A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF THE TOP 100 COOPERATIVES BETWEEN 2009 TO 2014 IN MALAYSIA

ABDI QANI JAMA ABDULLAHI

MASTER OF ISLAMIC FINANCE AND BANKING UNIVERERSITI UTARA MALAYSIA July 2015

A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF THE TOP 100 COOPERATIVE BETWEEN 2009 TO 2014 IN MALAYSIA

By

ABDI QANI JAMA ABDULLAHI

Dean of Othman Yeop Abdullah Graduate School of Business Universiti Utara Malaysia 06010 UUM Sintok Kedah Darul Aman PERMISSION TO USE

In presenting this research paper in partial fulfil in the requirements for a postgraduate degree from

the University Utara Malaysia (UUM), I agree that the library of this university can make it freely

available for inspection. I further agree that permission for coping this research paper in any

manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purpose may be granted by my supervisor or in her

absence, by the Dean of Othman Yeop Abdullah Graduate School of Business where I did my

dissertation. It is understood that any coping or publication or use of this research paper or parts

of it for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission. It is also understood

that due recognition given to me and to the UUM in any scholarly use which may be made of any

material in my research paper. Request for permission to copy or to make other use of materials in

this research paper in whole or in part should be addressed to

Dean of Othman Yeop Abdullah Graduate School of Business

Universiti Utara Malaysia

06010 UUM Sintok

Kedah Darul Aman

July 2015

ii

ABSTRACTS

From the comparative analysis of the top 100 cooperatives in SKM from 2009 to 2014, this study have revealed some fundamental challenges confronting the Malaysian cooperative movement. The open system in ranking of the top 100 cooperatives has revealed an uneven playing field for the thousands of cooperative entities. As such, it is not surprising to observe in the class analysis, the dominance of certain sectors over the others and under-representation of a majority of the sectors in the top 100 cooperatives. Except for the banking entities, all other sectors do not perform well in the ranking system while 1 sector failed to have any representation to the top 100 cooperatives. The need to comply with additional rules and regulations from Bank Negara Malaysia will always make the 2 banking cooperatives to be entrenched within the top 100 cooperatives as the management have to commit themselves to the rigid and rigorous supervision activities of the central bank. The trend over the six years of analysis for the four fundamental parameters for the cooperative movement revealed healthy trends and patterns. However the analysis on the annual changes in the trend of growth of all four parameters in the ranking system revealed some serious trend between each year of analysis which will have far reaching consequences on the cooperative movement in the short run as well over the medium term. The erratic pattern of transition between each year of analysis is a major cause of concern as it is a sign of underlying weaknesses and structural problems confronting the cooperative movement in general and the cooperative entities in particular. The erratic pattern in the growth of membership and the declining membership in numerous sectors are a major cause of concern for the cooperative movement as it is a reflection of fundamental problem confronting the cooperative entities. The erratic pattern is equally visible for the other 3 parameters, share-capital, revenue and total assets which will require further research initiatives.

The Key Words: banking, credit, agriculture, consumer, service, transportation, housing construction and industrial cooperatives.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT



In the name of Allah, the most Gracious and Most Merciful. Praise to Allah S.W.T. The Creator and Guardian of the universe. Praise and peace be upon Prophet Muhammad S.A.W,the last messenger of Allah, his family and his companions, from whom we gain the enlightenment.

"Alhamdulillah!!"

Finally, I have managed to complete my research paper on time. First and foremost, praises and thanks to Allah S.W.T. For His bounties of blessing throughout my research paper in order to complete the research successfully. And also peace been upon to the Prophet Muhammad S.A.W, as Messenger.

I wish to express my utmost gratitude to my beloved supervisors Dr. Selamah Maamor and Prof. Dato' Sukor Kasim Jazakala Allah kahir in this world and hereafter for their supervision, support, valuable advice, critics and encouragement during the entire progression of the dissertation. I also express my appreciation to my parents Jama Abdullah and my beloved mother Amina Hassan Osman, my siblings and also my beloved uncles Mohammad Abdullah and Abdi Abdullah for giving me the incessant care and affection that gave me strength in completing my research. I really appreciate it till the rest of my life. Thank you to my siblings, lecturers and friends for all the encouragement and support during my study.

At last, I also would like to express my uncle Mohammad Abdullah for providing the opportunities as well as the scholarship during my undergraduate and post graduate. May Allah S.W.T give you the best reward to from this world and hereafter.

