

ASSESSMENT OF MIDDLE-CLASS LIBYANS ON THE
QUALITY OF GOOD GOVERNANCE

By

IBRAHIM NOUREDDIN KAMBA

Thesis Submitted to Ghazali Shafie Graduate School of Government
Universiti Utara Malaysia
In Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
2014

PERMISSION TO USE

In presenting this thesis in fulfillment of the requirements for a postgraduate degree from Universiti Utara Malaysia, I agree that the University Library may make it freely available for inspection. I further agree that permission for copying of this thesis in any manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purposes, may be granted by my supervisor(s) or, in their absence, by the Dean of Ghazali Shafie Graduate School of Government. It is understood that any copying, publication or use of this thesis or parts thereof for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission. It is also understood that due recognition shall be given to me and to Universiti Utara Malaysia for any scholarly use which may be made of any material from my thesis.

Request for permission to copy, make other use of materials in this thesis, in whole, or in part, should be addressed to:

Dean

Ghazali Shafie Graduate School of Government

Universiti Utara Malaysia

06010 Sintok

Kedah, Malaysia

Abstract

The purpose of this study to assess the level of Good Governance Indicators (Political stability, government effectiveness, and control of corruption) in Libya, to analyze the differences between perception's of each of (Job Categories, Job Positions, and Job Experience) of Middle-Class Libyans on these Indicators in Libya, and to recommend some improvements of Good Governance in Libya. Numerous hypotheses and questions were adopted for achieving to the study objectives. Survey instrument were distributed to the respondents (N = 400) comprising of Middle-Class in the governmental sector, private sector, civil society, and academics. Data analysis started with evaluating data reliability, and ANOVA test to assess the hypotheses. For the assessment the Good Governance level, the respondent's answers on the questions of each of Good Governance Indicators which assessed by the mean for aiming to reach to assessment the level of Good Governance in Libya. Besides used the interviews with some of who are responsible in the Libyan government, private sector, and civil society for getting their perceptions about Good Governance situation in Libya. World Bank reports about Good Governance in Libya during (1996-2010) also used for supporting the findings which obtained by the survey and the interviews. However, the study found that, there is agreement on the weakness of Good Governance of adopted indicators of this study in Libya, and there are some differences in the perceptions of respondents about the application of indicators of Good Governance in Libya. Finally, several recommendations and implications were drawn from the study.

Keywords; Good Governance, Political Stability, Government Effectiveness, Control of Corruption, and Libya.

Abstrak

Kajian ini bertujuan untuk menilai tahap pelaksanaan indikator-indikator tadbir urus yang baik (*Good Governance*) di Libya. Juga menentukan perbezaan pandangan berasaskan kategori pekerjaan, jawatan dan pengalaman kerja responden mengenai indikator tadbir urus yang baik serta mencadangkan beberapa penambahbaikan terhadap tadbir urus tersebut di Libya. Sejumlah hipotesis dan soalan kajian telah pun digunakan untuk mencapai objektif kajian. Instrumen kajian telah diedarkan kepada 400 responden yang terdiri daripada para pekerja dalam sektor kerajaan, swasta, masyarakat sivil dan ahli akademik. Ujian kebolehpercayaan telah digunakan terlebih dahulu untuk menilai instrumen dan data yang dikumpulkan sebelum ujian ANOVA dilakukan untuk menilai hipotesis. Bagi penilaian tahap pelaksanaan indikator tadbir urus, jawapan responden dinilai menerusi nilai yang minimum. Selain pengumpulan data menerusi tinjauan, kajian ini juga menggunakan kaedah temubual dengan beberapa pihak yang dinilai layak mewakili badan kerajaan, sektor swasta dan masyarakat sivil untuk menguatkan dan menyokong data tinjauan mengenai pelaksanaan *Good Governance* di Libya. Selain itu, laporan Bank Dunia mengenai *Good Governance* di Libya (1996-2010) juga digunakan sebagai asas dalam perbincangan mengenai dapatan kajian. Hasil kajian mendapati bahawa majoriti responden bersetuju bahawa terdapat beberapa kelemahan tadbir urus yang baik di Libya. Walau bagaimanapun, hasil kajian mendapati wujudnya perbezaan pandangan antara responden mengenai pelaksanaan atau penerapan indikator-indikator tadbir urus yang baik di Libya. Pada bahagian akhir, tesis ini telah mengemukakan beberapa cadangan dan implikasi kajian yang patut diambil kira oleh semua pihak dalam hal tadbir urus yang baik di Libya.

Kata kunci: Pentadbiran yang baik, Kestabilan politik, Keberkesanan kerajaan, Kawalan rasuah, dan Libya.

Acknowledgements

I am grateful to the Almighty Allah for giving me the opportunity to complete my PhD thesis. May peace and blessing of Allah be upon His beloved Prophet Muhammad (SAW), his family, and his companions.

In completing this thesis, I would like to express my appreciation to my supervisors, Associate Professor Dr. Mohd Fua'd Sukdan, and Associate Professor Dr. Halim Abd Allah for all their help and guidance without which this dissertation would never have come to fruition. Many thanks for their supervision not only in this thesis but also in guiding me on how to become a good academician as well as building my interest in the field of research. Also thanks for being a good mentor and research partner to me and I did learn a lot from them.

I would also like to convey my great thanks to Associate Professor Dr. Ahamed Mortadah, Dr. Mohamed Subhan, and Dr. Ahmed Sunosi for the friendship and assistance provided.

