# FINANCIAL DISTRESS AMONG SMES IN MALAYSIA: AN EARLY WARNING SIGNAL

ΒY

MUHAMMAD MUHAMMAD MA'AJI

Thesis Submitted to Othman Yeop Abdullah Graduate School of Business, Universiti Utara Malaysia, in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirement for the Master of Science (Finance)



Kolej Perniagaan

(College of Business) Universiti Utara Malaysia

### PERAKUAN KERJA KERTAS PROJEK

(Certification of Project Paper)

#### PERAKUAN KERJA KERTAS PROJEK

(Certification of Project Paper)

Saya, mengaku bertandatangan, memperakukan bahawa (*I, the undersigned, certified that*) **MUHAMMAD MUHAMMAD MA'AJI (815698)** 

Calon untuk Ijazah Sarjana (*Candidate for the degree of*) <u>MASTER OF SCIENCE (FINANCE)</u>

telah mengemukakan kertas projek yang bertajuk (has presented his/her project paper of the following title)

#### FINANCIAL DISTRESS AMONG SMEs IN MALAYSIA: AN EARLY WARNING SIGNAL

Seperti yang tercatat di muka surat tajuk dan kulit kertas project (*as it appears on the title page and front cover of the project paper*)

Bahawa kertas projek tersebut boleh diterima dari segi bentuk serta kandungan dan meliputi bidang ilmu dengan memuaskan.

(that the project paper acceptable in the form and content and that a satisfactory knowledge of the field is covered by the project paper).

# Nama Penyelia : **PROF. DR. NUR ADIANA HIAU BT ABDULLAH**

Nama Penyelia (Name of Supervisor)

Tandatangan (Signature)

: <u>24<sup>TH</sup> NOVEMBER, 2014</u>

•

Tarikh (Date)

#### **PERMISSION TO USE**

In presenting this project paper in partial fulfillment of the requirements for a Post Graduate degree from the Universiti Utara Malaysia (UUM), I agree that the Library of this university may make it freely available for inspection. I further agree that permission for copying this project paper in any manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purposes may be granted by my supervisor(s) or in their absence, by the Dean of Othman Yeop Abdullah Graduate School of Business where I did my project paper. It is understood that any copying or publication or use of this project paper parts of it for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission. It is also understood that due recognition shall be given to me and to the UUM in any scholarly use which may be made of any material in my project paper.

Request for permission to copy or to make other use of materials in this dissertation/project paper in whole or in part should be addressed to:

Dean of Othman Yeop Abdullah Graduate School of Business Universiti Utara Malaysia 06010 UUM Sintok Kedah Darul Aman

#### ABSTRAK

Membuat ramalan tentang kesulitan kewangan di kalangan perusahaan kecil dan sederhana (PKS) boleh memberi impak yang signifikan ke atas ekonomi kerana ia berfungsi sebagai isyarat amaran awal yang efektif. Kajian ini membangunkan model ramalan krisis kewangan dengan menggabungkan pembolehubah kewangan, bukan kewangan dan tadbir urus, dan menganalisis pengaruh ciri-ciri tadbir urus korporat utama, seperti pemilikan dan struktur lembaga, terhadap kemungkinan krisis kewangan. Dua pendekatan yang digunakan ialah analisis diskriminan pelbagai (MDA) dan model logit. Sampel akhir bagi model anggaran adalah daripada 172 syarikat di mana ianya terdiri daripada 50 peratus syarikat yang tidak gagal dan 50 peratus syarikat yang gagal bagi tempoh antara tahun 2000 hingga 2012. Model ramalan menunjukkan prestasi yang agak baik terutamanya bagi model logit dan MDA yang menggabungkan pembolehubah tadbir urus, kewangan dan bukan kewangan, dengan kadar ketepatan keseluruhan sebanyak 93.6 peratus dan 90.7 peratus masing-masing bagi sampel anggaran. Kadar ketepatan dalam sampel holdout ialah 91.2 peratus bagi model logit dan MDA. Bukti ini menunjukkan bahawa model bertindak sebagai isyarat amaran awal yang efisien dan boleh digunakan bagi tujuan pemantauan dan penilaian. Pemegang saham yang mengawal, bilangan pengarah dan jantina pengarah urusan merupakan faktor yang signifikan terhadap PKS yang mengalami masalah kewangan.

