A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF PAKISTANI & BRITISH NEWSPAPERS’ EDITORIALS ON THE COVERAGE OF ‘WAR ON TERROR’

AASIMA SAFDAR

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
UNIVERSITI UTARA MALAYSIA
2015
Permission to Use

In presenting this thesis in fulfilment of the requirements for a postgraduate degree from Universiti Utara Malaysia, I agree that the Universiti Library may make it freely available for inspection. I further agree that permission for the copying of this thesis in any manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purpose may be granted by my supervisor(s) or, in their absence, by the Dean of Awang Had Salleh Graduate School of Arts and Sciences. It is understood that any copying or publication or use of this thesis or parts thereof for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission. It is also understood that due recognition shall be given to me and to Universiti Utara Malaysia for any scholarly use which may be made of any material from my thesis.

Requests for permission to copy or to make other use of materials in this thesis, in whole or in part, should be addressed to:

Dean of Awang Had Salleh Graduate School of Arts and Sciences
UUM College of Arts and Sciences
Universiti Utara Malaysia
06010 UUM Sintok
ABSTRAK

Perang terhadap keganasan (WoT) oleh Amerika telah menjadi isu penting dalam liputan media bukan sahaja di Amerika Syarikat (AS) tetapi juga di seluruh dunia. Kajian terdahulu menunjukkan bahawa media Barat, terutamanya media AS menggambarkan peristiwa yang memihak kepada dasar AS. Mereka menekankan kepada sudut pandangan kerajaan AS, justifikasi perang dan unjuran kempen ketenteraan, manakala liputan terhad diberikan kepada kesan buruk perang dan hujah kritikal berhubung WoT. Sebaliknya, media di negara lain yang tidak menyokong polisi perang AS dari segi politik seperti Jepun dan negara Timur Tengah mengetengahkan isu mengenai tragedi manusia, kerosakan harta benda dan sudut pandang yang berbeza. Justeru, kajian ini memfokuskan kepada analisis perbandingan akhbar Pakistan dan Britain mengenai liputan WoT. Secara khususnya, kajian ini menggariskan tiga objektif: (i) untuk menerangkan kepelbagaian liputan WoT di antara akhbar Pakistan dan Britain; (ii) untuk mengenal pasti pembingkaian media dan agenda berbeza yang digunakan untuk pelaporan WoT; dan (iii) untuk menyelidik pematuhan media terhadap dasar luar negara berkenaan. Analisis tema bagi editorial dua akhbar Pakistan dan dua akhbar Britain mendapati akhbar Pakistan dan Britain menggunakan pendirian bertentangan terhadap WoT dan membingkai isu perang kebanyakannya dalam bingkai anti-perang. Walau bagaimanapun, pada masa tertentu, akhbar Britain menyatakan pendirian menyokong dan neutral terhadap dasar kerajaan Britain mengenai WoT. Akhbar Pakistan menentang WoT sepenuhnya dan mengkritik sokongan kerajaan Pakistan terhadap perang. Akhbar Pakistan lebih agresif dan membangkang WoT berbanding akhbar Britain. Kajian ini menyumbang kepada teori pembingkaian dan penetapan agenda, yang mana ia menekankan bagaimana WoT telah dibingkai secara berbeza oleh media dua negara berbeza dan apa isu-isu berbeza yang telah dipilih sebagai agenda media mereka. Kajian ini juga telah membincangkan mengenai perspektif masyarakat Islam dan Barat berkaitan pembingkaian WoT. Kajian ini turut menyumbang kefahaman berhubung liputan media mengenai WoT berdasarkan faktor sosial dan politik.

Kata kunci: Pembingkaian media, Penetapan agenda, Perang terhadap Keganasan, Akhbar Pakistan dan British, Pematuhan media.
ABSTRACT

America’s War on Terror (WoT) had been a crucial issue of media coverage not only in the United States (US) but all over the world. Previous studies revealed that the Western media, particularly the US media portrayed the events in favour of US policies. They stressed upon the US government’s viewpoint, justifications of war and projected military campaign, whereas a limited amount of coverage was given to the consequences of war and critical arguments on WoT. In contrast, the media in other countries that did not politically support the US policies of war such as Japan and Middle Eastern countries highlighted human tragedy, property damage and oppositional viewpoints. Hence, this study focused on a comparative analysis of Pakistani and British newspapers regarding the coverage of WoT. Specifically, the research outlined three objectives: (i) to explain the diversities between the Pakistani and British newspapers regarding the coverage of WoT; (ii) to identify the different media frames and agendas that were employed for the reporting of WoT; and (iii) to examine media conformity to the foreign policy of their respective countries. A thematic analysis of two Pakistani and two British newspapers editorials found that the Pakistani and British press adopted oppositional stance against the WoT and framed the war mostly in anti-war frame. However, at certain times, the British press expressed supportive and neutral stance towards the policies of British government regarding the WoT. The Pakistani press was completely against the WoT and criticized the Pakistan government’s support for the war. The Pakistani press appeared to be more aggressive and oppositional against WoT than the British newspapers. This study contributes to framing and agenda setting theories, in which it highlighted on how the WoT was framed differently by the press of two different countries and what different issues were selected as their media agenda. This study also discussed about the Muslim and Western society perspectives on the framing of WoT. This study provides understanding on the influence of social and political factors towards media coverage on WoT. This research also contributes on the understanding of media coverage on WoT with regards to social and political factors.