Last but not least, to my family (my wife Rabiea, my daughter Shayma, my sons Mohamed, and Al-Mu'tasim-Billah), my parents, my brothers and my sisters, I thank you so much for continuously giving me the undivided support and dua'a. To all of you, I have this to say: I love you, respect you, pray for you, and May Allah bless you.

Ibrahim Nouredin Kamba
Sintok, Kedah, Malaysia
University Utara Malaysia

Table of Contents

Section Number	Section Title	Page Number
	Title Page.....	i
	Certification of Thesis	ii
	Permission to Use.....	iv
	Abstract.....	v
	Abstrak.....	vi
	Acknowledgements.....	vii
	Table of Contents:	viii
	List of Tables.....	xii
	List of Figures.....	xv
	List of Abbreviations.....	xvi
Chapter One	Background of the Study	
1.1	Introduction.	1
1.2	Problem Statement.	9
1.3	Research Questions	18
1.4	Research Objectives.....	19
1.5	Research Significance.	20
1.6	Conceptual Definition.....	21
1.7	Operational Definition.....	22
1.8	Research Conceptual Framework.....	24
1.9	Research Hypotheses.	25
1.10	Scope of Research.....	26
1.11	Limitation of the Study.....	29
Chapter Two	Libya Modern History	

2.1	Introduction.	31
2.2	King Idris Period (1951 to 1969).....	32
2.3	Qaddafi Period (1969 to 2011).....	33
2.4	Post Qaddafi Period (2011 to present).....	43
Chapter Three	Literature Review	
3.1	Introduction.	46
3.2	Definition of Governance.....	46
3.3	Definition of Good Governance.	48
3.4	The need of Good Governance.....	52
3.5	Good Governance structures.....	61
3.6	Good Governance indicators	65
3.6.1	Political Stability.	65
3.6.2	Government Effectiveness.	69
3.6.3	Control of Corruption.	73
3.7	Islamic Perspective for Good Governance.	81
3.8	Chapter Summary.	92
Chapter Four	Research Methodology	
4.1	Introduction.	93
4.2	Research Design.	93
4.3	Population and Sampling.....	95
4.3.1	Population.	95
4.3.2	Sampling.	95
4.4	Methods of Data Collection.	98
4.5	Structure of the Questionnaire.....	99
4.6	Pilot Study.	102
4.7	Data Analysis.....	103
4.8	Statistical Analysis.....	104
4.8.1	Descriptive Data Analysis.....	104

4.8.2	Hypotheses Testing.....	105
4.9	Reliability Testing.....	105
Chapter Five	Descriptive Data of Analysis	
5.1	Introduction.	107
5.2	Described the Response Rate from Respondents.....	107
5.2.1	Response Rate from the Questionnaire.....	107
5.2.2	Categories of Institutions of Respondents.....	108
5.2.3	Respondent's Positions in the Institutions.	110
5.2.4	Job Experience of Respondents.....	110
5.3	Descriptive Data Analysis for Answering the Questions of the Study.....	111
5.3.1	The Answer of the First Question on the Political Stability.....	111
5.3.2	The Answer of the Second Question on Government Effectiveness.....	117
5.3.3	The Answer of the Third Question on Corruption Control.....	121
5.4	Chapter Summary.	135
Chapter Six	Data Analysis	
6.1	Introduction	136
6.2	First Hypothesis ($H_{1,1}$) Testing.....	136
6.3	Second Hypothesis ($H_{1,2}$) Testing.....	146
6.4	Third Hypothesis ($H_{1,3}$) Testing.....	153
6.5	Summary of hypotheses Testing.	160
6.6	Chapter Summary.	161
Chapter Seven	Discussion	
7.1	Introduction.	162
7.2	Discussion of the Results of Hypotheses Analyses.	162
7.2.1	First Research Hypothesis ($H_{1,1}$).....	162
7.2.2	Second Research Hypothesis ($H_{1,2}$).....	164

7.2.3	Third Research Hypothesis (H _{1.3}).....	167
7.3	Chapter Summary.	174
Chapter Eight	Implications, Recommendations, and Future Research	
8.1	Introduction	175
8.2	Implications of the Research.....	175
8.3	Recommendations.	182
8.4	Future researches.....	187
8.5	Chapter Summary.	188
	References.	189
Appendix 1	List of The Interviews.	
Appendix 2	Questionnaire of Research.	

List of Tables

Table Number	Table Title	Page Number
1.1	Structure of the Libyan government from 1977 to 2011.....	10
1.2	The instability in the division of the administrative apparatus of the Libya (1951 to 2005).....	11
1.3	Libya's rank in the Quality of Life Index for selected years.	13
1.4	The rank of Political Stability, Government Effectiveness, and Control of Corruption indicators as conceived by the Middle-Class Libyans in Libya 2010.....	16
1.5	Conceptual definitions of independent variables and dependent variable of study.....	21
1.6	Operational Definitions of Independent Variables and Dependent Variable of Study....	22
2.1	Political Stability for Libya 1996-2010.....	39
2.2	Effectiveness of Libyan Governments 1996-2010.....	40
2.3	Corruption Control of Libya 1996-2010.....	42
3.1	Definitions of Governance.....	48
3.2	Definitions of Good Governance.....	52
3.3	Difference between the good governance and bad governance.....	56
3.4	Good Governance Indicators as adopted by some of International Organizations.....	63
4.1	The meaning of mean score of each item of good governance.....	104
4.2	Reliability Analysis for each variable.....	105
5.1	Response Rate of the questionnaires.....	108
5.2	Categories of institutions of respondents.....	109
5.3	Respondent's positions in the institutions.....	110
5.4	Frequency distribution analysis of job Experience of respondent.....	111
5.5	Descriptive Statistics for respondent's perception on Political Stability.....	114
5.6	Descriptive statistics for respondent's perception about the causes that led to	116

