengganda-wang: Pengganda-wang M1 (M1MPR), pengganda-wang M2 (M2MPR) dan pengganda-wang M3 (M3MPR).

Bukti empiris yang terdapat dalam tesis ini adalah merupakan sokongan kuat kepada hipotesis bahawa penawaran wag di Malaysia ditentukan secara endogenous. Ringkasnya, bukti yang terdapat dalam kajian ini menunjukkan dengan tegas hakikat bahawa penawaran wag di Malaysia didorong oleh kredit dan juga ditentukan oleh permintaan terhadap kredit.
ABSTRACT

The stability, progress and the general welfare of an economy would depend much on the level of its money supply as well as the monetary policy initiated by its monetary authority. The central issue is, does the quantity of money supply determine the levels of economic activities and production, or are economic activities and production that actually determine the level of money supply in an economy?

According to Post Keynesian analysis, money supply endogeneity are based on four ‘sub-school’ i.e., *Horizontalist, Structuralist, Liquidity Preference View and Circuit Theory of Money*. This study attempts to investigate empirically the issue of endogeneity/exogeneity of money supply, based on the Malaysian economic environment and planned to meet two major objectives. First, is to identify whether the supply of money in Malaysia is endogenously or exogenously determined. Secondly, if money supply in Malaysia is endogenously determined, the data will be analyzed further to identify the sub-school of Post Keynesian economics that these data supports.

The data are analyzed by utilizing the Johansen (1990/91) cointegration procedure, involving three steps; namely, *unit root tests, cointegration tests and vector error correction model (VECM) analysis*. The empirical findings are summarized into five major points. First, the Malaysia GDP causes money supply (i.e., M1, M2 and M3). Secondly, bank loan causes monetary aggregate (i.e., M0, M1, M2, and M3). The third finding that policy rate or interbank rate (IBR) causes base lending rate (BLR), T-bill rate (TBR) and the Malaysian government securities for five years rate (MGS5R). Followed by the fourth finding, deposits cause reserves. The last major finding of the study involves the relationships between bank loan and money multipliers: the M1 money multiplier (M1MPR), the M2 money multiplier (M2MPR) and the M3 money multiplier (M3MPR).

The empirical evidence provided in the present thesis is strongly consistent with the hypothesis that money supply in Malaysia is endogenously determined. Simply put, our evidence strongly points to the fact that money supply in Malaysia is credit-driven and demand determined.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In the name of Allah the most benevolent and most merciful. All praises to Allah, God of the universe and Peace be upon His Messenger.

I am obviously grateful to Allah the Mighty whose guidance and inspirations have enabled the thesis to be completed.

This thesis would not have been made possible without the support and encouragement of a number of people. First and foremost, I would like to express my sincere and heartfelt gratitude to my supervisor, Lt. Col. Professor Dr. Abdul Razak Chik, for the guidance, comments, and patience.

The special thanks go to Associate Professor, Dr. Mat Saad Abdullah for showing me different ways to approach a research problem and the need to be persistent to accomplish any goal. Dr. Mat Saad has been a friend and mentor. He taught me writing skill, had confidence in me when I doubted myself, and brought out the good ideas in me. Without his encouragement and constant guidance, I could not have finished this thesis. He was always there to meet and talk about my ideas, and to ask me good questions to help me think through (and get some insights into) my problems whether philosophical or analytical.

My appreciation also goes to Universiti Teknologi MARA, for granting me study leave to continue my doctoral studies; Universiti Utara Malaysia and the Central Bank of Malaysia for the cooperation and assistance given during my studies.

I am also greatly indebted to many friends: Zaidi Mat Zain, Abd. Rahim Warris, and Zawiyah Shariff for providing the moral supports during my studies. I also offer my special
thanks to my younger brother, Sharudin Bin Nayan for knowledge and assistance in computer expertise.

Last, but certainly not least, I am indebted to my family, especially my wife, Dr. Norsiah Kadir, for her understanding and endless love, help and endurance, which provided me with vital encouragement; my beloved sons, Akmal Hidayat and Muhammad Luqman Adam, who have given me joy and happiness during this challenging process; and finally, my father and my mother, who gave me love and education – I owe both of them so much. The author would also like to express love and gratitude to younger sisters Salinda Nayan and Salina Nayan. Lastly, I offer my regards and blessing to all of those who supported me in any respect during the completion of the thesis.

May Allah bless all of us.
Thank you…

Sabri Nayan
No. 3, Jalan Utama 5
Taman Utama
01000 Kangar, Perlis.

