FROM PLURAL SOCIETY TO BANGSA MALAYSIA:
ETHNICITY AND NATIONALISM IN THE POLITICS OF
NATION-BUILDING IN MALAYSIA

Mohamed Mustafa Bin Ishak
Submitted in accordance with the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

The University of Leeds
Department of Sociology and Social Policy
&
Department of Politics

July 1999

The candidate confirms that the work submitted is his own and that appropriate credit has been given where reference has been made to the work of others.
From plural society to *Bangsa Malaysia*: Ethnicity and nationalism in the politics of nation-building in Malaysia

Doctor of Philosophy
July 1999

ABSTRACT

The question of nation-building has always been a central issue in Malaysian politics. Whilst the country has been able to sustain a relatively stable politics since the 1969 tragedy, and hence spawn a rapid economic development (at least until the 1997 Asian economic crisis), the project of nation-building remained a basic national agenda yet to be fully resolved. This study investigates the delicate process of nation-building in Malaysia in the post 1970s, especially in the context of the vision of constructing the *Bangsa Malaysia* or 'a united Malaysian nation' enshrined in Mahathir's Vision 2020 project which was introduced in 1991. The aim of the study is firstly, to examine the underlying socio-political parameters that shaped and influenced the politics of nation-building in the country, and secondly, to explore the viability of the project of *Bangsa Malaysia* in the context of the daunting challenges involved in the process of nation-building. Drawing from a range of theoretical frameworks as well as from both primary and secondary data, the study contends that, based on the Malaysian experience, the potent interplay between the forces of ethnicity and nationalism constitute the crux of the problems in the politics of nation-building in Malaysia. This dialectic it is argued, stems from the prevalence of the varying perceptions of 'nation-of-intent' within and across ethnic groups. These phenomena have not only shaped the pattern of ethnic political mobilisation in the country, but above all, laid the most complex set of obstacles in the path of the project of nation-building. This study argues that the project of constructing the *Bangsa Malaysia* therefore, can be seen as a significant attempt by the state to reconcile the varying ethnic ideologies of nation-of-intent. It can also be considered as an attempt to consolidate Malay nationalism and cultural pluralism, thus, depicting 'the nation' as a 'mosaic of cultures', or reflecting a creation of 'a supra-ethnic' national identity. However, the viability of the envisaged project is yet to be tested. The concept itself is still vague to many people and the challenges ahead are enormous, involving political, economic, socio-cultural and religious issues. Indeed, the project risks becoming the 'latest' in the series of competing notions of nation-of-intent circulating in Malaysia. This study contends that whilst, to some extent, the socio-political landscape of Malaysian society has been rapidly changing, especially under the eighteen years of Mahathir's reign, ethnicity still pervades Malaysian political life. This study differs from many previous studies on nation-building in Malaysia which have mainly focused on either the historical dimensions or those which have examined the impact of key national policies. As such, it is hoped that this study would be able to provide an alternative perspective in the analysis of ethnic relations and nation-building in Malaysia, thus broadening the understanding of Malaysian politics and society.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The initial idea of this study emerged after Dr. Mahathir Mohamad introduced Vision 2020 in 1991. However, it was the encouragement from my great teacher and friend- Professor Shamsul Amri Baharudin in 1993 that prompted me to pursue this subject as a Ph.D. thesis. This study would not have been successfully completed without the support and valuable contributions received from a number of individuals and organisations. First and foremost, I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisors, Dr. Ian Law and Dr. Duncan McCargo, who have guided me throughout the study. Regular intellectual discussions that I have with both of them have sharpened my knowledge and academic perspective. Above all, their inexhaustible advice and constant support throughout my stay in Leeds since October 1995 have stimulated my motivation in the intellectual pursuit.

Secondly, I would like to extend my appreciation to my employer, Universiti Utara Malaysia which approved my study leave; and to the Government of Malaysia which provided me scholarship to carry out this research. I wish to thank the Institute of Strategic and International Studies (ISIS), the Department of National Unity, and University of Malaya for allowing me to obtain valuable documents and references from their collection. I am also indebted to six Universiti Utara Malaysia’s students who have acted as my research assistants during field-work interview from March to May 1997.