	does not exploit the political stability in the implementation of development programs.....	
5.7	Descriptive statistics for respondent's perceptions on Government Effectiveness.....	120
5.8	Descriptive statistics for respondent's perceptions on Control of Corruption.....	123
5.9	Descriptive statistics which explained the respondent's perceptions on the factors that led to spread in the corruption in Libya.....	127
5.10	Descriptive statistics which explained the respondent's perceptions on kinds of corruption in Libya.....	129
5.11	Descriptive statistics of respondent's perceptions on the requirements needed by the government to combat corruption.....	134
6.1	ANOVA test of difference in Job Category mean perception's scores towards Political Stability in Libya	137
6.2	Post-hoc Tests of Political Stability	138
6.3	ANOVA test of difference in Job position mean perception's scores towards Political Stability	139
6.4	ANOVA test of difference in job experience mean perception's scores towards Political Stability.....	140
6.5	ANOVA test of difference in Job Category mean perception's scores towards Government Effectiveness.....	146
6.6	ANOVA test of difference in Job position mean perception's scores towards Government Effectiveness	147
6.7	ANOVA test of difference in job experience mean perception's scores towards Government Effectiveness.....	148
6.8	Respondents' perception about the quality public services in Libya.....	149
6.9	ANOVA test of difference in Job Category mean perception's scores towards Control of Corruption.....	153
6.10	ANOVA test of difference in Job position mean perception's scores towards	154

	Control of Corruption.....	
6.11	ANOVA test of difference in job experience mean perception's scores towards Control of Corruption.....	155
6.12	The results of hypotheses analysis.....	159
7.1	Libya's rank in Transparency International Corruption Perception Index (2003-2010).....	167
7.2	Comparison of Democracy, Corruption and Press freedom between Libya, Tunisia and Egypt during selected years.....	170
7.3	Libya's rank of Quality of Life Index for selected years.....	172
8.1	Difference between perception's mean of Job Categories on Good Governance Indicators in Libya.....	178
8.2	Difference between perception's mean of Job Position on Good Governance Indicators in Libya.....	179
8.3	Difference between perception's mean of Job Experience on Good Government Indicators in Libya.....	180

List of Figures:

Figure Number	Figure Title	Page Number
1.1	Research Conceptual of Framework.....	24
4.1	Qualitative methods are used to help explain quantitative finding.....	103
8.1	The rank of Good Governance Indicators in Libya 2010.....	178

List of Abbreviations

ADB	Asian Development Bank.
CPI	Corruption Perceptions Index.
CPP	Council of Public Planning.
GG	Good Governance.
IMF	International Monetary Fund.
MENA	Middle East and North Africa.
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals.
OECD	Organization for Economic and Cooperative Development.
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme.
UNESCAP	United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and Pacific.
WB	World Bank.

Chapter One

Background of Study

1.1 Introduction

The discourse on good governance is not contemporary; it is as old as humanity itself. The application of good governance indicators in administration of human society is the foundation of civilization. The civilizations that have thrived are based on solid governance foundations. The representation of societal organization and administration bases in fundamentals of good governance had been the bastion of progress of many civilizations in the ancient times. These successful ancient civilizations were a result of the efforts by too many of individuals who have had a role in the construction of these civilizations through their ideas and aimed at construction of successful communities. For example, the ancient Chinese civilization built on the ideas of the philosopher Confucius, who urges rulers and people to work on the construction of a perfect state (Legge, 2002). His advices were the foundation on which the Chinese civilization was anchored. Drawing from Confucius's teachings is one of the fundamentals that any ruler should follow. Confucius was quoted to have said that:

In leading a state of thousand chariots, respect the office and trustworthy, economise in the use of resources and love the people, and employ the people when it is timely (Confucius, 551BC- 479BC) Legge, (2002).

In the period spanning 1792 BC to 1750 BC, the great Hammurabi also formulated a number of laws called the laws of Hammurabi. These laws were aimed at

The contents of
the thesis is for
internal user
only

References

Holy Quran.

Abdelfattah E. (2007). *Introduction to descriptive and inferential statistics using SPSS*, Publishe Khawarizm Academic, 541.

Abdellatif, A.M. (2003). *Good governance and its relationship to democracy and economic development*, paper presented to the Global Forum III on Fighting Corruption and Safeguarding Integrity in Seoul, 20-31 May.

Abu sninah, M. A. (1992). *Libyan Industrial exports and the possibilities available and the obstructing the factors of its development (the study of the industrial sector 1970-1989)*. Journal of economic research, 4, Issue spring 1992, (P.5-6).

Abugazala, M. (n. d.) *Good governance bases in Koran*. Accessed from, <http://www.theacademysite.com/vb/showthread.php?t=4178>.

Adriana, A., et al. (2008). *Governance in the Middle East, North Africa and western Balkan: challenges and priorities in reforming public administration in the Mediterranean region*, United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA), New York.

