THE ROLE OF LEADERS IN FORMULATING IRAN'S NUCLEAR POLICY: FROM AHMADINEJAD TO ROUHANI

PUTRI SULISTYORINI

MASTER OF SCIENCE (STRATEGIC STUDIES)

UNIVERSITI UTARA MALAYSIA

2014

PERMISSION TO USE

In presenting this these in partial fulfillment of the requirements for a postgraduate degree from University Utara Malaysia, I agree that the university library may make it freely available for inspection. I further agree that permission for copying of this thesis in any manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purpose may be granted by my supervisor or, in their absence by the dean of Ghazali Shafie Graduate School of international studies. It's understood that any copying or publication or use of this thesis or parts thereof for financial gain shall be given to me and the University Utara Malaysia for any scholarly use which may be made of any material from my thesis.

Request for permission to copy or to make other use of materials in this thesis, in whole or in part should be addressed to

Dean of Ghazali Shafie Graduate School of International Studies

Collage of Law, Government, and International Studies

Universiti Utara Malaysia

06010 UUM Sintok

Kedah Darul Aman

Malaysia

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

First and foremost praise and gratitude to Allah SWT, the Almighty, for bestowing me with great strength, health, patience and courage in completing this project paper. My sincere gratitude and appreciation for my supervisor Dr. Sherko Kirmanj, the dedicated and aspiring mentor for the guidance and support from the initial to the final level enabled me to develop an understanding of the subject. This work is a result of my personal and longstanding interest in the field of defense and security studies. Therefore, I dedicated this work to my parents Pujo Sulistyono and Purba Diana Rini for your eternal loves, all in a bid to make who I am now. I love you.

ABSTRACT

This study is an initial attempt to investigate the role of Iran's leaders in the way of formulating nuclear policy. The Iranian role of leaderships reflected the nation's history as a revolutionary state, as an Islamic regime the policy result was also a product of revolutionary policies particularly on its nuclear. It can be seen that previous leaders have shaped nuclear policy in a different direction, reflect to their background and style of leadership. The thesis then examines about the nuclear policy under its different type of leadership, start from Mahmoud Ahmadinejad (2005) to Hassan Rouhani (2013). The thesis also identifies what is shifted of Iran nuclear policy under new leadership. Data for this study were collected through content analysis method and mainly will use data research about newspaper report, dialogue, talk and speeches from both Ahmadinejad and Rouhani and also government policy on the nuclear Iran issue to be analyzed. At the end, it was concluded that there are significant shifts towards Iran nuclear policy from confrontational to cooperative policy. These data also support the views that there are also major changes in the relationships of Iran with the other nuclear country, counted from Ahmadinejad era to Rouhani.

ABSTRAK

Kajian ini merupakan percubaan pertama untuk mengetahui peranan pemimpin Iran dalam mencipta polisi bagi program nukelar negaranya. Peranan kepimpinan Iran berkait rapat dengan sejarahnya yang merupakan sebuah negara yang telah melalui revolusi, dan juga identity sebagai negara Islam yang mana ia berkait terus kepada penciptaan polisi bagi program nuklear. Ini dapat dilihat kepada polisi-polisi nuklear yang berbeza bagi setiap pemimpin Iran yang berbeza latar belakang dan gaya kepimpinan. Kajian ini juga mengkaji perbezaan dalam polisi nuklear Iran iaitu bermula daripada Ahmadinejad (2005) sehingga Hassan Rouhani (2013). Kajian ini turut mengenal pasti apakah perubahan polisi nuklear di bawah kepemimpinan baru. Dapatan data untuk kajian ini diperolehi daripada kaedah analisis kandungan dan data yang diperolehi daripada laporan surat khabar, dialog, ceramah dan ucapan yang mana berkait dengan Ahmadinejad dan Rouhani, serta polisi nuklear kerajaan untuk dianalisis. Akhir sekali, kajian ini menyimpulkan bahawa terdapat perubahan penting dalam polisi nuklear Iran. Analisis juga menunjukkan bahawa hubungan Iran dengan negara nuklear lain turut berubah, diambil kira bermula pada kepimpinan Ahmadinejad sehingga Rouhani