I would also like to record my special appreciation to all the respondents who have been willing to be interviewed for this study. Many of them have been very cooperative and helpful. The interview experience was a great time for me which had enabled me to explore their thinking and perceptions on various issue on Malaysian politics and society. To all my Malaysian and international friends in Leeds, our interactions and shared life in the UK would certainly be an unforgettable experience. I would also like to express my gratitude to Professor Ahmad Fawzi Basri, the Deputy Vice Chancellor of Universiti Utara Malaysia for his constant encouragement and concern of my study and welfare in Leeds. Many thanks also to my friends Rohana Yusof, Najib Marzuki, Hamzah Samat, Abu Seman Awang, Dr. Mustafa Hj. Daud, Azmi Shaari, and all colleague at UUM who have been very helpful throughout my intellectual pursuit in Leeds and in Malaysia.

Last, but not least, I am truly indebted to my beloved wife Norhayati Nazri for her sacrifices, understanding and patiently shared my ups and downs during the period of my study. To my two adored children- Liyana and Hariz, I want them to know that they have been so entertaining when I was faced with the tense pressure of completing the thesis. We have shared a wonderful time together, despite the various constraints that we faced throughout our stay in Leeds.
For
Norhayati,
Liyana and Hariz
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract i
Acknowledgements ii
Dedication iii
Table of Contents iv
List of Tables viii
Abbreviations ix

PART I : BACKGROUND TO THE RESEARCH

Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1 Prologue 1
1.2 Problem statement 4
1.3 Objectives of the study 7
1.4 Significance and contribution of the study 8
1.5 Theoretical framework 10
1.6 Research methodology 11
  1.6.1 Methods of data collection 12
  1.6.2 The respondents 13
1.7 Limitation of the study 14
1.8 Structure of the thesis 15

Chapter 2: Ethnicity, Nationalism, and Nation-Building: The Theoretical Framework

2.1 Introduction 18
2.2 The dimensions of ethnicity 19
  2.2.1 The concepts of ethnic, ethnic groups, and ethnicity 19
  2.2.2 Defining the terms race, nation, and communalism 22
  2.2.3 Ethnic political mobilisations and the politics of ethnicity 23
  2.2.4 Managing ethnicity: cultural pluralism and consociational democracy 27
2.3 The dimensions of nationalism 32
  2.3.1 Nation, ethnicity, and nationalism: the theoretical linkages 33
  2.3.2 Nationalism and ‘nation-of-intent’ 43
2.4 The project of nation-building in plural societies 44
2.5 Conclusion 49
### Chapter 3: The State, Political Process, and Managing Ethnicity: Background to the Malaysian Case

3.1 Introduction 52  
3.2 The development and management of ethnicity in colonial Malaya 52  
3.3 Ethic mobilisation: the politics of co-operation and confrontation  
   3.3.1 From Malayan Union to Independence: constructing the social contract 62  
   3.3.2 From *Perikatan* to *Barisan Nasional*: the trials and tribulations of the social contract 73  
3.4 Conclusion 82

### Chapter 4: Nation-Building and the Development of the Debate on Identity Formation in Malaysia

4.1 Introduction 85  
4.2 Nation-building: The Process, purposes and agencies 85  
4.3 Identity formation in Malaysia: the development of the debate 92  
   4.3.1 The pre-independence debate 93  
   4.3.2 The post-1969 debate 100  
4.4 Conclusion 107

### Part II: National Integration and the Social Origins of Competing ‘Nationalisms’

### Chapter 5: From State-Building to Nation-Building: A Critique of National Policies

5.1 Introduction 108  
5.2 The National Education Policy 109  
   5.2.1 Education and the politics of nation-building 122  
5.3 The New Economic Policy (NEP) 1970-1990 125  
   5.3.1 The NEP and the socio-economic reforms 125  
   5.3.2 The NEP critics 131  
   5.3.3 The NEP and national unity 137  
5.4 The National Cultural Policy 138  
   5.4.1 The politics of National Cultural Policy 139  
   5.4.2 Resolving the cultural dilemma 144  
5.5 Conclusion 147
Chapter 10: Conclusion

