THE DEVELOPMENT OF SUSTAINABLE CULTURAL HERITAGE TOURISM IN MALAYSIA: IMPLICATION FOR PLANNING AND MANAGEMENT

HAMIMI OMAR

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
NEWCASTLE UNIVERSITY
MAY 2013
The Development of Sustainable Cultural Heritage Tourism in Malaysia: Implication for Planning and Management

by

Hamimi Omar
BBA, Western Michigan University
MSc. Tourism Management, University of Strathclyde

A thesis submitted to the Newcastle University for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

International Centre for Cultural and Heritage Studies (ICCHS)
May 2013
ABSTRACT

This thesis examines the development of cultural heritage tourism in Malaysia, and questions if this tourism development has been managed in a sustainable manner. Recent national tourism policies in Malaysia increasingly have been aimed towards promoting cultural heritage tourism, signifying that cultural heritage tourism could be potentially one of the most important areas in the growth of the country’s tourism industry. While tourism development has contributed to the country’s economic growth, for cultural heritage, the thrust of the tourism industry is to make the most of the country’s non-renewable resources. This thesis identifies three key objectives required for creating sustainable tourism development in Malaysia: meeting the needs of local communities, satisfying the demands of a growing number of tourists, and safeguarding the remaining natural and cultural resources.

Knowledge leading to improvements in the development of cultural heritage tourism is important, as knowledge is a primary means of strengthening its positive aspects and simultaneously mitigating its negative aspects, so that development can maintain a long-term viability. This study also explores some of the key management issues relating to the development of cultural heritage tourism at both Federal and State levels. A broad understanding is necessary for providing a firm basis in prescribing a thorough and realistic sustainable development framework. The study employs questionnaires, surveys, and interviews with a range of government officials, local communities, and tourists. The findings indicate that the government has played a major role in shaping the development of sustainable cultural heritage tourism in Malaysia, but at present there are many shortcomings that need to be addressed, such as definitions of the term Cultural Heritage, as well as management issues, including conflicts and bureaucratic barriers. These problems, consequently, hinder a comprehensive management of cultural heritage tourism. Additional findings indicate that local communities are not actively involved in tourism planning or decision-making processes, though they generally are satisfied with development at the locations of this study. The study also calls for higher quality tourist services, and the promotion of other elements of cultural heritage to complement the already established yet limited elements. Finally, it suggests a Sustainable Cultural Heritage Tourism Framework, incorporating social and cultural elements. This thesis contributes new knowledge to the field of cultural heritage tourism in Malaysia and may serve as a starting point for researchers interested in this area. Furthermore, the results of this study are expected to be useful for guiding policy actions in the future.

Keywords: Tourism, Heritage, Cultural Heritage Tourism, Sustainable Development
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study would not have been completed if it were not from the support of many individuals who supported me during my Ph.D. candidature. I owe an enormous debt of gratitude to all of them.

My deepest thanks go to Prof. P.G. Stone, my first supervisor, for his constant support and guidance throughout the period of this study. His guidance in structuring the thesis was invaluable. His insight provided me with the possibility to grow during this process and the encouragement to finish this task. With that, my gratitude and sincere thanks goes to him. I would also like to thank S. Gerard (co-supervisor) who kindly looked through my thesis and gave me valuable comments.

I would like to state my appreciation to the Scholarship Board of the Universiti Utara Malaysia for providing funds and opportunities for this study. I would also like to thank all the informants who have participated in this research for their contributions and enthusiasm.

Last but not least, I would like to acknowledge the support of my husband Shamsul Bahrain Rawi, whom like me was throughout these years working on his doctorate. Nevertheless, he was there when I most needed the encouragement, support and inspiration. My success is without doubt also his. My deepest gratitude also goes to my three children; Anis Farhana, Anis Fatini and Amirul Bahrain who helped to balance my life between family and studies and to make my life in Newcastle as complete as it was back home in Malaysia.