Abdiqani Jama Abdullahi Burao, Somali Land abdiqaani@gmail.com

TABLE OF CONTENT

CERTIFICATION OF THESIS WORK	II
PERMISSION TO USE	III
ABSTRACTS	IV
ACKNOWLEGEMENT	V
LIST OF TABLES.	XII
LIST OF FIGURES	XIII
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	X
CHAPTER ONE: BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.1.1 The Parameters of the Malaysian Cooperative Ranking System	3
1.2 Problem Statement	4
1.3 Research Questions	5
1.4 Research Objective.	7
1.5 Scope of the Study	8
1.5 Scope of the Study.1.6 Significant of the Study.	8 9

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction.	12
2.2 A Review of the parameters.	17
2.3 Meaning of cooperatives.	22
24 The role and importance of cooperatives industry	23
2.5 Previous literature on concept of cooperative industry	23
2.6 The Malaysian cooperatives ranking system.	27
2.7Summary of the chapter	28
CHAPTER THREE: RESEACH METHODOLOGY	
3.1 Introduction	29
3.2 Data collection method.	30
3.3 Sample Design.	31
3.4 Population.	31
3.5 Analysis Technique	31
3.6 The parameter of the Malaysian cooperatives ranking system	32
3.7 Creating the data based for the comparative analysis.	32
3.8 Data based for the class analysis.	39
3.9 Data based for the pattern performance of cooperatives institution in Malaysia	41
3.10 Conclusion.	41
CHAPTER FOUR: FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION	
4.1 Introduction	42
4.2 The Performance of the Cooperative Sectors in the Malaysia Ranking System	51
4.3 A Sectorial Analysis of the Cooperative Movement.	56
4.4 Conclusion Remarks	144

CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMONDATION

5.1 Introduction	150
5.2 5.2 Uneven Growth of Cooperative Entities in the Malaysian Cooperatives	153
5.3 Discussion of the findings	159
5.4 Recommendation of study	163
5.4 Suggestion for the future research	165
References	166
Appendix: A	172
Appendix: B	174
Appendix: C	176
Appendix: D	178
Appendix: E	180
Appendix: F	182

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1 Evolution of total membership in general cooperative distribution	34
Table 3.2 Evolution of share capital in general cooperative distribution.	36
Table 3.3 Evolution of Revenue in general cooperative distribution.	37
Table 3.4 Evolution of Total Assets Value in general cooperative distribution	38
Table 3.5 Distributions of top 100 Cooperatives by Class Analysis in the Malaysia Ranking System	40
Table 4.1 Class Analysis of the top 100 Cooperatives by Sectors in SKM, 2014	55
Table 4.2 Distribution of Total Number of Cooperatives by Sectors by Year, 2009-2014.	144
Table 4.3 Percentage of the top 100 cooperatives by Sectors by Year of Ranking within 6 years	147
Table 4.4 Distribution of the top 100 cooperatives by the Number of Cooperatives within 6 years	148