10.1 Prologue 287
10.2 Ethnicity and nationalism in Malaysia 287
10.3 Nation-building and the competing ethnic ideologies in Malaysia 294
10.4 The prospect for Bangsa Malaysia 297
10.5 The epilogue: agenda for further research 302

Bibliography 304
# List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1</td>
<td>Households in poverty by ethnic group in Peninsular Malaysia 1970</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2</td>
<td>Ownership of share capital of limited company in Malaysia 1969</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3</td>
<td>Progress of the New Economic Policy, 1970-85/95</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4</td>
<td>Classification of Chinese based on their educational background</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5</td>
<td>Classification of Chinese based on their attitude towards nation-building</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABIM</td>
<td>Angkatan Belia Islam Malaysia (Malaysian Islamic Youth Movement)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMCJA</td>
<td>All-Malaya Council for Joint Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>API</td>
<td>Angkatan Pemuda Insaf (Youth Awareness Movement)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APU</td>
<td>Angkatan Perpaduan Ummah (Umma United Movement)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASEAN</td>
<td>Association of Southeast Asian Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AWAS</td>
<td>Angkatan Wanita Sedar (Women Awareness Movement)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Berjaya</td>
<td>Parti Berjaya Sabah (Sabah Success Party)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BN</td>
<td>Barisan Nasional (National Front)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAP</td>
<td>Democratic Action Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPF</td>
<td>Employee Provident Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FELDA</td>
<td>Federal Land Development Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gerakan</td>
<td>Parti Gerakan Rakyat Malaysia (Malaysian People’s Movement Party)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HICOM</td>
<td>Heavy Industry Corporation of Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMP</td>
<td>Independence of Malaya Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISA</td>
<td>Internal Security Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISIS</td>
<td>Institute of Strategic and International Studies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KeAdilan</td>
<td>Parti Keadilan Nasional (National Justice Party)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KMM</td>
<td>Kesatuan Melayu Muda (Young Malays’ Association)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARA</td>
<td>Majlis Amanah Rakyat (Peoples’ Trust Council)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAPEN</td>
<td>Majlis Perundingan Ekonomi Negara (see: NECC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCA</td>
<td>Malayan/Malaysian Chinese Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCP</td>
<td>Malayan Communist Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIC</td>
<td>Malayan/Malaysian Indian Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MNP</td>
<td>Malay Nationalist Party (see PKMM)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPAJA</td>
<td>Malayan People’s Anti-Japanese Army</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCC</td>
<td>National Consultative Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDP</td>
<td>National Development Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEAC</td>
<td>National Economic Action Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NECC</td>
<td>National Economic Consultative Council (see MAPEN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEP</td>
<td>New Economic Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOC</td>
<td>National Operation Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAP</td>
<td>Peoples’ Action Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAS</td>
<td>Parti Islam Se-Malaysia (Pan Malaysian Islamic Party)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBB</td>
<td>Parti Pesaka-Bumiputera Bersatu (Bumiputera’s Party)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBDS</td>
<td>Parti Bangsa Dayak Sarawak (Party of the Dayak People of Sarawak)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBS</td>
<td>Parti Bersatu Sabah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petronas</td>
<td>Petroleum Nasional (National Petroleum)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPP</td>
<td>People’s Progressive Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRM</td>
<td>Parti Rakyat Malaysia (Malaysia’s People Party)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PUTERA</td>
<td>Pusat Tenaga Rakyat (Centre of Peoples’ Power)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S46</td>
<td>Parti Melayu Semangat 46 (Malay Party of the Spirit of 46)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SNAP</td>
<td>Sarawak National Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUPP</td>
<td>Sarawak United People’s Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UMNO</td>
<td>United Malays National Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USNO</td>
<td>United Sabah National Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PART I

BACKGROUND TO THE RESEARCH
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Prologue

The paradox of nation-building in many deeply divided societies is one of reconciling ethnic allegiance with overarching loyalty to the state. This is because the forces of ethnicity and nationalism that emerged in these societies tend to be social and politically salient, thus, making the process of nation-building not only difficult but a complex task. Broadly speaking, nation-building refers to a process of constructing national identity that could accommodate ethnic pluralism while simultaneously inculcating an overarching sense of nationhood. It is usually a process associated with plural societies. As a plural society, nation-building has always been a great challenge for Malaysia. Ethnicity characterised the very basis of Malaysian politics. This is reflected by the fact that political struggles are often fought on an ethnic basis, and the tendency of most political issues to be perceived in ethnic terms (see: Zakaria Ahmad, 1989; Crouch, 1996). This is a prevailing phenomenon in Malaysian polity since its independence in 1957. Amid its relative stability and rapid economic development especially over the past two decades, Malaysia's nation-building project has not been fully accomplished, and constantly dominates political agendas.