Kata Kunci: Krisis kewangan, model logit, analisis diskriminan pelbagai, perusahaan kecil dan sederhana

#### ABSTRACT

Predicting financial distress among SMEs can have a significant impact on the economy as it serves as an effective early warning signal. The study develops distress prediction models combining financial, non-financial and governance, variables and analyse the influence of major corporate governance characteristics, i.e., ownership and board structures, on the likelihood of financial distress. The two extensively documented approaches, MDA and logit methods were used. The final sample for the estimation model consists of 172 companies with 50 percent nonfailed cases and 50 percent failed cases for the period between 2000 to 2012. The prediction models perform relatively especially in the logit and MDA model that incorporate governance, financial and non-financial variables, with an overall accuracy rate of 93.6 percent and 90.7 percent respectively in the estimated sample. The accuracy rate in the holdout sample was 91.2 percent for the logit and MDA model. This evidence shows that the models serve as efficient early warning signals and can thus be beneficial for monitoring and evaluation. Controlling shareholder, number of directors and sex of managing director are found to be significant predictors of financially distressed SMEs.

Keywords: Financial distress, Logit model, MDA, SMEs, Malaysia

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

First and foremost, Alhamdulillah, thanks to Allah S.W.T for ALL the blessings upon me and for providing me the guidance and chance to complete this dissertation to fulfill the requirement of Master of Science Finance at Universiti Utara Malaysia.

I would like to express my sincere gratitude and appreciation to my supervisor Prof. Dr. Nur Adiana Hiau Bt Abdullah for the continuous support of my masters study and dissertation, for her patience, guidance, advices, motivation, enthusiasm, and immense knowledge. Her guidance helped me in all the time of research and writing of this dissertation. I could not have imagined having a better advisor and mentor for my master's study. I would also like to thank Prof. Madya Dr. Rohani Bt Md Rus and Prof. Madyan Dr. Kamarun Nisham Taufil Mohd for their feedbacks. Their commitment and time spent for this dissertation is most appreciated.

I would like to thank my father, Alhaji Kawu Muhammad Ma'aji, and my late mother, Laraba Mikail, for their utmost assistance and prayers, may her soul continue to rest in perfect peace, ameen. My heartfelt thanks goes to my grandmother, Hajiya Hasiya Adamu, may Allah grant her long life, health and prosperity, ameen. And all my family members for their source of inspiration and motivation. To them I dedicated this dissertation.

Finally, to Companies Commission of Malaysia (CCM) for their speedy response in providing the data used in this study and to all my colleagues in the Master of Science (Finance) programme and my lecturers, I wish to thank you all for your support and friendship.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

DESCRIPTION	PAGE
TITTLE PAGE	i
CERTIFICATION OF THESIS WORK	
PERMISSION TO USE	iii
ABSTRAK (BAHASA MELAYU)	iv
ABSTRACT (ENGLISH)	v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	
TABLE OF CONTENTS	
LIST OF TABLES	
LIST OF FIGURES	
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	
1.1 Background of Study	1
1.2 Status and Performance of SMEs across the Globe	2
1.3 State of SMEs in Malaysia	3
1.4 Problem Statement	6
1.5 Research Objectives	8
1.6 Research Questions	8
1.7 Significant of Study	8
1.8 Organisation of the Study	9
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW	
2.1 Introduction	11
2.2 The Underlying Theories of Financial Distress	11
2.2.1 The Trade-off Theory	11

2.2.2 Agency Theory	13
2.3 Empirical Evidence of Financial Distress	16
CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY	
3.1 Introduction	25
3.2 Data Collection and Sample Selection	25
3.3 Research Framework	26
3.4 Hypotheses Development	27
3.5 Methods	28
3.5.1 Logit Model	28
3.5.2 MDA Model	29
3.5.3 Variables Measurement	31
CHAPTER 4: EMPIRICAL RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	
4.1 Introduction	33
4.2 Descriptive Statistics	33
4.3 Pearson Correlation	37
4.4 Multiple Discriminant Analysis	38
4.5 Logit Analysis	42
CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSION	
5.1 Introduction	48
5.2 Summary of Findings	48
5.3 Implications of Study	49
5.4 Limitations of the Study	50
5.5 Recommendation for Future Research	50
REFERENCES	
APPENDIXES	