LIST OF FEGURES

Figure 1.1 Distribution of cooperatives by sectors 2009 -2014.	2
Figure 3.1 The Distribution of number cooperatives by sector2009 -2014	33
Figure 4.1.1 The Growth of the Cooperative Entities from 2009 – 2014	44
Figure 4.1.2 Evolution of total membership in 2009 – 2014.	45
Figure 4.1.3 Evolution of Share in Capital in 2009 – 2014.	47
Figure 4.1.4 Evolution of Revenue 2009 – 2014	49
Figure 4.1.5 Evolution of Total Assets in 2009- 2014.	50
Figure 4.3.1.1 Evolution in term of number of cooperatives in banking sectors within 6 years	57
Figure 4.3.1.2 Growth of Membership in banking sector within 6 years	59
Figure 4.3.1.3 Evolution of shares in term of banking sectors within 6 years	61
Figure 4.3.1.4 Evolution of revenue in term of banking sector within 6 years	63
Figure 4.3.1.5 Evolution of total assets in term of banking sector within 6 years	64
Figure 4.3.2.1 Evolution of credit sector in term of number of cooperatives within 6 year	66
Figure 4.3.2.2 Evolution of members in term of credit sectors within 6 years	68
Figure 4.3.2.3 Evolution of shares in tem of credit sectors within 6 years	70
Figure 4.3.2.4 Evolution of revenue in term of credit sectors between 2009n -2014	71
Figure 4.3.2.5 Evolution of total assets in term of credit sectors between 2009 – 2014	73
Figure 4.3.3.1 The Pattern of growth in the number of agricultural cooperatives in 2009 – 2014	76
Figure 4.3.3.2 Evolution of membership in term of agriculture sectors within 6 years	78
Figure 4.3.3.3 Evolution of shares in term of agriculture sectors within 6 years	80
Figure 4.3.3.4 Evolution of revenue in term of agriculture's sectors within 6 years period	82
Figure 4.3.3.5 Evolution of total asset in term of agricultures between 2009 – 2014	84
Figure 4.3.4.1 Growth of consumer in term of number cooperative within 6 years	87
Figure 4.3.4.2 Evolution growth in term of members in consumers sectors within 6 years	89
Figure 4.3.4.3 Growth number of shares in term of consumer sectors in 2009 – 2014	90
Figure 4.3.4.4 Growth number of revenue in term of consumer sector in 2009 – 2014	92
Figure 4.3.4.5 Growth of asset in term of consumer sectors in 2009 t-2014	94
Figure 4.3.5.1 Evolution of housing sectors in term of number of cooperatives within 6 years	97
Figure 4.3.5.2 Evolution of membership in term of housing sector in 2009 – 2014	99
Figure 4.3.5.3 Evolution of shares in term of housing sectors in 2009 -2014	100
Figure 4.3.5.4 The Evolution of Revenue in term housing Cooperative Movement 2009-2014	102
Figure 4.3.5.5 The pattern of growth of total assets in term of housing 2009 – 2014	103

Figure 4.3.6.1 Evolution of number of cooperatives in term of Service sectors within 6 years	106
Figure 4.3.6.2 Evolution of members in term of service sectors between 2009 – 2014	108
Figure 4.3.6.3 Evolution of shares capital in term of service sectors in 2009 – 2014	110
Figure 4.3.6.4 Evolution of Revenue in term of Service Movement in 2009 -2014	112
Figure 4.3.6.5 Evolution of total assets in term of Service sectors between 2009 – 2014	114
Figure 4.3.7.1 Evolution of number of cooperatives in industrial within 6 years	117
Figure 4.3.7.2 Evolution of membership in term of industrial sectors within 6 years	119
Figure 4.3.7.3 Evolution of shares in term of industrial sectors within 6 years	120
Figure 4.3.7.4 Evolution of revenue in term of industrial sectors within 6 years	121
Figure 4.3.7.5 Evolution of total in term of industrial sectors between 2009 to 2014	123
Figure 4.3.8.1 Evolution of number of cooperatives in term of transportation within 6 years	125
Figure 4.3.8.2 Evolution of membership in term of transportation between 2009 -2014	127
Figure 4.3.8.3 Evolution of shares in term of transportation sectors within 6 years	129
Figure 4.3.8.4 Evolution of revenue in term of transportation within 6 years period	131
Figure 4.3.8.5 Evolution of total asset in term of transportation sectors within 6 years period	133
Figure 4.3.9.1 Evolution of total assets in term of constructions sectors within 6 years	136
Figure 4.3.9.2 Evolution of membership in term of construction within 6 years	137
Figure 4.3.9.3 Evolution of shares in term of construction sector within 6 years	138
Figure 4.3.9.4 Evolution of revenue in term of constructions sector within 6 years	140
Figure 4.3.9.5 Evolution of total asset in term of constructions sectors within 6 years period	142

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AS Asset Share

BNM Bank Negara Malaysia

BC Banking Cooperative

BNM Bank Negara Malaysia

CC Credit Cooperative

CCB Cooperative Central Bank

CCM Cooperative Commission Malaysia

CSH Capital Share

CI Cooperative Industry

DFIA Development Financial Institution Act

ICB Islamic Cooperative Bank

KEA Key Economic Area

MCSC Malaysian Cooperative Society Commission

ROA Return on Asset

RS Revenue Share

SKM Suruhanjaya Koperasi Malaysia

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of study

Since the 19th century, the cooperative movement has become an important endeavor towards improving the benefits and livelihood of millions of members across the globe. According to United Nation's Secretariat Department of Economic and Social Affairs Division for Social Policy and Development by 2014, the world witnessed the establishment of over 2.6 million cooperatives with over 1 billion in total membership.