Malaysian society comprises three major ethnic communities, namely the Malays, who made up about 50 percent of the population, and two sizeable immigrant communities, one Chinese (37 per cent) and the other Indian (11 per cent). In the context of Malaysian politics, the Malays together with other indigenous peoples are classified as Bumiputera (lit. sons of the soil) - who enjoy certain privileges as stipulated under the Malaysian constitution. On the other hand, the Chinese and the

---

1 The terms Malay and Bumiputera which are used in Malaysia often in the context of affirmative action programmes may at times cause confusion. Legally speaking, the term Bumiputera is referred to the indigenous communities in Sabah and Sarawak, the majority of which are non-Muslim. The term Malay is used to refer to ethnic Malays in the Peninsular who are Muslim. The small minority of indigenous (aborigine) communities in the Peninsular are classified as the Orang Asli. However, during the NEP period (1971-1990), the term Bumiputera has
The contents of the thesis is for internal user only
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Government Publications

CO 717 183 Colonial Office Records relating to the meetings of the Communities Liaison Committee, April 1949 to September 1949.


List of Interviews

I. Leading politicians and bureaucrats

1. Tan Sri Muhyiddin Yassin, The Minister of Youth and Sports.

2. Tan Sri Koh Tsu Khoon, The Chief Minister of Penang.

3. Tan Sri Ghazali Shafie, Malaysia’s former Foreign Minister.
4. Dr. Goh Cheng Teik, Deputy Minister of Land and Regional Development.

5. Mr. Lim Kit Siang, Opposition Leader and the DAP Secretary General.

6. Datuk Haji Fadhil Noor, President of PAS.
   Formal interview at his office in Alor Star, Kedah, 7 May 1997.

7. Dr. Tan Seng Giaw, DAP Vice-Chairman, and MP for Kepong.
   Formal interview at his clinic in Petaling Jaya, 14 March 1997.

8. Mr. Wan Yaacob Hassan, Director General of the Department of National Unity.
   Formal interview at his office in Kuala Lumpur, 8 April 1997.

9. Haji Subky Latiff, Member of PAS Central Committee.

II. Leading intellectuals
10. Professor Khoo Kay Kim, Professor of History, University of Malaya.
    Formal interview at University of Malaya, Kuala Lumpur, 30 April 1997.

11. Professor Lee Kam Hing, Professor of History, University Malaya.
    Formal interview at University of Malaya, Kuala Lumpur, 10 April 1997.

12. Professor Shamsul A.B., the Dean Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanity,
    Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM- National University of Malaysia).
    Informal discussion, at his office in UKM, Bangi, 11 April 1993.

13. Professor Datuk Zainal Abidin Wahid, Retired Professor of History.
    Formal interview at his house in Petaling Jaya, 11 March 1997.

14. Professor H.M. Dahlan, the Dean Faculty of Development Science, UKM.
    Formal interview at his office in UKM, 31 March 1997, two months before his untimely demise.

15. Dr. Ranjit Singh, Associate Professor of History, University of Malaya.
    Formal interview at University of Malaya, Kuala Lumpur, 30 April 1997.

16. Dr. P. Ramasamy, Associate Professor of Political Science, UKM.
    Formal interview at UKM, Bangi, 31 March 1997.

17. Dr. Jayum A. Jawan, Dean, Faculty of Human Ecology, Universiti Putra Malaysia (UPM).
    Formal interview, at UPM, Serdang, 7 April 1997.

18. Dr. Ahmad Fawzi Basri, Deputy Vice Chancellor, Universiti Utara Malaysia (UUM-The Northern University of Malaysia).
    Series of informal discussions, at his office in UUM, Sintok, between March-April 1997.