Agere, S. (2000). *Promoting Good Governance: Principles, Practices and Perspectives (Managing the Public Service: Strategies for Improvement Series)*. Commonwealth Secretariat; 11.

Ahmed, M. M. (2007). *Good Governance needed for Sustainable Development*. Accessed from; www.ittefaq.com.

Ake, C. (1975). *A definition of Political Stability*. Journal of Comparative Politics. 7(2), (pp. 271-283).

Al Haddad, A. (2009). *Corruption and Sustainable Development. Analytical Vision of the Reality of the Phenomenon in Libya*. Accessed February 2, 2009, from <http://www.libyaalyoum.com/news/index.php?id=21&textid=3378> &(p.7).

Al Hussein, A. (206–261 AH/ 821-875 CE). *Sahih Muslim*. Retrieved Nov 14th, 2010, from www.al-islam.com

Al Tirmidhi, M. (209–279 AH/ 824–892CE). *Sunan al-Tirmidhi*. Retrieved from www.al-islam.com on

Al. Haddad, A. (2009). Sustainable development and Corruption an analytical view of the phenomena in Libya.

- Al-Ahsav, A., & Stephen, B. Young. (2008). *Guidance for Good Governance, Exploration in Qur'anic scientific and cross-cultural Approaches*. Jointly published by (uni IIUM) and Caux Round Table.
- Al-badri, A. (2009). *Islam between the scholars and rulers*. Al Madinah Al Munawarah. Academic library for publishing.
- Al-Baghdadi, A. M. (1989.) Abu al-Hasan Ali Ibn Muhammad Ibn Habib al-Mawardi (972-1058 CE). *Al-Ahkam al-Sultania w'al-Wilayat al-Diniyya (The Ordinances of Government)*. Dar Ibn Qutaybah, Kuwait.
- Anowar Uddin, S. M. (2008). *Does the good governance impact on the local development in Bangladesh?* Roskilde University, Denmark press.
- Argyriades, D. (2006). *Good Governance, Professionalism, Ethics and Responsibility*. International Review of Administrative Sciences, 72(2), (pp. 155-170).
- Asian Development Bank (ADB). (1995). *Governance: Sound Development Management*. Manila, Philippines. Accessed from; www.adb.org/documents/policies/governance/govpolicy.pdf Similar.
- Azmat F., and Coghill, K. (2005). *Good governance and marker-based reforms: study of Bangladesh*, International Review of Administrative Sciences. 71(4), (pp. 625-638).
- Besancon, M. (2003). *Good Governance Rankings: The Art of Measurement*, world Peace Foundation(WPF), program on intrastate conflict and conflict resolution, John F. Kennedy School of government, Harvard University Cambridge, Massachusetts,
- Betamer, A. (2003). *The efficiency of administrative leadership of the fundamental requirements for improving the quality of the public sector in Libya*. Conference of The public administration in Libya: actually and ambitions Tripoli, Economic Sciences Research Center, October 11-12. 2003.
- Blanchard, C. M. (2012). *Libya: Transition and U.S. Policy. Specialist in Middle Eastern Affairs*. Congressional Research Service. Revealed from; www.crs.gov
- Bouckaert, G. & S, Van.de. Walle. (2001). *Government Performance and Trust in Government*. Paper for the Permanent Study Group of Productivity and Quality in the Public Sector at the EGPA Annual Conference, Vaasa, Finland, September 5-8.
- Bouckaert, G., & Steven, Van. S. (2003). *Comparing measures of citizen trust and user satisfaction as indicators of 'good governance': Difficulties in linking trust and*

- satisfaction indicators, In: International Review of Administrative Sciences, 69(3), (pp. 329-344).
- Bovaird, T., & Löffler, E. (2003). *Public Management and Governance*. Routledge, 3th edition.
- Bradburn, et al. (2004). *Asking questions* (2nd edition.). San Francisco: Jossey Bass.
- Bradburn, N., Sudman, S., & Wansink, B. (2004). *Asking Questions: the Definitive Guide to Questionnaire Design*. San Francisco: Jossey - Bass. USA.
- Brewer, G. A., et al. (2007). *Accountability, corruption and government Effectiveness in Asia: an exploration of world bank governance Indicators*. International Public Management Review. Electronic Journal at <http://www.ipmr.net> 18(2).
- Brinkerhoff, Derick. W., & Arthur, A. Goldsmith. (2005). *Institutional Dualism and International Development: A Revisionist Interpretation of Good Governance.* Administration & Society, 37, (pp.199–224).
- Camdessus, M. (1997). *Good Governance. The IMF's Role*. International Monetary Fund (IMF), Washington, D.C. accessed from; <http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/exrp/govern/govindex.htm>
- Chapman, R.A. (2000). *Ethics in Public Service for the New Millennium*. Publisher; Ashgate.
- Cheema, G.S. (2005). *Building democratic institutions: governance reform in developing countries* New York, Kumarian Press Inc.,
- Chêne, M. (2008). *Overview of corruption in Pakistan*. Accessed from, http://www.u4.no/publications/PublicationSphinxSearchForm?PublicationSearch=Overview+of+corruption+in+Pakistan&Category=&ThemeID=&Year=&Country=&locale=en_US.
- Chenhall, R. H., & Langfield Smith, K. (2003). *Performance measurement and reward systems, trust, and strategic change*. Journal of Management Accounting Research. 15, (pp. 117-143).
- Chigbu, U, E. (2011). *On Grooming Good Governance in Africa: A Scrutiny on Good Governance in the African Family*. Contemporary Journal of African Society, 1(1), (pp. 114-133).
- Chowdhury, S. (2004). *The effect of Democracy and Press Freedom on Corruption: an empirical test*, Economic Letters, 85, (pp. 93-101).
- Code of Hammurabi., 1750 BC, translated by Sars, O. (1993). Dar Aladdin for Publishing, 2nd edition, Damascus.