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF ABREVIATIONS

EU   : European Union

IAEA   : International Atomic Energy Agency

JPA   : Join Plan Action

NPT   : Nuclear Proliferation Treaty

UK   : United Kingdom

UN   : United Nations

UNGA   : United Nations General Assembly

UNSC   : United Nations Security Council

US   : United States

WMD   : Weapons of Mass Destruction

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Overview

Nuclear weapon has been a major concern of international relations since 1945. The bombing of Hiroshima and Nagasaki in Japan by the United States (US), which signaled the end of the Second World War, spurred interest in nuclear weapons in the study of international relations. The vast nuclear arsenal of the US and Soviet Union were fundamental to the bipolar and strategic relationship that existed for more than forty years during the Cold War. While many analysts hoped that the collapse of the Soviet Union would lead to a reduction of its significance in international affairs, or will automatically be the end of the nuclear threat in the future (Holloway n.d: p.5-6). Other nuclear threats have emerged, with the emergence of India, Pakistan, and recently North Korea as nuclear powers. Other regional powers, including Iran, Iraq and Libya, are pursuing or have pursued nuclear capabilities. This invariably led to nuclear proliferation and made the control of nuclear weapons inevitable. The Nuclear Proliferation Treaty (NPT) which is an agreement for the wider prevention of nuclear weapons dissemination is made under the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA) (IAEA, 1970: p.1). A country like North Korea, which declared that it owns nuclear weapons, refused to sign the NPT. Then surprisingly, in March 2013, North Korea declared a "state of war" against South Korea, which propelled the US to take action against North Korea (Iqbal 2013: p.1). On the other hand, Iran willingly agreed to sign the 1968 NPT. This treaty is a three pillar system, focusing on non-proliferation,

The contents of the thesis is for internal user only

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Ahmadinejad, Mahmoud (2005) . Address by H.E. Dr. Mahmoud Ahmadinejad
President of the Islamic Republic of Iran before the Sixtieth Session of the United
Nations General Assembly [online] Retrieved from:
http://www.un.org/webcast/ga/60/statements/Iran050917eng.pdf

Ahmadinejad, Mahmoud (2007). Remarks at Columbia university [online] Retrieved
from: http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-
dyn/content/article/2007/09/24/AR2007092401042.html

Ahmadinejad, Mahmoud (2008). Statements by by H.E. Dr. Mahmoud Ahmadinejad
President of the Islamic Republic of Iran before the Sixty third Session of the
United Nations General Assembly [online] Retrieved from:
http://www.un.org/ga/63/generaldebate/pdf/Iran_en.pdf

Ahmadinejad, Mahmoud (2011). Address by H.E. Dr. Mahmoud Ahmadinejad
President of the Islamic Repu blic of Iran - the 66th Session of the United Nations
General Assembly [online] Retrieved from:
https://publicintelligence.net/mahmoud-ahmadinejad-speech-to-un-general-
assembly-transcript-september-22-2011/

Ahmadinejad, Mahmoud (2012). Address by H.E. Dr. Mahmoud Ahmadinejad
President of the Islamic Republic of Iran Before the 67th Session of the United
Nations General Assembly [online] Retrieved from:
http://gadebate.un.org/sites/default/files/gastatements/67/IR_en.pdf

Ali, A. (2008). Iran under ahmadinejad: populism and its malcontents. International
Affairs, 84 (4), pp. 683 - 700. [Accessed: 3 Jan 2014].