19. Dr. Kua Kia Soong, Director of the Dong Jiao Zhong (Chinese Education Association), at his office in Kajang, 2 April 1997.

20. Mr. Rustam A. Sani, Freelance Writer.
    Formal Interview at his house in Kuala Lumpur, 7 April 1997.

III. Key Opinion Formers
    Formal interview at his office in Kuala Lumpur, 28 March 1997.

22. Datuk Johan Jaafar, Editor-in-Chief, the Utusan Melayu Group.
    Formal interview at his office in Kuala Lumpur, 7 May 1997.

23. Datuk Ahmad Nazri Abdullah, Editor-in-Chief, Berita Harian Press.
24. Mr. Chamil Wariya, Editor, Magazine Division, Utusan Melayu Group.  
Formal interview, at his office in Kuala Lumpur, 10 April 1997.
Formal interview at his house in Petaling Jaya, 27 March 1997.
Informal Discussion, 2 May 1997.

IV. The Community
27. Series of informal interviews with 13 University Utara Malaysia (UUM) students of various ethnic background and gender from 1 March 997-21 May 1997, at UUM campus in Sintok.
29. Series of informal interviews with 7 public sector respondents of different ethnic background, gender, and age, from 1 March 1997-21 May 1997 in Malaysia.
30. Series of informal interviews with 6 private sector respondents of different ethnic background, gender, and age, from 1 March 1997-21 May 1997 in Malaysia.

Books and Periodicals


Hua Wu Yin (1983) **Class and Communalism in Malaysia.** London: Zed.
Hussin Mutalib (1990) **Islam And Ethnicity in Malay Politics.** Singapore: Oxford University Press.


Loh Kok Wah, Francis (1992) 'Modernisation, Cultural Revival and Counter-
Hegemony: The Kadazans of Sabah in the 1980's, in Joel S Kahn & Francis Loh
Kok Wah (ed.), Fragmented Vision: Culture and Politics in Contemporary
____________________ (1971) 'Problems of Democratic Nation-Building in Malaysia', in
Ma Shu Yun (1990) 'Ethnonationalism, ethnic nationalism and mini-
nationalism: a comparison of Connors, Smith and Snyder'. In Ethnic
Mann, M. (1992) 'The emergence of modern European nationalism', in J. Hall and I.C.
Lumpur: Marican and Sons.
McKay, James and Lewins, Frank (1978) 'Ethnicity and the ethnic group: a
4 October, pp 412-27
_______________ (1990) Malaysian Politics: The Second Generation, Petaling Jaya:
Oxford University Press.
London: Croom Helm.
London.
Mohamad Abdad Mohamad Zain (1988) 'Mahathir's Corporatism vs. Razaleigh's
Liberalism: Capitalist Expansionism, Class Fractionalization and Intra-
Kuala Lumpur: Dewan Bahasa Dan Pustaka
Arenabuku.
Nordlinger, Eric A. (1972) Conflict Regulation in Divided Societies, Cambridge,
Occasional Paper No. 29, Center for International Affairs, Mass: Harvard
University.
University of Chicago Press.


Thesis/Dissertations, Magazines, Newspapers, Unpublished Reports/Materials


Idhayam, January 1, 1996.


Memorandum On National Culture Submitted By The 10 Major Indian Associations Of Malaysia To The Ministry Of Culture, Youth And Sport, April 1984.


Mohamed Mustafa Ishak, Ahmad Fawzi Basri and Idris Salleh, 'Nasionalisme dan Pembentukan Bangsa Malaysia' [Nationalism and the Formation of Malaysian Nation], Seminar Kebangsaan Nasionalisme Dan Pembangunan Di Malaysia, 15 Nov. 1994, Bangi: Jabatan Sejarah, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia.


New Straits Times, 10 November 1993.

-------------, 7 July 1982.


Straits Times July 5, 1946.


Tamil Neesan, April 29, 1991.


__________, 1 Ogos, 1995.
__________, 12 Januari 1998.
__________, 21 April 1998.
__________, 22 April 1999
__________, 8 Jun, 1998.