Malaysia's experience in the cooperative movement started in 1922 with the first cooperative, a credit cooperative that was registered as the Postal and Telecommunications Cooperative Thrift And Loan Society Limited. A year later (1923), Syarikat Kampung Teluk Haji Musa Bekerjasamasama Dengan Tanggungan Berhad, Parit Buntar Krian, Perak was registered. From a single activity such as credit or rice milling, the cooperative movement had diversified into a range of business activities such as banking, industrial, construction, consumer, housing, transport, land development and agricultural production that benefited their members. Thus by the end of 2014, Malaysia has recorded a total of 11,871 cooperatives in 9 major sectors as noted by the Cooperative Commission of Malaysia (SKM).

The contents of the thesis is for internal user only

REFFERENCES

- Asch off, G. (1982). The Banking principles of Hermann schulze-Delitzsch and Friedrich Wilhelm Raiffeisen. *In German Yearbook on Business History 1982*(pp. 19-41). Springer Berlin Heidelberg done
- Angelini, P., & Cetorelli, N. (2003). The effects of regulatory reform on competition in the banking industry. *Journal of Money, credit and banking*, 663-684.
- Appiah-Adu, K., & Singh, S. (1998). Customer orientation and performance: a study of SMEs. *Management decision*, *36*(6), 385-394
- Algharaballi, E. (2013). Revenue management practices and subsequent firm performance of companies listing on the Kuwait Stock Exchange (KSE)(Doctoral dissertation, University of Southern Queensland).
- Ayadi, R., Llewellyn, D. T., Schmidt, R. H., Arbak, E., & Pieter De Groen, W. (2010). Investigating diversity in the banking sector in Europe: key developments, performance and role of cooperative banks.
- Appiah-Adu, K., & Singh, S. (1998). Customer orientation and performance: a study of SMEs. Management decision, 36(6), 385-394.
- Al-Hawari, M., & Ward, T. (2006). The effect of automated service quality on Australian banks' financial performance and the mediating role of customer satisfaction. Marketing Intelligence & Planning, 24(2), 127-147.
- Alkassim (2005). The profitability of Islamic and conventional banking in the GCC countries: *A comparative study. Journal of Review of Islamic Economics*, 13(1), 5-30.
- Akhter, W., Raza, A., & Akram, M. (2011). Efficiency and performance of Islamic banking: The case of Pakistan. *Far East Journal of Psychology and Business*, 2(2), 54-70
- Aburime, T. U. (2008). Determinants of bank profitability: company-level evidence from Nigeria. Available at SSRN 1106825.
- Almasri, S., Alnabhan, M., Hunaiti, Z., & Sedoyeka, E. (2009). Location-based services (LBS) in micro-scale navigation: shortcomings and recommendations. *International Journal of E-Services and Mobile Applications (IJESMA)*, 1(4), 51-71.
- Al-Hawari, M., & Ward, T. (2006). The effect of automated service quality on Australian banks' financial performance and the mediating role of customer satisfaction. *Marketing Intelligence & Planning*, 24(2), 127-147.
- Ashraf and Rehman (2011). Enhancing online performance through financial content and personalization. *Journal of financial analysis* 52(1), 3.

- Banerjee, A. V., Besley, T., & Guinnane, T. W. (1994). The neighbor's keeper: the design of a credit cooperative with theory and a test. The Quarterly Journal of Economics, 491-515.
- Binswanger, H. P., & Rosenzweig, M. R. (1986). Credit markets, wealth and endowments in rural south India. Research Unit, Agriculture and Rural Development, Operational Policy Staff, World Bank.
- Baier, S. L., Dwyer, G. P., & Tamura, R. (2006). How important are capital and total factor productivity for economic growth? *Economic Inquiry*, 44(1), 23-49.
- Burch, D., & Lawrence, G. (2009). Towards behind the Transformation. Agriculture and Human Values, 26(4), 267-279.
- Brunner, A. D. (2004). Germany's three-pillar banking system: cross-country perspectives in Europe (Vol. 233). International Monetary Fund.
- Buckley, P. J., Casson, M., Contractor, F. J., & Lorange, P. (1994). A theory of cooperation in international business. *Cooperative forms of transnational corporation activity*, 13, 91.
- Baig, M. A (2010) .Assessing the financial performance of investment banks in pakistan during the current financial crisis mirza asjad baig, muhammad ali usman, mirzaOwais Baig.
- Boubakri, N., & Cosset, J. C. (1998). The financial and operating performance of newly Privatized firms: Evidence from developing countries. The Journal of Finance, 53(3), 1081-1110.
- Bontis, N., Chua Chong Keow, W., & Richardson, S. (2000). Intellectual capital and business performance in Malaysian industries. *Journal of intellectual capital*, *1*(1), 85-100.
- Boubakri, N., & Cosset, J. C. (1998). The financial and operating performance of newly privatized firms: Evidence from developing countries. *The Journal of Finance*, *53*(3), 1081-1110.
- Clarida, R., Galı, J., & Gertler, M. (2002). A simple framework for international monetary policy analysis. Journal of Monetary Economics, 49(5), 879-904.
- Cantoni, F., Bello, M., & Frigerio, C. (2001). Lowering the Barriers to Knowledge Transfers and Dissemination: The Italian Cooperative Banks Experience. ECIS 2001 Proceedings, 10.
- Couture, M. F., Faber, D., Levin, M., & Nippierd, A. B. (Eds.). (2002). Transition to Cooperative Entrepreneurship: *Case Studies from Armenia, China, Ethiopia, Ghana, Poland, Russia, Uganda and Vietnam.*
- Cihák, M. M., & Hesse, H. (2007). Cooperative banks and financial stability. International Monetary Fund.
- De Carvalho, A. D. (2012). The cooperative development and strategy. *International Journal of Accounting and Financial Reporting*, 2(1), Pages-191.