- Committee on Good Governance. (2008). *Good governance, Definition and Implications*. Yobe Economic summit, Denature, July 7th 2008.
- Cornelias, N. (2005). *Good Governance- Participatory Development and Poverty Reduction: an Appraisal of the NGO Bill in Zimbabwe*, A Dissertation submitted to the University of Birmingham.
- Council of public planning in Libya (CPP) (2004). *The Horizon of Development and Administrative Developing in Libya*, report. Accessed from <http://www.npc.gov.ly>
- Dansereau, P. T. (2006). *Tribal Influence on Middle East Political Stability: is there a relationship?* AIR University Press.
- David, J. Gould., & Jose, A. Amaro-Reyes. (1983). *The Effects of Corruption on Administrative Performance Illustrations from Developing Countries*, The World Bank Washington, D.C., U.S.A, (pp, 26-28).
- Departments of Research and Studies of Organization for Transparency Libya. (2006). *Analysis of the Results of a Questionnaire on Corruption in the Regime's Apparatus, State Institutions, and People's Organizations in Libya*. Revealed from www.transparency-libya.com
- Domoro, O. & Agil, S. (2012). *Ethics and Corruption Empirical study in the Libyan Police Force*. Australian Journal of Basic and Applied Sciences, 6(6): 353-357, 2012 ISSN 1991-8178
- Dotseng (2009). *Why good governance? May not be always good governance*. Accessed 2009/03/27/ from, <http://dotseng.wordpress.com/why-good-governance-may-not-be-always-good-governance>.
- Edwards, J. E., & Thomas, M. D. (1993). *The organizational survey process general steps and practical consideration*. The American Behavioral Scientist Review, 36(4), (pp, 419-442).
- El-Katiri, M. (2012). *State-Building Challenges in a Post-Revolution Libya*. The Strategic Studies Institute (SSI). The U.S. Army War College. Revealed from; <http://www.StrategicStudiesInstitute.army.mil>
- Emmanuel, J. & Paqueo, V. (1996). *Do Local Contributions Affect the Efficiency of Public Primary Schools?* Economics of Education Review 15(4), (pp 377–86).
- Fearon, J. D. & David, D. L. (2002). *Ethnicity, Insurgency, and Civil War*. Manuscript.
- Frey, B. S., & Stutzer, A. (2005). *Beyond outcomes: Measuring procedural utility*. Oxford: Economic Papers.

- Fyfe, T. (2003). *Good Governance....the Right Track*. Canada's Magazine on public service Purchasing. Accessed from HighBeam Research, <http://www.highbeam.com/publications>.
- Gene, A. Brewer., Yujin, Choi., & Richard, M. Walker. (2007). *Accountability, corruption and government effectiveness in Asia: an exploration of World Bank governance indicators*. International Public Management Review 8(2). Electronic Journal at <http://www.ipmr.net>
- General Planning Council in Libya (GPC) (2004). *Prospects for development and administrative development in Libya*. Accessed from; <http://www.npc.gov.ly/tshre3a1t.html>.
- Ghanem, G. (2005). *Rule of Law*. Arab Center for the Development of the Rule of Law and Integrity (ACRLI) and the United Nations Development Program UNDP.
- Girishankar, N. et al. (n. d). *Governance, benefited from extensive discussion within the World Bank and from comments provided at PRSP workshops*. World Bank. Accessed from; www.worldbank.org/wbi/governance/tools.htm.
- Glinavos, I. (2009). *Rule of Law Promotion and Development a search for meaning*. Kingston University, Kingston Hill, Kingston upon Thames, Surrey, United Kingdom, (p, 03).
- Gould, D. J., & Amaro-Reyes, J, A. (1983). *Effects of Corruption on Administrative Performance: Illustrations from Developing Countries (Management and development series)*. World Bank, Washington, D.C. U.S.A.
- Graham, J., &, et al. (2003). *Principles for Good Governance in the 21st Century*, Policy Brief No, 15. Institute on Governance (IOG). Ottawa, Canada.
- Greene, J.C., & Caracelli, V.J. (1997). *Advances in Mixed-Method Evaluation: The Challenges of Integrating Diverse Paradigm*, San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Grindle, S. M. (2005). *Good Enough Governance, Revisited*. Harvard University.
- Group of transparency-Libya (2010). *The administrative revolution" basis of "administrative corruption" in Libya*. Accessed from <http://transparency-libya.blogspot.com>.
- Hair, J F. & et al. (2007). *Research Methods for Business*, John Wiley & Sons Ltd, Second (2nd) Edition.
- Hart, M. (1978). *A Ranking of the Most Influential Persons in History*. (Mansur, A., 1985. Trans). Modern Egyptian Bureau.