Finally, all the value of this study to the society is dedicated to my parents who passed away while I was completing my studies and were unable to share in my success.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract i
Acknowledgements ii
Table of Contents iii
List of Tables ix
List of Figures xi
List of Photos xiii
List of Maps xiii
List of Abbreviations xiv

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION
1.1 Introduction 1
1.2 Overview 1
1.3 Background to the Study 4
1.4 Purpose of the Study 6
1.5 Research Question and Objectives of the Study 6
1.6 Research Methodology 8
1.7 Context of the Study 8
1.8 Significance of the Study 9
1.9 Gaps in Knowledge 9
1.10 Limitations of the Study 10
1.11 Outline Structure of the Thesis 10

CHAPTER 2: MALAYSIA
2.1 Introduction 12
2.2 Geography 12
2.3 Historical Perspectives on the Formation of Malaysia with the Influence of Colonisation on the Malaysian Communities 14
   2.3.1 Early Development of Malaysia 14
   2.3.2 Period of Colonisation 17
   2.3.3 Malaya – Pre Independence 21
   2.3.4 Malaya – Post Independence 22
2.4 The Society 22
   2.4.1 Population 22
   2.4.2 Religion 25
   2.4.3 The Political System 26
2.5 The Economy  
 2.5.1 Economy – Post Independence  
 2.5.2 Economy – Post 1980  
2.6 Conclusions

CHAPTER 3: GLOBAL TOURISM AND THE MALAYSIAN EXPERIENCE

3.1 Introduction  
3.2 A Brief History of Tourism  
3.3 Tourism as an Industry  
3.4 Conceptual Definitions and Frameworks  
 3.4.1 Tourism  
 3.4.2 Tourists  
 3.4.3 Common Classifications of Travellers  
3.5 Tourism Development  
3.6 Tourism Development in Malaysia  
 3.6.1 Tourism Development Organisations – National and Regional Organisational Frameworks  
 3.6.2 Tourism Malaysia  
3.7 Tourism Policies and Planning in Malaysia  
 3.7.1 Second Malaysia Plan (1971-1975)  
 3.7.2 Third Malaysia Plan (1976-1980)  
 3.7.3 Fourth Malaysia Plan (1981-1985)  
 3.7.4 Fifth Malaysia Plan (1986-1990)  
 3.7.5 Sixth Malaysia Plan (1991-1995)  
 3.7.6 Seventh Malaysia Plan (1996-2000)  
 3.7.7 Eighth Malaysia Plan (2001-2005)  
 3.7.8 Ninth Malaysia Plan (2006-2010)  
3.8 International Tourism in Malaysia  
 3.8.1 Arrivals and Types  
 3.8.2 Travelling Patterns  
3.9 Domestic Tourism in Malaysia  
3.10 Conclusions

CHAPTER 4: SUSTAINABLE TOURISM DEVELOPMENT

4.1 Introduction  
4.2 Sustainable Tourism Development  
4.3 Achieving Sustainable Tourism Development
CHAPTER 7: COMMUNITY SURVEY – ANALYSIS
7.1 Introduction
7.2 Community Profile
7.3 Community and Cultural Heritage
7.4 Perceptions about the Importance of Cultural Heritage
7.5 Cultural Heritage and Tourism
7.6 Attitudes towards the Development of Cultural Heritage Tourism
7.7 Conclusions

CHAPTER 8: TOURIST SURVEY – ANALYSIS
8.1 Introduction
8.2 General Profile of the Tourists
8.3 Travel Patterns
8.4 Interest in Cultural Heritage amongst Tourists
8.5 Heritage Presentation
8.6 Factors Influencing Tourists’ Decisions
8.7 Independent Sample t-test
  8.7.1 Independent Sample t-test on Malaysian Tourists
  8.7.2 Independent Sample t-test on Foreign Tourists
8.8 General Description and Comments Regarding Sites Visited
8.9 Conclusions