# LIST OF TABLES

TABLES		PAGE
Table 3.1	Definition of Variables	31
Table 4.1	Descriptive Statistics	33
Table 4.2	Pearson Correlation	36
Table 4.3	Variance Inflating Factor	37
Table 4.4	Stepwise MDA Analysis for Estimated Models	39
Table 4.5	Classification Accuracy Rate under MDA Models	41
Table 4.6	Stepwise Logistic Regression Analysis for Estimated Models	44
Table 4.7	Classification Accuracy Rate under Logistic Regression Models	46

## LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURES		PAGE
Figure 1.1	SMEs Contribution to GDP Growth	5
Figure 1.2	GDP of SMEs and Large Firms in Percentage Share to	6
	overall GDP	
Figure 3.1	Conceptual Framework	27

# CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION

#### **1.1 Background of Study**

The consequences of corporate failure have a far-reaching impact on stakeholders either directly or indirectly. The major stakeholders in a company who are the shareholders stand to lose most of their investment. Creditors may receive partial or no repayment of their initial loans depending on whether their loans were secured or unsecured. The implication of a corporate failure is unfortunately not that simplistic and has serious consequences for many other stakeholders. Some of these consequences include; employees will lose their jobs, the government collects less company and personnel taxes, and social problem might increase. The contributions of Altman (1968); Altman, Edward, Haldeman, & Narayanan (1977); Beaver (1966); Deakin (1977); Blum (1974); and Ohlson (1983) among others have spawned huge literature on the topic of company failure. Since then a number of models have been proposed in order to correctly predict corporate failure but mostly in large public listed firms due to easy access to their financial data. However, very little number of researches on small and medium enterprises (SMEs) has been done as a result of difficulty in accessing their financial data and other information.

In recent years, SMEs are viewed to be the leading contributor to the national economy development in terms of developing entrepreneurship using indigenous skills and technologies, creating employment opportunities, building market competitive through innovativeness and allowing government to realise poverty free society (Jahur and Quadir, 2012). Small business in Malaysia plays a significant role towards economy development in the country therefore understanding why SMEs

# The contents of the thesis is for internal user only

#### **References List**

- Abdullah, N., Ahmad, A., Ahmad, H & Md. Rus, R. (2008). Predicting corporate failure of Malaysia's listed companies: Comparing multiple discriminant analysis, logistic regression and the hazard model, *International Research Journal of Finance & Economics*, 15, 201-217.
- Abdullah, N., Ahmad, A., Md. Rus, R., & Zainuldin, N. (2014). Modelling small business failures in Malaysia. Retrieved from SSRN: <u>http://ssrn.com/abstract</u> =2402129 or <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2402129</u>
- Abor, J., & Biekpe, N. (2007). Corporate governance, ownership structure and performance of SMEs in Ghana: implications for financing opportunities, *Corporate Governance*, 7 (3), 288-300.
- Ahmad, H., & Seet, P. (2009). Dissecting behaviours associated with business failure: a qualitative study of SME owners in Malaysia and Australia, Asian Social Science, 5(9), 98-104
- Altman, E. (1968). Financial ratios, Discriminant Analysis and the Prediction of Corporate Bankruptcy, *Journal of Finance*, 23, 589-609.
- Altman, E., Marco, G., & Varetto, F. (1995). Corporate distressed diagnosis: comparisons using linear discriminant analysis and neural networks (The Italian experience). *Journal of Banking and Finance*, 18, 505 - 529.
- Altman, E., Edward, I., Haldeman, R., & Narayanan, P. (1977). A new model to identify bankruptcy risk of corporation. *Journal of Banking and Finance*, 1, 29–54.
- Altman, E., & Sabato, G. (2007). Modeling credit risk for SMEs: Evidence from US market. A Journal of Accounting, Finance and Business Studies (ABACUS), 43(3), 332-357.
- Altman, E., Sabato, G., & Wilson, N. (2010). The value of non-financial information in small and medium-sized enterprise risk management. *Journal of Credit Risk*, 6(2), 95-127.