- Hashem, M. (2007). *Islamic Root of Good Governance*. University of California. *Journal of Arab insight*. 1(1), (pp, 63-71).
- Helen, Y. & Guernsey, A. (2005). *What is the Rule of Law?* Center for International Finance and Development. Iowa City, Iowa: University of Iowa. http://www.uiowa.edu/ifdebook/faq/Rule_of_Law.shtml.
- Helliwell, J. & Huang, H. (2008). *How's your government? International evidence linking good government and well-being*. British Journal of Political Science. N, 138, (pp, 595–619).
- Hillenbrand, O. (2004). *Consensus-Building and Good Governance –A Framework for Democratic Transition*. Center for Applied Policy Research, University of Munich Press.
- Hope, K.R. (2003). *The UNECA and Good Governance in Africa*. Harvard International Development Conference. Boston, Massachusetts.
- Hosen, N. (2004). *Reform of Indonesia law in the post-Soeharto era 1998-1999*, PhD thesis. Uni of Wollongong.
- Human Rights & Rule of Law” working group. (2003). *The Rule of Law-Concept: Significance in Development Cooperation*. Publisher: Swiss Agency for Development Cooperation/Federal Department of Foreign Affairs (SDC/FDFA).
- Human Rights Solidarity – Libya (2010). *Libya*, report submission to Ninth session of the UPR Working Group of the Human Rights Council, , c/o Maison des Associations 15, rue des Savoises 1205 Genève, Switzerland, November-December 2010.
- Hurwitz. (1973). *Contemporary Approaches to Political Stability*. Comparative Politics, Vol. No. 5, Issue No. 3, April 1973.
- Ibn Hisham, A. (d. 216 H / 833 CE). *Sirat Ibn Hisham, Biography of the Prophet*. Retrieved Nov 14th, 2010 from www.al-islam.com.
- International Living (2010). *Quality of Life Index2010*. Accessed from; <http://www1.internationalliving.com/qofl2010/#Libya>.
- Ismail, M. (196-256AH / 810-870AD). *Sahih Bukhari*. Retrieved Nov 14th, 2010, from www.al-islam.com. Dar as Salaam for publication and distribution.
- Jacobzone, S. C. Choi., & Miguët, C. (2007). *Indicators of Regulatory Management System*, OECD Working Papers on Public Governance, No; 4, OECD Publishing.

- Jibril, A. (2010). *Illness of the State: Cancer of Administrative Corruption*. Dar Al Manara of Printing and Publishing. Tripoli, Libya, (p 29-51).
- Jick, T. D. (1979). *Mixing qualitative and quantitative methods: Triangulation in Administrative Science Quarterly*, Qualitative Methodology. (Dec, 1979), 24(4), (pp, 602-611).
- Kamba, I. & et al. (2006). *Causes for the reluctance of citizens to attend the People's Congresses*. Research Center, General People's Congress, Libya.
- Karl, T. L. (1997). *The Paradox of Plenty: Oil Booms and Petro-States*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Kaufmann, D., & Kraay, A. (2008). *Governance indicators: Where are we, where should we be going?* World Bank Research Observer.
- Kaufmann, D., Kraay, A., & Mastruzzi, M. (1999). *Aggregating Governance indicators*. World Bank. Accessed from; <http://info.worldbank.org/governance/wgi/index.asp>
- Kaufmann, D., Kraay, A., & Mastruzzi, M. (2005). *Governance Matters IV: Governance Indicators for 1996-2000*. World Bank. Accessed from; <http://info.worldbank.org/governance/wgi/index.asp>
- Kaufmann, D., Kraay, A., & Mastruzzi, M. (2008). *Governance matters VII: aggregate and individual governance indicators, 1996–200*. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper No. 4654, World Bank 2008. , Accessed from; www.govindicators.org.
- Kaufmann, D., Kraay, A., & Zoido-Lobaton, P. (2002). *Governance Matters II: Updated Indicators for 2000-01*. In Policy Research Working Paper No. 2772. Washington DC: World Bank. Accessed from; www.worldbank.org.
- Khan, M.H. (1996). *A Typology of Corrupt Transactions in Developing Countries*, journal of Institute of Development Studies, *IDS Bulletin* 27(2), (p, 12–21).
- Kirkpatrick, C., & Parker, D. (2005). *Towards Better Regulation? A assessing the impact of Regulatory Reform in Developing Countries*. Centre on Regulation and Competition Institute for Development Policy and Management University of Manchester, UK, and *School of Management Cranfield University, UK. Press.
- Kuzu, A. (2007). *Need of school technology advisor of primary and secondary school in turkey*. Paper presented at the international Educational Technology (IETC) Conference (7th, Nicosia, Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus, May 3-5, 2007).