CHAPTER 9: DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS
9.1 Introduction
Appendix D: Interview: Government Officials
Appendix E: Reliability Test of Attitude Instrument
Appendix F: Mean Comparison between Groups within Local Communities
Appendix G: Item-Total Statistics
Appendix H: Percentage of Tourists Responding to 10 Items that Influenced Their Decision to Visit
Appendix I: Mean Comparison and t-value of Respondents’ Motivation – Malaysian and Foreign Tourists
Appendix J: Mean Comparison between Groups within Malaysian Tourists
Appendix K: Mean Comparison between Groups within Foreign Tourists
### LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Population of Malaysia</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Population by Religious Grouping (%)</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Major Foreign Earnings</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Prosser’s Model of Tourism Development</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>William’s Model of Tourism Development</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Miossec’s Model of Tourism Development</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>The Objectives and Functions of the Ministry of Tourism and Its Agency at the Federal Level</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Marketing Offices in Major Foreign Cities</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Budget Allocation for Tourism in National Development Plan</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>International Tourist Arrivals, Tourist Receipts and Length of Stays 1990 – 2008</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>Number of Arrivals by Selected Country</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>Existing and Potential International Markets</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Characteristics Mass and Alternative Tourism</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Prentice’s Typology of Heritage Attractions</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Methodology Used for Each Objective</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Types of Questionnaire Survey Method</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Community - Demographic Background</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Community – Employment</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Tourism-related Jobs</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Definition of the term Cultural Heritage by Local Communities</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>Knowledge about Cultural Heritage amongst Age Group</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>The Importance of Cultural Heritage to Community amongst Age Group</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>Scenarios Preferred by Community</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>Impacts Perceived by Community</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>Positive Impacts Perceived by Local Communities Regarding Cultural Heritage as Tourism Attraction</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.10</td>
<td>Negative Impacts Perceived by Local Communities Regarding Cultural Heritage as Tourism Attraction</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.11</td>
<td>Community’s Opinions on Tourists’ Activities</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.12</td>
<td>Independent Sample t-test for what you think of tourists in public areas</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.13</td>
<td>Mean Comparison between Genders on Tourist Activities</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>Mean Comparison between Tourism and Non-tourism Related Jobs</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.15</td>
<td>Positive Statements in the Attitude Instrument</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.16</td>
<td>Negative Statements in the Attitude Instrument</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Country of Origin</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Demographic Characteristics of Respondents (N = 453)</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>Level of Education within Age Group (University Qualification)</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>Trip Characteristics of Respondents (N = 453)</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>How Tourists Learned about Cultural Heritage Sites</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>Interest in Cultural Heritage (N = 453)</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>Motivation to Travel and Visit to Destination</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>Tourist Specific Subject-of-Interest</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>Interest in Cultural Heritage between Gender</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.10</td>
<td>Interest in Cultural Heritage amongst Age Groups</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.11</td>
<td>Interest in Cultural Heritage amongst Different Education Background</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.12</td>
<td>Heritage Presentation (N = 453)</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.13</td>
<td>Reasons for Dissatisfaction with Tour Guide</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.14</td>
<td>Reasons for Not Engaging a Tour Guide</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.15</td>
<td>Reliability of Motivation Instrument</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.16</td>
<td>General Descriptions of Cultural Heritage Sites</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.17</td>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE
2.1 The Foreign Colonies in Malaysia 16
3.1 The Tourism Systems 39
3.2 A Classification of Travellers in the Tourism Industry 41
3.3 Butler’s Destination Life Cycle 43
3.4 Organisational Structure for the Ministry of Tourism 53
3.5 Organisational Structure for Tourism Malaysia 54
4.1 Model for Sustainable Development 76
4.2 Model for Sustainable Tourism Development 77
5.1 Factors behind the Growth of Heritage Tourism 92
6.1 Questionnaire Set - Local Community 130
6.2 Questionnaire Set – Tourist 133
6.3 Stages in Questionnaire Design 135
7.1 Tourism Related Jobs by Gender 148
7.2 Knowledge about Cultural Heritage 150
7.3 The Importance of Cultural Heritage to Community 152
7.4 Mean Comparison between Genders 158
7.5 Mean Comparison between Tourism and Non-tourism Related Jobs on Tourist Activity 159
7.6 Mean Comparison between Tourism and Non-tourism Related Jobs on Attitude towards Cultural Heritage Tourism 163
8.1 Total Number of Malaysian and Foreign Tourists 166
8.2 Total Number of International Tourists: ASEAN and Non-ASEAN 166
8.3 Level of Education within Age Group (University Qualification) 170
8.4 Annual Household Income of Malaysian Tourists in Ringgit Malaysia (RM) 171
8.5 Annual Household Income of International Tourists in Ringgit Malaysia (RM) 172
8.6 Purpose of Visit to Malaysia 174
8.7 Travel Arrangement 174
8.8 Interest in Cultural Heritage amongst Age Group 179
8.9 Interest in Cultural Heritage amongst tourists with different Educational Background 180
8.10 Distribution of the Total Score of Each Respondent on the 10 Statements 183
8.11 Mean Comparison between Malaysian Tourists with Children and Malaysian Tourists without Children
8.12 Mean Comparison between Malaysian Tourists with Basic Education and Malaysian Tourists with Higher Education
8.13 Mean Comparison between International Tourists with Basic Education and International Tourists with Higher Education
8.14 Mean Comparison between International Tourists with International Tourists without Interest in Cultural Heritage
9.1 Perceived Benefits by Local Communities
9.2 Perceived Costs by Local Communities
LIST OF PHOTOS