- Amran, N., & Ahmad, A. (2010). Family succession and firm performance among Malaysian companies, *Journal of Business and Social Science*, 10(2), 288-300.
- Ang J. (1991). Small business uniqueness and the theory of financial management. Journal of Small Business Finance, 1(1), 1-13.
- Beaver, W. (1967). Financial ratios as predictor of failure, *Journal of Accounting Research*, 4, 71-111.
- Becchetti, L., & Sierra J. (2002). Bankruptcy risk and productive efficiency in manufacturing firms. *Journal of Banking and Finance*, 27, 2099-2120.
- Behr, P., & Guttler, A. (2007). Credit risk assessment and relationship lending: an empirical analysis of German small and medium-sized enterprises, *Journal of Small Business Management*, 45(2), 194-213.
- Bellovary, J. (2007). A review of bankruptcy prediction studies: 1930-Present, Journal of Financial Education, 33, 1-42.
- Berle, A., & Means, G. (1993). *The modern corporation and private property*. New York: Macmillian.
- Blanco, A., Irimia, A. & Oliver, M. (2007). The prediction of bankruptcy of small firms in the UK using logistic regression, *Análisis Financiero*, 118, 32-40
- Blum, M. (1974). Failing company discriminant analysis. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 12(1), 1-25.
- Bozec, Y., & Laurin, C. (2008). Large shareholder entrenchment and performance: Empirical evidence from Canada, *Journal of Business Finance & Accounting*, 35(1-2), 25–49.
- Buggakupta, S. (2004). The development of a Thai da model and its comparison with Altman's (1993) model in predicting failure of Thai listed companies, *Doctoral Dissertation*, Ramkhamhaeng University.
- Chancharat, N. (2011). SMEs failure prediction: Literature review, *ABAC Journal*, 31(3), 70-81

- Charitou, A., & Trigeorgis L. (2002). Option-based bankruptcy prediction. *Paper* presented at 6th Annual Real Options Confernce Paphos, 4(6), 1-25.
- Corbetta, G., & Salvato, C. (2004). Boards of directors in Italian family businesses, *Family Business Review*, 17(2), 119-34.
- Corbetta, G., & Tomaselli, S. (1996). Boards of directors in Italian family businesses, *Family Business Review*, 9, 403- 421.
- Deakin, E. (1972). A discriminant analysis of predictors of business failure, *Journal* of Accounting Research, 10(1), 167-179.
- DeAngelo, A. & Masulis R., 1980. Optimal capital structure under corporate and personal taxation. *Journal of Financial Economics*, 8, 3-29.
- Edminster, R. (1972). An empirical test of financial ratio analysis for small business failure prediction, *Journal of Financial and Quantitative Analysis*, 1477-1493.
- Eisenbeis, R., (1977). Pitfalls in the application of discriminant analysis in business, *Journal of Finance*.
- Emmanuel, G & Nickolaos, G (2010). The effect of foreign ownership on SMEs performance: An efficiency analysis perspective, *Journal of Productivity Analysis*, 34(2), 167-180.
- Emery D., Finnerty, D., & Stowe, J. (2004). *Corporate financial management*. 2 ed. Upper Saddle River: Prentice Hall.
- European Union, (2013). A Recovery on the horizon? Annual report on European SMEs 2012/2013, European Commission, [online], available at: <u>http://ec.europa.eu/enterprise/policies/sme/facts-figuresanalysis/performance-review/files/supporting-documents/2013/annual-report-smes-2013\_en.pdf</u>
- Ferri, M., & Jones, W. (1979). Determinants of Financial Structure: A New Methodological Approach. *Journal of Finance*, 34, 631-644.
- Fitz, P. (1932). A Comparison of ratios of successful industrial enterprises with those of failed firms, *Certified Public Accountant*, 598-605.