- Leftwich, A. (2000). *States of Development: On the Primacy of Politics in Development, Polity*: Cambridge, UK.
- Legge, J. (2002). *The Chinese classics (Confucian analects)*. Accessed from, www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/3330.
- Libya Country Report. (2012). *The Bertelsmann Stiftung's Transformation Index (BTI) 2012*. Revealed from; <http://www.bti-project.org>
- Liou, K. T. (2007). *Applying Good Governance concept to promote local Economic developing contribution and challenge*, international journal of Economic Development, 9, November, 1,2 (pp, 1-31).
- Mater, A. H, (1991). *The Republic of Aflatoun*. The Egyptian general authority of the book.
- Merilee Grindle (2008). *Good Governance: The Inflation of an Idea*. Harvard University, press.
- Mollah, A. H., & Uddin, N. (n.d.). *Combating Corruption in Bangladesh: some strategies*, University of Rajshahi. , Bangladesh.
- Morgan, G. .A., & Griego, O. V. (1998). *Easy Use and Interpretation of SPSS for Windows: Answering Research Questions With Statistics*, school of education Colorado state university, Lawrence Erlbaum associates, publishers, Mahwah, new jersey, London, (p, 87)
- Morita, S and Zaelke, D (2007). *Rule of Law, Good Governance, And Sustainable Development*. Seventh International Conference on Environmental Compliance and Enforcement.
- Mulgan, R, (2000). *Accountability: An ever expanding Concept?*. Public Administration, 78: 555.
- Mustafa, A. (2007). *The general policies of Administrative Development*, First National Conference on public policies in Libya, Research and Consultation Center, University of Garyounis press.
- Mustafa, A., & Abu Bakr, A. (2007). *The General Environment of the development of managerial from the perspective of good governance*. The first national conference for the development and management training in Libya, Tripoli: National Institute of Administration.
- Mustafa, A., & Abu Bakr, A. (2008). *There is no Development without Sustainable Management Stewardship*. Sustainable Development Conference in Libya.

- Mustafa, A., & Abu Bakr, A., (2007). *The overall environment for the development of administrative from the perspective of good governance*, the First National Conference for the development and of administrative training in Libya, Tripoli: National Institute of Management.
- Nanda, V. P. (2006). *The good governance concept revisited*. Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science. Vol. 603, (p, 269).
- Naser, K., Al-Khatib, K., & Karbhari, Y. (2002). *Empirical Evidence on the Depth of Corporate information disclosure In Developing Countries: The case of Jordan*". International journal of commerce and management. 12 (3/4), (pp, 122 – 155).
- Ncube, C. (2005). *Good Governance- Participatory Development and Reduction an Appraisal of the NGO Bill in Zimbabwe*; A dissertation submitted to university Birmingham.
- Nekola, M. (n.d). *Political participation and governance effectiveness – does participation matter?* Center for social and economic strategies (ceses), Charles University, Prague, press.
- Noll, R.G., (2000). *Telecommunications Reform in Developing Countries*", in *Economic Policy Reform: The Second Stage* ed. Anne Krueger, University of Chicago.press.
- Nunnally, J. C. (1978) *Psychometric theory*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Nwaddigo. R. (2011). *On the need for good governance in the country*. Released from <http://nigeriancommentaries.blogspot.com/2011/03/on-need-for-good-governance-in-country.html>
- Obeidi, A. (2004). *Libyan Security Policy between Existence and Feasibility: an Exploratory Study*, University Of Garyounis-Benghazi, press.
- OECD (2005). *OECD Guiding Principles for Regulatory Quality and Performance*. Accessed from <http://www.oecd.org/home>.
- Office for Public Management, OPM, (2007). *Going forward with good governance*. , Accessed from; www.opm.co.uk
- Otite, O. (2000). Corruption against the Norms of African Life" in Femi,O (ed) "*Effective and Efficient implementation of Nigeria's Recent Anti –Corruption Legislation*".

- Ott, J. c. (2010). *Good Governance and Happiness in Nations: Technical Quality Precedes Democracy and Quality Beats Size*. Springer Science Business Media B.V.
- Ott, J. c. (2011). *Government and Happiness in 130 Nations: Good Governance Fosters Higher Level and More Equality of Happiness*. Social Indicators Research, 102(1), (pp, 3-22).
- Paldam, M. (1998). *Does Economic Growth Lead to Political Stability?* The University of Aarhus, Denmark, press.
- Paldam, M. (1998). *Does Economic Growth lead to Political Stability?* IEA Conference Volume 119. ed. Macmillan Publishers Limited, (pp, 171-190).
- Pargeter, A. (2006). *Women's Rights in the Middle East and North Africa*, Accessed from, <http://www.freedomhouse.org>.
- Parsons. J., et al. (2008). *Developing Indicators to Measure the Rule of Law: A Global Approach*. A Report to the World Justice Project; Vera Institute of Justice. New York.
- Politician. (2010.). Dictionary.com Unabridged. Retrieved January 21, 2011, from Dictionary.com accessed from; <http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/politician>.
- Rajora, V. (2010). *Comparative Analysis of Rule of Law in UK & India*. Assessed from Social Science Research Network (SSRN), <http://ssrn.com>.
- Ray, B. (1999). *Good Governance Administrative Reform and Socioeconomic Realities: a South Pacific Perspective*, international journal of social economic. 26, (1/2/3/1999), (pp, 354-369).
- Rémy. (2004). *Good Governance: Conceptual Vagueness, Ideological Clearness*. The National Centre for Scientific Research (CNRS) and the University of Paris.
- Rose, L. E., & Pettersen, P.A. (2000). *The Legitimacy of Local Government – What Makes a Difference? Evidence from Norway*. in K.Hoggart and T.N.Clark (eds) *Citizen Responsive Government*. Research in Urban Policy, Vol 8. Amsterdam: JAI.e
- Rotberg, R. I. (2004). *Strengthening Governance: Ranking Countries Would Help*, The Washington Quarterly 28(1), (pp, 71-81).
- Sachiko, M., & Durwood, Z. (2005). *Rule of Law, Good Governance, and Sustainable Development*. Seventh International Conference on Environmental Compliance and Enforcement, Marrakech, Morocco, from 9-15 April 2005.