Amin, Musarat. Naseer, Rizwan & Ishtiaq, Tilak. (2011). Realism - Dominating Theory
in International Relations: An analysis 1 (7). [online] Retrieved from
http://www.berkeleyjournalofsocialsciences.com/July1.pdf

Amuzegar, J. (2006). Nuclear Iran: perils and prospects. Middle East Policy, XIII (2),
[Accessed: 3 Jan 2014].

Arikan, pinar. (2014). change in foreign policy of Iran under rouhani government reflections in domestic politics. [online] Retrieved from:http://www.orsam.org.tr/en/enUploads/Article/Files/2014320_orsambrief.pdf

Ataev, nodir. (2013). Economic sanctions and nuclear proliferation the case of Iran. [online] Retrieved from: www.etd.ceu.hu/2013/ataev_nodir.pdf

Bahgat, G. (2006). Nuclear proliferation: the Islamic republic of Iran. International studies perspectives, 7 pp. 124 - 136. [Accessed: 3 Jan 2014].

Balachandran, G & and Rajiv, S. Samuel C. (2013). IDSA Issue Brief Iran Nuclear Deal: The Fine Print [online] Retrieved from: http://idsa.in/system/files/IB_IranNuclearDeal.pdf

Barnes, Diane. (2014). Think Tank Calls for U.N. Funding Boost for Iran Nuclear Inspections [online] Retrieved from http://www.nti.org/gsn/article/group-seeks-funding-boost-nuclear-inspectors-Iran/

Barzegar, K. (2010). Balance of power in the persian gulf: an Iranian view. Middle east policy, XVII (3), [Accessed: 3 Jan 2014].

BBC. (2013). 'Iran president defends first 100 days performance in live interview', Vision of the Islamic Republic of Iran Network. Transcript available at BBC Monitoring (Political).

BPC. (2012). Iran's nuclear program; status breakout timing. [online] Retrieved from: http://bipartisanpolicy.org/sites/default/files/Iran%20Nuclear%20Program.pdf

Canberra Times. (2013). Netanyahu warns Iran's new leader not so moderate. [online] Retrieved from http://www.lexisnexis.com.eserv.uum.edu.my/lnacui2api/results/listview/delPrep.do?cisb=&risb=21_T19333088806&mode=delivery_DnldRender.

Carpenter, Ted Galen & Ashooh, Jessica. (2007). A View To A Coup. The National Interest, Washington D.C pp.62- 66.

Chapple, Irene. (2014). Hassan Rouhani: Iran will continue nuclear program for peaceful purposes. [online] Retrieved from: http://www.cnn.com/2014/01/23/world/europe/davos-rouhani-peaceful-nuclear-

Cogman, Susannah and Fletcher, Rod. (2013). Geneva agreement: Towards relaxation of US & EU sanctions on Iran [online] Retrieved from: http://www.moneylaunderingbulletin.com/sanctions/geneva-agreement—towards-relaxation-of-us-eu-sanctions-on-Iran-94557.htm

Cordesman, Anthony, Gold Bryan &Schulte, Chloe Coughlin. (2014). [online] Retrieved from https://csis.org/files/publication/131216_Iran_Gulf_Sanctions.pdf

Cordesman, Anthony H., and Adam C. Seitz.(2009). Iranian Weapons of Mass Destruction. Santa Barbara, California: Praeger Security International, 2009. Print.

David Ariosto, C. (2014). Ahmadinejad tells u.n. that Iran is threatened. [online] Retrieved from: http://www.cnn.com/2012/09/26/world/new-york-unga/ [Accessed: 3 Jan 2014].

Doddson,Michael & Doraj, Manochehr. (2008). Neo-populism in Venezuela and Iran: a Comparative Assessment. [online] Retrieved from http://svs.osu.edu/documents/MichaelDodsonyManochehrDorraj-NEOPOPULISMINVENEZUELAANDIRAN.pdf

Dueck, T. (2005).Iran's nuclear challenge.Political science quarterly,, 122 (2), pp. 189 - 205. [Accessed: 3 Jan 2014].