- Gentry, J., Newbold, P., & Whitford D. (1985). Classifying bankrupt firms with funds flow components. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 23(1), 146-160.
- Gombola, M., Haskins M., Ketz J., & Williams D. (1987). Cash flow in bankruptcy prediction. *Financial Management*, 55-65.
- Gunto, M., & Haji, M. (2013). SMEs development in Malaysia: Lesson for Libya, *Prosiding PERKEM*, 8(3), 1521-1530.
- Ahmad, A., Mohd, N., Rizal, A., & Marzuki, A. (2008). Macroeconomic Determinants of Corporate Failures in Malaysia, *International Journal of Business and Management*, 3(3) 3-10.
- Hart, O. (1995). Corporate governance: Some theory and implications, *The Economic Journal*, 105(430), 678-89.
- Headd, B. (2003). Redefining business success: Distinguishing between closure and failure, *Small Business Economics*, 21, 51-61.
- Herman, E. (1981). *Corporate control, corporate power*. London: Cambridge University Press.
- Houben, G., Bakker, W., & Vergauwen, P. (2005). Assessing the non-financial predictors of the success and failure of young firms in the Netherlands, *Journal of Economics and Applied Informatics*, 1, 5-14.
- Huberty, J. (1994). Applied Discriminant Analysis, Wiley Series in Probability and Statistics, 297.
- Hutchinson P. (1999). Small enterprise: Finance, ownership and control. *International Journal of Management Reviews*, 1(3), 343-365.
- Jahur, M., & Quadar, S. (2012). Financial distress in small and medium enterprises (SMEs) of Bangladesh: Determinants and remedial measures. *Economia Series Management*, 15(1), 432-444.
- Jensen, M. (1986). Agency costs of free cash flow, corporate finance, and takeovers, *American Economic Review*, 76(2), 323-329.

- Jensen, M. C. & Meckling, W. H. (1976). Theory of the Firm: Managerial Behavior, Agency Costs and Ownership Structure, *Journal of Financial Economics*, 3, 305-360.
- Kam, A, Citron, D & Muradoglu, G (2008). Distressed and restructuring in China: Does ownership matter? *China Economic Review*, 19, 567–579.
- Keasey, K., & Watson R. (1987). Non-financial symptoms and the prediction of small company failure: a test of Argenti's hypotheses, *Journal of Business Finance and Accounting*, 14(3), 335-354.
- Khunthong, J. (1997). Red flags of financial failure: The case of Thai corporations. Unpublished Ph.D., The National Institute of Development Administration, Thailand.
- Kiatkhajornvong, N. (2008). Credit risk model for listed companies in Thailand, *Dissertation*, Thammasat University.
- Leung, D., & Rispoli, L. (2011). The contribution of small and medium-sized businesses to gross domestic product: A Canada–United States comparison, *Economic Analysis (EA) Research Paper Series*, 11F0027M — No. 070, ISSN 1703-0404.
- Lichtenstein, B., & Brush, C. (2001). How do resource bundles develop and change in new ventures? A dynamic model and longitudinal exploration.Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice 25(3), 37-58
- Lussier, R. (1995). A non-financial business success versus failure prediction model for young firms, *Journal of Small Business Management*, 33(1), 8-20.
- Lussier, R., & Pfeifer, S. (2001) A cross-national prediction model for business success, *Journal of Small Business Management*, 39(3), 228-239.
- Lo, W. (1985). Logit versus discriminant analysis. *Journal of Econometrics*, 31, 151-178.
- Low, S., Fauzias, M., & Zainal Ariffin, A. (2001). Predicting corporate distress using logit model: The case of Malaysia, *Asian Academy of Management Journal*, 6(1), 49-62.

- Lugovskaja, L. (2009). Predicting default of Russian SMEs on the basis of financial and non-financial variables, *Journal of Financial Services Marketing*, 14(4), 301-313.
- Luppi, B., Marzo, M., & Scorcu, A. (2007). A credit risk model for Italian SMEs, Working Papers, Dipartimento Scienze Economiche, Universita' di Bologna.
- March J. (1978). Bounded rationality, ambiguity, and the engineering of choice. *The Bell Journal of Economics*, 9(2), 587-608.
- Martin J., & Scott D. (1974). A discriminant analysis of the corporate debt-equity decision. *Financial Management* 3 (4), 71-79.
- Md-Rus, R., Nisham K., Abdul Latif, R., & Nadakkavil, Z. (2013). Ownership Structure and Financial Distressed, *Journal of Advanced Management Science*, 1(4), 363-267.
- Micha, B. (1984). Analysis of business failures in Franc. *Journal of Banking and Finance*, 8, 281-291.
- Mossman, E., Bell, G., Swartz, M., & Turtle H. (1998). An empirical comparison of bankruptcy models. *The Financial Review*, 33(2), 35-54.
- Myers, C., (2001). Capital structure. *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 15 (2), 81-102.
- Miller, M. (1977). Debt and taxes. Journal of finance 32, 261-275.
- National SME Development Council (2011). SME annual report 2009/10, Kuala Lumpur.
- Norfian, M. (2013). Prediction of financial distress companies in Malaysia: a comparison between consumer products and industrial products sectors, 2nd International Conference on Management, Economics and Finance (2nd ICMEF 2013) Proceeding, ISBN: 978-967-5705-12-0, 382-392.
- NSDC, (2013), Guidelines for New SME Definition, SME Corp. Malaysia, retrieved from <a href="http://www.smecorp.gov.my/vn2/node/533">http://www.smecorp.gov.my/vn2/node/533</a>