- Sachiko, M., & Durwood, Z. (2007). *Rule Of Law, Good Governance, and Sustainable Development*, 2141 Wisconsin Ave. NW, Suite D2, Washington, DC 2007, United States, (P,16).
- Sebudubudu, D. (2010). *The Impact of Good Governance on Development and Poverty in Africa: Botswana - A relatively successful African initiative*. African Journal of Political Science and International Relations 4(7), (pp, 249-262)
- Sekaran, U. (2003). *Research Methods for Business: a skill building approach*, 4th Edition, United States of America: John Wiley and Sons, Inc.
- Sekaran, U., & Bougie, R. (2010). *Research Methods for Business. A skill Building Approach*. John Wiley. New York. 5th Edition. (P, 296).
- Shah, A. (2006). *Performance Accountability and Combating Corruption*. World Bank Washington, DC 20433.
- Sheng, Y.K., et al. (2007). *Access to Basic Services for the Poor: The Importance of Good Governance*. Asia-Pacific MDG Study Series, published by the UNESCAP/UNDP/ADB joint project on MDGs in Asia and the Pacific.
- Silver, M. (1997). *Business Statistics*, McGraw-Hill Publishing Company. Second edition.
- Statistics Solutions. (2009). *Survey Research and Administration*. Accessed from, <http://www.statisticssolutions.com/resources/dissertationresources/survey-research-and-administration>
- Steckler, A., et al. (1992). *Toward integrating qualitative and quantitative methods: an introduction*. Health Education Quarterly. 19(1), (p, 1–8).
- TE, S. (2007). *Good Governance in Cambodia. Exploring the Link between Governance and Poverty Reduction*. Yokohama journal of social sciences. 11(6).
- The Australian government aid overseas program. (2000). *Good Governance: Guiding Principles for Implementation*, published by the Australian agency for international development (Aus AID). Canberra, press.
- The independent Commission on Good Governance in Public Service. (2005). *The Good Governance Standard for Public Service*. Printed by Hackney Press Ltd, London.
- The Independent Commission on Good Governance in Public Service. (2004). *The Good Governance Standard for Public Service*. Accessed from, http://www.opm.co.uk/site_search?site_search_keywords=The+independent+commission+on+good+governance+in+public+service&commnt=Search.

- The National Assembly of the Republic of Serbia. (2005). *National Strategy for Combating Corruption*, on the Seventh session of the Second sitting in 2005, "Official Gazette of the Republic of Serbia", 109(05), December 9th 2005.
- The National Economic and Development Authority. (2011). *Good Governance and the Rule of Law*. Philippine Development Plan 2011-2016. Press.
- Transparency Group of Libya. (2009). *Political Corruption in the "the Libyan"*: the basis of financial and administrative corruption.
- Transparency International. (2008). *Corruption Perceptions Index*, accessed from <http://www.transparency.org>.
- Ulusoy, A. (2004). *Qualify for Public Service Inc*. Istanbul, Country Books.
- UNDP. (2003). *Public Administration Reform: Practice Note*. New York: UNDP.
- UNESCAP. (n. d). *What is Good Governance?* The United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific Accessed from; www.unescap.org. Bangkok, Thailand.
- Vandewalle, D. (2006). *A History of Modern Libya*. Cambridge University Press.
- Veenhoven, R. (1999). *Quality of life in individualistic society, a comparison of 43 nations in the early 1990's*. Social Indicators Research. Vol 48. (pp, 157–186).
- Wayne, Taylor. D. (2000). *Understanding the Principles of Good Governance*. The international journal of public sector management, 13 (2), (pp, 108-124).
- William, G. Zikmund. (2003). *Business Research Methods*. 7th Ed. New York: mcgraw-hill. yamane, taro.
- World Bank Institute. (n.d). *Good Governance and its Benefits on Economic Development*. An Overview of Current Trends. Accessed from; www.worldbank.org.
- World Bank. (1989). *Sub-Saharan Africa; from crisis to sustainable growth- a long- term perspective study*. Washington, D.C. Accessed from; www.govindicators.org.
- World Bank. (1992). *Governance and Development*. World Bank, Washington DC. www.worldbank.org.
- World Bank. (1996-2007). *Country data report for Libya*, Accessed from; www.govindicators.org.

- World Bank. (1996-2010). *Country data report for Libya*, Accessed from; www.govindicators.org.
- World Bank. (1997). *The State in a Changing World*. World Development Report. Washington DC: World Bank. Accessed from; www.worldbank.org
- World Bank. (2000). *Anticorruption in Transition a Contribution to the Policy Debate*, 1818 H Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. Accessed from; www.worldbank.org
- World Bank. (2002). *Building Institutions for Markets*, World Development Report. Washington DC: World Bank. Accessed from; www.worldbank.org.
- World Bank. (2003). *Better Governance for Development in the Middle East and North Africa. Enhancing Inclusiveness and Accountability*. MENA Development Report. Accessed from; www.worldbank.org.
- World Bank. (2008). *Public sector reform: what works and why?* Washington D.C, IEG Evaluation of World Bank Support. Accessed from; www.worldbank.org.
- Yamani, H. (2006). *Administrative Corruption: and Treatment from an Islamic Perspective*. Accessed Nov 13th, 2010 from; www.al-islam.com
- Younis, M., et al. (2008). *Political stability and economic growth in Asia*. American Journal of Applied Sciences. 5(3), (pp, 203-208).