- Di Salvo, R., Mazzilis, M. C., & Guidi, A. (2002), mergers and acquisitions between mutual banks in Italy: an analysis of the effects on performance and productive efficiency. *chapters in surf studies*, 45-72.
- Din, J. (2006). Applying Data Envelopment Analysis to Evaluate the Efficiency of cooperative Associations in Malaysia (Doctoral dissertation, Universiti Putra Malaysia).
- Feng, C. M., & Wang, R. T. (2001). Considering the financial ratios on the performance Evaluation of highway bus industry. Transport Reviews, 21(4), 449-467.
- Flamini, V., Schumacher, L., & McDonald, C. A. (2009). The determinants of commercial bank Profitability in Sub-Saharan Africa. International Monetary Fund.
- Fairbairn, B. (2002). How "Social" Are Co-ops? Tensions, Transitions, and the Social Economy of Co-operatives in Canada. *Économie et Solidarités*, *33*(1), 113.
- Greve, R. (2002). The German cooperative banking group as a strategic network: Function and Performance (No. 29). Arbeitspapiere des Instituts für Genossenschaftswesen der Westfälischen Wilhelms-Universität Münster.
- Gibson-Graham, J. K. (2005). Surplus possibilities: post development and community economies. *Singapore Journal of Tropical Geography*, 26(1), 4-26.
- Gul, S., Irshad, F., & Zaman, K. (2011). Factors affecting bank profitability in Pakistan. The Romanian Economic Journal, 39, 61-87.
- Guinnane, T. W. (2011). The early German credit cooperatives and microfinance organizations today: similarities and differences. The Handbook of Microfinance, Singapore, Hackensack, London, 77-100.
- Hesse, Heiko, and Martin Cihak (2007). Cooperative banks and financial stability.
- Hassan, M. K., & Kayed, R. N. (2009). The global financial crisis, risk management and social justice in Islamic finance. *ISRA Journal of Islamic Finance, Forthcoming*.
- Hutton, C. W., Hill, C. T., & Clark, M. J. (2015). Modified Sustainable of asset ratio Framework (MSLF): A *tool for monitoring and assessing GIAHS sites*.
- Idris, & Abdullah, a. m. (2011). Evaluation of factors affecting agricultural cooperatives performance in Malaysia in proceedings of the 2nd *international conference on business and economics*, holiday villa beach resort and spa, langkawi, kedah, march (pp. 14-16).
- Ismail, S., & Ahmad, M. S. (2012). Emergence of personal knowledge management processes within multi-agent roles. *In Knowledge Management and Acquisition for Intelligent Systems* (pp. 221-228). Springer Berlin Heidelberg.
- Johnson, J. L., Cullen, J. B., Sakano, T., & Takenouchi, H. (1996). Setting the stage for trust and strategic integration in Japanese-US cooperative alliances. *Journal of international business studies*, 981-1004.
- Jensen, M. C. (1968). The performance of mutual funds in the period 1945–1964. *The Journal of Finance*, 23(2), 389-416.