September, 2010
1.5.1 General Objective 18
1.5.2 Specific Objective 18

1.6 Significance of the Study 19

1.7 Scope and Limitations of the Study 21

1.8 Organization of the Thesis 22

1.9 Concluding Remarks 23

**CHAPTER 2: POST KEYNESIAN ECONOMICS**

2.1 Introduction 24

2.2 Founders of the Post Keynesian Economics 25

2.3 Money Supply Endogeneity: An Overview of the Four Branches of Post Keynesian School 29

  2.3.1 Horizontalism 31
  2.3.2 Structuralism 32
  2.3.3 Liquidity Preference (LP) View 33
  2.3.4 Circuit Theory of Money (CTM) 35

2.4 Monetary Transmission Mechanism: Post Keynesian versus Orthodox Views 39

2.5 Concluding Remarks 41

**CHAPTER 3: LITERATURE REVIEW**

3.1 Introduction 42

3.2 The Endogeneity of Money Supply 44

3.3 Horizontalist (Accommodationist) and Structuralist Views 49

3.4 The Liquidity Preference View 61

3.5 Circuit Theory of Money (CTM) 63
3.6 Money Supply Endogeneity: Selected Evidences 65
3.7 Concluding Remarks 74

CHAPTER 4: METHODOLOGY 75
4.1 Introduction 75
4.2 Data Description 77
4.3 Method of Analysis 79
4.3.1 Step One: Testing for Stationarity 79
4.3.2 Step Two: Visual Inspection of the Data 79
4.3.3 Step Three: Testing for Cointegration and Causal Relationships(s) 80
4.4 Modeling Money Supply Endogeneity 82
4.4.1 GDP and Money Supply 82
4.4.2 Loan and Money Supply 84
4.4.3 Interest Rate Channel of Monetary Transmission 86
4.4.4 Reserves and Deposits 88
4.4.5 Loan and Money Multiplier (MMPR) 89
4.5 Concluding Remarks 91

CHAPTER 5: RESULTS AND DATA ANALYSIS 93
5.1 Introduction 93
5.2 Testing for Integration (Unit Root Test) 94
5.3 Causal Relationship between the GDP and Money Supply 97
5.3.1 GDP and M1 99
5.3.2 GDP and M2 102
5.3.3 GDP and M3 105
5.4 Causal relationship between Loan and Money Supply 108
5.4.1 Lending and Base Money (M0) 112
5.4.2 Lending and M1 114
5.4.3 Lending and M2 117
5.4.3 Lending and M3 119

viii
5.5 Interest Rate Channel of Monetary Transmission Mechanism 122
  5.5.1 Interbank rate (OPR) and base lending rate 123
  5.5.2 Interbank rate and T-bills rate 129
  5.5.3 Interbank rate and MGS5R 133

5.6 Causal relationship between Reserves and Deposits 137

5.7 Causal relationship between Loan and Money Multiplier 141
  5.7.1 Loan and M1 money multiplier (M1MPR) 142
  5.7.2 Loan and M2 money multiplier (M2MPR) 145
  5.7.3 Loan and M3 money multiplier (M3MPR) 148

5.8 Summary of Empirical Findings 150

5.9 Concluding Remarks 154

CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS 155

6.1 Contribution to the body of knowledge 156

6.2 Policy Implications 157

6.3 Considerations for Future Research 164

6.4 Concluding Remarks 166

APPENDIX I 170

APPENDIX II 177

APPENDIX III 190

APPENDIX IV 193
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1  Schools of Monetary Thought: A Comparison of Hypothesis  38
Table 3.1  Evidences on Money Supply Endogeneity  72
Table 4.1  Data Set: Key Variables, Description and Source  78
Table 5.1  Stationary Results based on Phillips-Perron (PP) test  95
Table 5.2  Stationary Results based on ADF test  96
Table 5.3  Stationary Results based on KPSS test  96
Table 5.4a  Johansen Cointegration: GDP and M1 (Trace Statistic)  99
Table 5.4b  Johansen Cointegration: GDP and M1 (Maximum Eigenvalue)  100
Table 5.4c  GDP and M1: OLS and Johansen Estimates (VECM)  101
Table 5.5a  Johansen Cointegration: GDP and M2 (Trace Statistic)  102
Table 5.5b  Johansen Cointegration: GDP and M2 (Maximum Eigenvalue)  103
Table 5.5c  GDP and M2: OLS and Johansen Estimates (VECM)  104
Table 5.6a  Johansen Cointegration: GDP and M3 (Trace Statistic)  105
Table 5.6b  Johansen Cointegration: GDP and M3 (Maximum Eigenvalue)  105
Table 5.6c  GDP and M3: OLS and Johansen Estimates (VECM)  107
Table 5.7a  Johansen Cointegration: Lending and M0 (Trace Statistic)  112
Table 5.7b  Johansen Cointegration: Lending and M0 (Maximum Eigenvalue)  112
Table 5.7c  Lending and M0: OLS and Johansen Estimates (VECM)  114
Table 5.8a  Johansen Cointegration: Lending and M1 (Trace Statistic)  115
Table 5.8b  Johansen Cointegration: Lending and M1 (Maximum Eigenvalue)  115
Table 5.8c  Lending and M1: OLS and Johansen Estimates (VECM)  116
(Trace Statistic)