Davenport, kelsey. (2012). UN Security Council Resolutions on Iran. [online] Retrieved from: http://www.armscontrol.org/factsheets/Security-Council-Resolutions-on-Iran

Entessar, N. (2009). Iran's nuclear decision-making calculus.Middle east policy, XVI (2), [Accessed: 3 Jan 2014].

Eichler, leah. (2010). What will Iran do with nuclear weapons? [online] Retrieved from: http://blogs.reuters.com/gregg-easterbrook/2010/04/22/what-will-Iran-do-with-nuclear-weapons-probably-nothing/

Fassihi, Farnaz. (2013). Iran Shifts Responsibility for Nuclear Talks. [online] Retrieved from http://online.wsj.com/news/articles/SB10001424127887323893004579057231496060624

Fisher, max. (2013). How do Iran's Supreme Leader and president split power? Here's a chart explaining it.[online] Retrieved from: http://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/worldviews/wp/2013/06/14/how-do-Irans-supreme-leader-and-president-split-power-heres-a-chart-explaining-it/

FoxNews. (2014). Rouhani: World powers 'surrendered' to Iran with nuclear deal. [online] Retrieved from: http://www.foxnews.com/politics/2014/01/14/rouhani-world-powers-surrendered-to-Iran-with-nuclear-deal/

Golshanpazhooh, Mahmoud Reza. (2013). 12 Positive Outcomes Of Geneva Nuclear Deal From Iran. [online] Retrieved from: http://www.Iranreview.org/content/Documents/12-Positive-Outcomes-of-Geneva-Nuclear-Deal-for-Iran.htm

Graham, Cheryl M. (2011). To Deter or Not to Deter, Applying Historical Lessons To The Iranian Nuclear Challenge. [online] Retrieved from: http://timemilitary.files.wordpress.com/2011/09/graham.pdf

Haaretz.com. (2014).The full text of Iranian president hassanrohani's address to the unga - diplomacy and defense. [online] Retrieved from: http://www.haaretz.com/news/diplomacy-defense/1.548913 [Accessed: 3 Jan 2014].

Hashemi, Nader. (2009). Islam, Secularism and Liberal Democracy; Toward a Democratic Theory For Muslim Socities. [online] Retrieved from: http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1949-3606.2012.00159.x/abstract

Heradstevit, Daniel & Bonham, Mathew. (2005). What the Axis of Evil Metaphor Did to Iran. [online] Retrieved from: http://faculty.maxwell.syr.edu/gmbonham/Iran.pdf

Holloway, David. (1962). Nuclear weapon and the escalation of the cold war. [online] Retrieved from: http://www.isodarco.it/courses/andalo09/doc/holloway_reading-CHCW.pdf

Holstein, Alexander. (2013). Iranian nuclear weapons program. [online] Retrieved from: http://www.macdonaldlaurier.ca/files/pdf/Straight-Talk-on-Iran-Holstein-Jones.pdf

IAEA. (2011) . Implementation of the NPT Safeguards Agreement and relevant provisions of Security Council resolutions in the Islamic Republic of Iran, [online] Retrieved from: http://www.iaea.org/Publications/Documents/Board/2011/gov2011-65.pdfz

IAEA. (1970). Treaty On The Non Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons. [online] Retrieved from http://www.iaea.org/Publications/Documents/Infcircs/Others/infcirc140.pdf

Iqbal, Muhammad. (2013). North Korea declares 'state of war' with South [online] Retrieved from http://www.brecorder.com/top-news/108-pakistan-top-news/112987-north-korea-declares-state-of-war-with-south.pdf

ICG. (2013).International crisis group; policy briefing.[online] Retrieved from: http://www.crisisgroup.org/~/media/Files/Middle%20East%20North%20Africa/Iran%20Gulf/Iran/b036-great-expectations-Irans-new-president-and-the-nuclear-talks.pdf

Jonathan Brewer, W. Q. B. (2011). Iran's nuclear challenge: nine years and counting.International affairs, 87 (4), pp. 923 - 943. [Accessed: 3 Jan 2014].