- Ohlson, J. (1980). Financial ratios and the probabilistic prediction of bankruptcy, *Journal of Accounting Research*, 18, 109-131
- Ooghe, H., Joos P., and De Bourdeaudhuij C. (1995). Financial distressed models in Belgium: The results of a decade of empirical research. *International Journal* of Accounting, 30, 245-274.
- Ortecho, L., and Bengoa, A. (2014). Enhancing the competitiveness of SMEs through the innovative cooperative business model (CBM), *APEC Small and Medium Enterprises*, retrieved from <u>http://publications.apec.org/publication-</u> detail.php?pub\_id=1520
- Oxelheim, L., Stonehill, A., Randøy, T., Vikkula, K., Dullum, K., & Mode´n, K.
  (1998). Corporate strategies to internationalise the cost of capital.
  Copenhagen Business School Press, Copenhagen
- Parker, G., Peters, F., & Turetsky, H. (2002). Corporate governance and corporate failure: A survival analysis, *Corporate Governance*, 2, 4-12.
- Pederzoli, C., & Torricelli, C. (2010). A parsimonious default prediction model for Italian SMEs. *Banks and Bank Systems*, 5(4), 5-9.
- Platt, H., & Platt, M. (1990). A note on the use of industry-relative ratios in bankruptcy prediction, *Journal of Banking and Finance*, 15, 1183-1194.
- Rachagan, S., & Satkunasingam, E. (2009). Improving corporate governance of SMEs in emerging economies: a Malaysian experience, *Journal of Enterprise Information Management*, 22(4), 468 - 484
- Randøya, T., & Goelb, S. (2003). Ownership structure, founder leadership, and performance in Norwegian SMEs: implications for financing entrepreneurial opportunities, *Journal of Business Venturing*, 18, 619 – 637.
- Randøya, T., Oxelheimb, L., & Stonehillc, A. (2001). Global financial strategies and corporate competitiveness. *Eur.Manag. J.* 19(6), 659 – 669.
- Sirirattanaphonkun, S., & Pattarathammas, M. (2012). Default prediction for smallmedium enterprises in emerging market: Evidence from Thailand, Seoul Journal of Business, 18(2), 25-54.

SME Bank, (2013), Annual Report 2013, SME Bank Berhad.

SMECorps, (2013), Annual Report 2012/2013, SMECorp Malaysia.

SMECorps, (2014), Annual Report 2013/2014, SMECorp Malaysia.

- Stulz, R. (1999). Globalization, corporate finance and the cost of capital, *Journal of Applied Corporate Finance*, 12(3), 8 25.
- Sulaiman, M. (2001). Predicting corporate failure in Malaysia: An application of Logit model to financial ratios, *Asian Academy of Management Journals*, 6(1), 99-118.
- Taffler, R., & Tisshaw H. (1977). Going, going, gone four factors which predict, *Accountancy*, 88, 50-54.
- Teng, H., Bhatia, G., & Anwar, S. (2011). A success versus failure prediction model for small businesses in Singapore, *American Journal of Business*, 26(1), 50-64.
- Zeitun, R., & Tian, G. (2007). Does ownership affect a firm's performance and default risk in Jordan? *Corporate Governance*, 7(1), 66-82.
- Zulkarnian, M., Ali, M., Md. Nasir, A., & Mohamad, Z. (2001). Forecasting corporate failure in Malaysian industrial sector firms, *Asian Academy of Management Journals*, 6(1), 15-30.
- Zulkarnian, M. (2006). Prediction of corporate financial distress: evidence from Malaysian listed firms during the Asian financial crisis, *Staff paper 2/2006*, University Putra Malaysia
- Zulridah, M. (2012). Corporate governance and corporate failure: A survival analysis, *Prosiding Perkem*, 7(1), 684 695.