Table 5.15b  Johansen Cointegration: Loan and M1MPR
(Maximum Eigenvalue)  143

Table 5.15c  Loan and M1MPR: OLS and Johansen Estimates (VECM)  144

Table 5.16a  Johansen Cointegration: Loan and M2MPR (Trace Statistic)  145

Table 5.16b  Johansen Cointegration: Loan and M2MPR
(Maximum Eigenvalue)  145

Table 5.16c  Loan and M2MPR: OLS and Johansen Estimates (VECM)  147

Table 5.17a  Johansen Cointegration: Loan and M3MPR (Trace Statistic)  148

Table 5.17b  Johansen Cointegration: Loan and M3MPR (Maximum Eigenvalue)  148

Table 5.17c  Loan and M3MPR: OLS and Johansen Estimates (VECM)  149

Table 5.18  Evidence of Money Supply Endogeneity in Malaysia  153
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1 The Monetary Circuit 36
Figure 2.2 Monetary Transmission Mechanism based on Post Keynesian View 40
Figure 2.3 Monetary Transmission Mechanism based on Orthodox View 41
Figure 3.1 Endogenous Money Analysis of the Reserve Market 57
Figure 3.2 Endogenous Money Analysis of the Credit Market 60
Figure 5.1 The Malaysian GDP and M1 97
Figure 5.2 The Malaysian GDP and M2 98
Figure 5.3 The Malaysian GDP and M3 98
Figure 5.4 Credit and Base Money (M0) 109
Figure 5.5 Credit and M1 109
Figure 5.6 Credit and M2 110
Figure 5.7 Credit and M3 110
Figure 5.8 Bank Lending and Monetary Aggregates 111
Figure 5.9 Interbank rate and Base Lending Rate (BLR) 124
Figure 5.10 Spread between Interbank rate and Base Lending Rate 125
Figure 5.11 Interbank rate and T-Bills rate 130
Figure 5.12 Interbank rate and Malaysian Government Securities for 5 years 134
Figure 5.13 Reserves and Deposits 138
Figure 5.14 Money Multipliers for Malaysia 142
**LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ADF</td>
<td>Augmented Dickey- Fuller test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BLR</td>
<td>Base Lending Rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BNM</td>
<td>Bank Negara Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTM</td>
<td>Circuit Theory of Money</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G7</td>
<td>Group of Seven Developed Countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IBR</td>
<td>Interbank Rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JJ</td>
<td>Johansen &amp; Juselius</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KPSS</td>
<td>Kwiatkowski, Phillips, Schmidt, and Shin's test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LP</td>
<td>Liquidity Preference View</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGS5R</td>
<td>Malaysian Government Securities for 5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMPR</td>
<td>Money Multiplier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OLS</td>
<td>Ordinary Least Square</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPR</td>
<td>Overnight Policy Rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PP</td>
<td>Phillips-Perron test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TBR</td>
<td>T-Bill rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VECM</td>
<td>Vector Error Correction Model</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DEFINITION OF TERMS

Base Money (M0):
In Economics, base money (also monetary base, high-powered money, reserve money) is a term relating to money supply, the amount of money in the economy. 
Base money = Currency in Circulation + Required Reserves + Excess Reserves

Endogenous Money:
Endogenous money refers to the theory that money comes into existence as it is needed by the real economy and that banking system reserves are enlarged or drained as needed to accommodate the demand for lending at the prevailing interest rates.

Liability Management:
Any reduction in the bank reserve requirement ratio by the Central Bank will cause a sudden fall in the monetary base. Concomitantly, banks are obliged to purchase certificates of deposits issued by the Central Bank and/or they may borrow from interbank market, that is liability management activities.

M1 Money Supply:
M1 = Currency in Circulation + Demand Deposits

M2 Money Supply:
M2 = M1 + Narrow Quasi-Money

Narrow Quasi-Money = Savings Deposits + Fixed Deposits + NIDs + Repos + Foreign Currency Deposits + other deposits

M3 Money Supply:
M3 = M2 + Deposits Placed with Other Banking Institutions

Post Keynesian Economics:
Post-Keynesian Economics is a school of economic thought with its origins in The General Theory of John Maynard Keynes, although its subsequent development was influenced to a large degree by Michal Kalecki, Joan Robinson, Nicholas Kaldor and Paul Davidson. The Post Keynesian School has remained closet to the spirit of Keynes’ work, particularly in his monetary theory and in rejecting the theory of exogenous money.
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

Malaysia is considered as an advanced developing economy. It is practicing a market oriented production economy popularly known as a mixed economy. Under this system, while economic activities in general are determined by the market, the government intervenes in the economy through both its fiscal and monetary policies – for the purpose of sustain economic growth as well as stability.

1.1 Malaysia and its Monetary System: An Overview

Since the present research project on endogeneity of money supply is based on the Malaysian data, it worth at this stage to have an overview of the Malaysian monetary system.

1.1.1 The Financial System

The present structure of the Malaysian financial system is divided into three segments, namely the banking sector, the non-bank financial intermediaries and the financial markets.

1.1.1.1 The Banking Sector

Based on the recent report by the Bank Negara Annual Report (2009), the Malaysian banking sector consists of the monetary institutions and non-monetary institutions.
The contents of the thesis is for internal user only
REFERENCES


198


205


219


220