Joshi, Shashank & Stephens, Michael. (2013). An uncertain future regional responsesto Iran's nuclear program [online] Retrieved from: https://www.rusi.org/downloads/assets/WHR-4-13.pdf

JPA. (2013).Join Action of Plan [online] Retrieved from: http://eeas.europa.eu/statements/docs/2013/131124_03_en.pdf

Kane, chane. (2006). Nuclear Decision-Making in Iran: A Rare Glimpse [online] Retrieved from: http://www.brandeis.edu/crown/publications/meb/MEB5.pdf

Katzamn, K.(2013). Iran sanctions; Crs report for congress, congressional research service. [online] Retrieved from: http://www.fas.org/sgp/crs/mideast/RS20871.pdf

Kessler, Glenn. (2013). Did Iran's Supreme Leader issue a fatwa against the development of nuclear weapons?. [online] Retrieved from: http://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/fact-checker/wp/2013/11/27/did-Irans-supreme-leader-issue-a-fatwa-against-the-development-of-nuclear-weapons/

Maaike, Warnaar. (2013). Iran Foreign Policy During Ahmadinejad: Ideology and Actions. Palgrave Macmilan, New York.

McNamara, Robert S. (1962)."speech delivered at commencement exercise university of Michigan, Ann Arbor, as published in The Use of Force (Second Edition), Robert J. Art and Kenneth N. Waltz, eds. (Lanham , MD: University press of America: 1983), p. 149.

Menashri, D. (2013). Hassan rouhani :Iran new hope for change. Strategic Assessment, 16 (2), [Accessed: 3 Jan 2014].

Nye, Joseph S. Nuclear Ethics. London: Collier Macmillan Publishers, 1986.

Ouahes, Idir & Smith, Ben. (2013). The Deal With Iran. House of Commons Library[online] Retrieved from :http://www.parliament.uk/Templates/BriefingPapers/Pages/BPPdfDownload.aspx

?bp-id=sn06780

Paul, K Kerr. (2012). Iran's nuclear program status [online] Retrieved from: http://www.fas.org/sgp/crs/nuke/RL34544.pdf

Ramusino, paolo cotta. (2012). The Iranian nuclear controversy : escaping the winds of war. [online] Retrieved from:http://www.pugwash.org/reports/nw/Iranian_Nuclear_Controversy/Iran_PC R_Feb2012_fin.pdf

Rosenberg, Joel. (2009). Inside the Revolution: How the Followers of Jihad, Jefferson & Jesus Are Battling to Dominate the Middle East and Transform the World. Carol Stream, Illinois: Tyndale House Publishers, Inc., Print.

Rouhani, Hassan. (2013). Statement by H. E. Dr. Hassan Rouhani President of the Islamic Republic of Iran at the Sixty-eight Session of the United Nations General Assembly [online] Retrieved from: http://gadebate.un.org/sites/default/files/gastatements/68/IR_en.pdf

Rouhani, Hassan. (2013). Full transcript of Ann Curry's interview with Hassan Rouhani [online] Retrieved from: http://www.nbcnews.com/id/53069733/ns/world_news-mideast_n_africa/t/full-transcript-ann-currys-interview-iranian-president-hassan-rouhani/#.U42xxnKSzak

Rouhani, Hassan. (2014). Attendance at the conference on Interaction and Confidence Building Measures in Asia (CICA) [online] Retrieved from: http://www.president.ir/en/77677

Rouhani, Hassan. (2014). Hassan Rouhani: Iran will continue nuclear program for peaceful purposes [online] Retrieved from: http://www.cnn.com/2014/01/23/world/europe/davos-rouhani-peaceful-nuclear-program/

Rizvi, M mahtab alam. (2014). Iran under Rouhani: From Confrontation to Reconciliation. [online] Retrieved from: http://idsa.in/system/files/IB_IranRouhani.pdf

Sadjadpour, Karim. (2009). Reading khamenei; the world view of iran's most powerful leader – karim sadjadpour. [online] Retrieved from: http://carnegieendowment.org/files/sadjadpour_iran_final2.pdf

Sagan, Scott D and Kenneth N. Waltz.The Spread of Nuclear Weapons: A Debate
    Renewed. London: W.W. Norton and Company, 2002.