- Jha, S., & Hui, X. (2012). A comparison of financial performance of commercial banks: A case study of Nepal. *African Journal of Business Management*, 6(25), 7601.
- Jeucken, M. (2010). Sustainable finance and banking: the financial sector and the future of the planet. Routledge.
- Karels, G. V., & Prakash, A. J. (1987). Asset share and forecasting of business bankruptcy. *Journal of Business Finance & Accounting*, 14(4), 573-593.
- Kyriakopoulos, K., Meulenberg, M., & Nilsson, J. (2004). The impact of cooperative structure and firm culture on market orientation and performance. Agribusiness, 20(4), 379-396.
- Karels, G. V., & Prakash, A. J. (1987). Financial performance and forecasting of business bankruptcy. Journal of Business Finance & Accounting, 14(4), 573-593.
- Khaliq, A., & Kazmi, A. (2011). Bank Rakyat Malaysia: vision remains while mission is revisited. *IIUM Journal of Case Studies in Management*, 2(1), 41-48.
- Laidlaw, A. F. (1980). Co-operatives in the Year 2000. International Co-operative Alliance.
- Lipton, M. (1976). *Agricultural finance and rural credit in poor countries*. World Development, 4(7), 543-553.
- Ledgerwood, J., & White, V. (2006). Transforming microfinance institutions: providing full financial services to the poor. World Bank Publications.
- Mustapa, K. M., Saadah, Y., & ARM, J. Factors contributing to success to the excellent credit cooperatives in Malaysia.
- Mohieldin, M., Iqbal, Z., Rostom, A. M., & Fu, X. (2011). The role of Islamic finance in enhancing financial inclusion in Organization of Islamic Cooperation (OIC) countries. *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper Series*, Vol.
- Mayo, E. (2011). Co-operative performance. Sustainability accounting, management and policy *Journal*, 2(1), 158-164.
- Majee, W., & Hoyt, A. (2011). Cooperatives and community development: A perspective on the use of cooperatives in development. Journal of community practice, 19(1), 48-61.
- Nawai, N., & Bashir, M. S. (2009). Evaluation of micro credit program for poverty alleviation: a case of Amanah Ikhtiar Malaysia (AIM).
- Maharaj (2002). Bank mergers and acquisitions in the United States 1990-1997: an analysis of shareholders value creation and premium paid to integrate with megabanks. Universal-Publishers.
- Merton, R. C. (1973). An intertemporal capital asset pricing model. *Econometrica: Journal of the Econometric Society*, 867-887.
- Othman, A., Mansor, N., & Kari, F. (2014). Assessing the performance of co-operatives in Malaysia: an analysis of co-operative groups using a data envelopment analysis approach. Asia Pacific Business Review, 20(3), 484-505.

- Othman, A. (2014). Essays on the co-operatives' performances in Malaysia/Azmah binti Othman (Doctoral dissertation, University of Malaya).
- Othman, A., Kari, F., Jani, R., & Hamdan, R. (2012). Factors influencing cooperative membership and share increment: an application of the logistic regression analysis in the Malaysian cooperatives. World review of business research, 2(5).
- Raza, A., Farhan, M., & Akram, M. (2011). A comparison of financial performance in investment banking sector in Pakistan. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, 2(9), 72-81.
- Rokhman, W. (2014). Baitul Mal Wat Tamwil (Bmt) And Poverty Empowerment. QIJIS, 1(2).
- Sehrish, S., Saleem, F., Yasir, M., Shehzad, F., & Ahmed, K. (2012). Financial performance analysis of Islamic banks and conventional banks in Pakistan: *A comparative study*. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Contemporary Research in Business*, 4(5), 186.
- Samad, A., & Hassan, M. K. (1999). The performance of Malaysian Islamic bank during 1984-1997: an exploratory study. *International Journal of Islamic Financial Services*, 1(3), 1-14.
- Salleh, H. M. (2011). Co-operative governance index (co-opgi) and its application in credit co-operatives in Malaysia (doctoral dissertation, Universiti technology Mara).
- Samad, A., & Hassan, M. K. (1999). The performance of Malaysian Islamic bank during 1984-1997: an exploratory study. *International Journal of Islamic Financial Services*, 1(3), 14.
- Sekaran, U. Roger Bougie. 2009. Research Method for Business, A Skill Building Approach.
- Sabitha and Zakaria, R. H. B., & Rahman, A. A. (2006). Financially stressed employees at workplace: A Malaysian perspective. International Journal of Research in Social Sciences, 2(2), 350-363.