PHOTO

2.1 Stadhuys Building (1650) 19
2.2 Perak Museum (1886) 19
2.3 Sultan Abdul Samad Building (1897) 20
2.4 Kuala Lumpur Old Railway Station (1911) 20
2.5 Kerapu Bank (1912) 21
5.1 Wau (a large, flying kite) 112
5.2 Shadow Puppet Performances 112
5.3 Thaipusam 113
5.4 Chingay 113
5.5 Batik 114
5.6 Songket 114
6.1 Site 1 - A Famosa 142
6.2 Site 2 - Maritime Museum 143
6.3 Site 3 - Fort Cornwallis 143
6.4 Site 4 - Goddess of Mercy Temple 144
6.5 Site 5 - Melaka’s Sultanate Palace 144
6.6 Site 6 - Pasar Besar Siti Khadijah (an old historical market) 145

LIST OF MAPS

MAP

2.1 Southeast Asia 13
2.2 Malaysia 13
2.3 The Melaka Empire 15
2.4 The A Famosa 17
## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ASEAN</td>
<td>Association of South East Asia Nation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOD</td>
<td>Board of Directors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Cultural Heritage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHT</td>
<td>Cultural Heritage Tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MP</td>
<td>Malaysia Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOCAT</td>
<td>Ministry of Culture, Arts and Tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOT</td>
<td>Ministry of Tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOTC</td>
<td>Ministry of Tourism and Culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTPB</td>
<td>Malaysia Tourism Promotion Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDP</td>
<td>National Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEP</td>
<td>New Economic Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEPU</td>
<td>State Economic Planning Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RM</td>
<td>Ringgit Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TDCM</td>
<td>Tourism Development Corporation Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UMNO</td>
<td>United Malayan National Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nation for Education, Scientific and Cultural Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNWTO</td>
<td>United Nation World Tourism Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 1. Introduction

1.1 Introduction
This chapter provides a general introduction to this study. First, the chapter provides a brief background to the research problem. After explaining the aims and objectives of the study, it states the significance of the study and gives a summary of the research methodologies employed. Finally, the chapter briefly describes the various parts of the thesis, by providing short summaries of each chapter. This puts the overall discussion into perspective.

1.2 Overview
Tourism has become the world’s largest industry, contributing significantly to the world’s total gross national product. It is also the largest single employer, with an estimated number of 231 million people employed worldwide in 2007 (WTTC, 2008). Despite the world’s economic fluctuations and political instabilities, tourism enjoyed an average growth rate of 3.9% in 2007 and 3.0% in 2008 (WTTC, 2009). In addition, in 2008 international tourism arrivals reached 922 million, while receipts from foreign tourism reached US$8 trillion (ibid). While the total earnings from tourism are greater in industrialised countries, they also have contributed significantly towards the development processes of many developing nations in terms of foreign exchange earnings, provision of employment and infrastructure, as well as the ability to generate regional economic development (Rigg, 2003; Meethan, 2001; Ap et al., 1995; Inskeep, 1988; Krippendorf, 1987). Moreover, tourism earnings reduce levels of reliance on exports of traditional primary commodities, providing an opportunity for many developing countries to diversify their economic bases (Singh, 2003; McCool, 2001; Dann, 1999).

Although tourism has been perceived as the industry of the future, it faces many challenges as it enters the new century. These challenges include a greater commitment towards the communities that serve as hosts to the tourists (Tosun, 2003; Tosun and Timothy, 2003), increased respect for the places that accept and receive tourists (Meethan, 2001; Sharpley, 1994), and greater responsibilities towards the tourists themselves (Winter, 2008; Aas et al., 2005). The ultimate challenge is therefore in delivering tourism products that are appropriate to and compatible with both hosts and guests. In this sense, cultural heritage (CH) tourism is seen as capable of fulfilling such requirements.
The contents of the thesis is for internal user only
REFERENCES


__________(2000). In defence of (mass) tourism. In M. Robinson, J. Swarbrooke, N. Evans, P. Long and R. Sharpley (Eds.), *Environmental Management and Pathways to Sustainable Tourism* (pp. 269-284), Sunderland: Business Education Publisher.


237