Samore, Gary. (2006). Meeting Iran nuclear challenge, 21(1 – 4). [online] Retrieved
    from : http://www.un.org/disarmament/education/wmdcommission/files/No21.pdf

Sahimi, Muhammad. (2010). Can iran expand its nuclear program rapidly?. [online]
    Retrieved from: http://original.antiwar.com/sahimi/2010/02/10/can-iran-expand-its-
    nuclear-program-rapidly/

Sherrill, Clifton W. (2012). Why iran wants the bomb and what it means for US policy
    [online] Retrieved: http://cns.miis.edu/npr/pdfs/npr_19-1_sherrill_iran_bomb.pdf

Smith,Ben. (2012). is Iran developing a nuclear weapon ?[online] Retrieved from:
    http://www.parliament.uk/Templates/BriefingPapers/Pages/BPPdfDownload.aspx
    ?bp-id=SN06222

Salehzadeh, alan. (2013). Iran's domestic and foreign policies.[online] Retrieved from:
    https://www.doria.fi/bitstream/handle/10024/92615/Alan%20Salehzadeh%20-
    %20Iran%20%28verkko%29.pdf

Scotten, Ali G. (2013). The Power of an Iranian President. [online] Retrieved
    from:http://nationalinterest.org/commentary/the-power-Iranian-president-8593

TheGuardian. (2013). Iran after ahmadinejad: rising inequality and crippling sanctions.
    [online] Retrieved from: http://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/jun/18/Iran-
    mahmoud-ahmadinejad-inequality-sanctions

TheTelegraph. (2009). Mahmoud Ahmadinejad to be sworn in for second term in Iran.
    [online] Retrieved from:
     (http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/middleeast/Iran/5963749/Mahmoud-
    Ahmadinejad-to-be-sworn-in-for-second-term-in-Iran.html

The Huffington Post. (2014). Ahmadinejad: Iran under threat from 'uncivilized zionists'.
    [online] Retrieved from: http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2012/09/26/ahmadinejad-
    speech-un_n_1916347.html [Accessed: 3 Jan 2014].

Twitter.com. (2014).Twitter / hassanrouhani: full text of #rouhanispeech [online]
    Retrieved from: https://twitter.com/HassanRouhani/status/382629473448783872
    [Accessed: 3 Jan 2014].

UnitedagainstnuclearIran.com. (2014).Rouhani's record in office | uani. [online]
      Retrieved from: http://www.unitedagainstnuclearIran.com/rouhani/record
      [Accessed: 3 Jan 2014].

Yousefi, A. (2010). Iran's foreign policy during ahmadinejad: from confrontation to
      accommodation. Annual conference of the canadian political science association,
      Concordia University, Montreal, Canada [Accessed: 3 Jan 2014].

Waltz, Kenneth. (2012). Why Iran should Get the Bomb. [online] Retrieved from
      http://sistemas.mre.gov.br/kitweb/datafiles/IRBr/pt-
      br/file/CAD/LXII%20CAD/Pol%C3%ADtica/Why%20Iran%20Should%20Get%2
      0the%20Bomb.pdf

Zadeh,Ismael Hossein. (2013). Reflection On The Iran Nuclear Deal. [online] Retrieved
      from : http://www.politicaleconomics.info/docs/Reflections-on-the-Iran-Nuclear-
      Deal.pdf