Keywords: Media framing, Agenda setting, War on Terror, Pakistani and British press, Media conformity.
Acknowledgement

All commendation and appreciation for Allah who created this world for the sake of His Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) and chose us as His true followers. With the help of Almighty Allah, I am able to accomplish my research.

I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisors, Dr. Adrian Budiman and Dr. Norsiah Abdul Hamid. Both helped me at every step and encouraged me to accomplish my PhD journey.

I would also like to thank Dr. Khairi who guided me a lot during my PhD especially the use of Nvivo for qualitative data analysis, and gave his valuable comments regarding qualitative research.

Moreover, I would like to thank my husband, parents-in-laws and brothers for supporting and encourgng me during my studies.

Lastly, I would like to thank my Baba Jee Syed Safdar Ali Bukhari who always loved me and supported me. Without his support, it was difficult for me to accomplish my PhD journey.
# Table of Contents

Permission to use........................................................................................................i
Abstrak ......................................................................................................................ii
Abstract....................................................................................................................iii
Acknowledgement....................................................................................................iv
Table of contents.......................................................................................................v
List of Tables..............................................................................................................x
List of Figures..........................................................................................................xi
List of Appendices....................................................................................................xiii

## CHAPTER ONE  INTRODUCTION.................................................................................1

1.1 Background of the study.................................................................1
  1.1.1 September 11, attacks and US response...........................................2
  1.1.2 Media coverage of 9/11 attacks and war on terror..........................6
  1.1.3 British media and war on terror......................................................10
  1.1.4 Pakistani media and war on terror..................................................12

1.2 Statement of the Problem........................................................................14

1.3 Research Questions....................................................................................22

1.4 Research Objectives....................................................................................23

1.5 Operational definitions............................................................................24
  1.5.1 Frame..............................................................................................24
  1.5.2 Agenda setting..................................................................................26
  1.5.3 War on terror...................................................................................26
  1.5.4 Quality newspapers.........................................................................26
  1.5.5 Editorial..........................................................................................27
  1.5.6 Pakistani and British Public.............................................................27

1.6 Research Significance..............................................................................27

1.7 Limitation of Study..................................................................................30

1.8 Theoretical framework............................................................................31
  1.8.1 Media Framing................................................................................33
  1.8.2 Agenda setting................................................................................36
4.5.3 UNO........................................................................................................227
4.5.4 British dossier on Iraq .................................................................231
4.5.5 Terrorism..........................................................................................236
4.5.6 Al-Qaeda..........................................................................................239
4.5.7 Islam and the Muslims after 9/11.................................................242
4.5.8 Freedom of press.............................................................................244
4.6 Opinion of British Informants regarding the War on Terror ..........247
4.7 Conclusion.........................................................................................258

CHAPTER FIVE   FRAMING OF ‘WAR ON TERROR’ BY THE PAKISTANI
NEWSPAPERS.................................................................260

5.1 Introduction.......................................................................................260
5.2 Framing of “War on Terror” by Pakistani press .......................260
   5.2.1 ‘War on Terror’...........................................................................267
   5.2.2 Afghanistan attack 2001...........................................................274
   5.2.3 Iraq attack 2003...........................................................................283
5.3 Media Frames...................................................................................298
   5.3.1 Anti war Frame.........................................................................298
   5.3.2 Rebuilding Frame......................................................................305
   5.3.3 Humanitarian Frame.................................................................311
5.4 Media conformity to the foreign policy........................................317
5.5 Issues discussed by the Pakistani newspapers .......................334
   5.5.1 Pakistan’s Role in War on Terror .............................................336
   5.5.2 Criticism on the United States..................................................341
   5.5.3 Pakistan US relations after 9/11...............................................344
   5.5.4 Terrorism in Pakistan.................................................................348
   5.5.5 Pakistan Afghanistan relations after 9/11.................................352
   5.5.6 Talks with Taliban......................................................................355
   5.5.7 Prisoners of war.........................................................................358
   5.5.8 US interests in the Middle East..................................................361
   5.5.9 Islamic Community and War on Terror ...................................365
CHAPTER SIX    DISCUSSION.................................................................385

6.1  Introduction..................................................................................385
6.2  Research Question........................................................................486
6.3  Discussion.....................................................................................387
   6.3.1  Stance of coverage.................................................................387
          6.3.1.1  Negative themes by British newspapers.....................388
          6.3.1.2  Neutral themes by British newspapers.....................394
          6.3.1.3  Positive themes by British newspapers.....................396
          6.3.1.4  Negative themes by Pakistani newspapers...............398
          6.3.1.5  Neutral themes by Pakistani newspapers...............408
          6.3.1.6  Positive themes by Pakistani newspapers..............411
   6.3.2  Media Frames..........................................................................413
          6.3.2.1  Media frames by British press in the coverage of war
                   on terror.......................................................................413
          6.3.2.2  Media frames by Pakistani press in the coverage of
                   war on terror.....................................................................420
   6.3.3  Difference between British and Pakistani coverage on War on
          Terror ......................................................................................428
   6.3.4  Prominent issues relating to War on Terror ..........................434
   6.3.5  Agenda setting by Pakistani and British press regarding War on
          Terror.......................................................................................444
   6.3.6  Media conformity to foreign policy........................................452
   6.3.7  Opinion of British and Pakistani informants regarding
          War on Terror...........................................................................457

6.4  Contribution to Knowledge............................................................461
6.5  Limitation of the study.................................................................466
6.6  Suggestions for further studies....................................................467
6.7  Conclusion....................................................................................468

REFERENCES .....................................................................................469
List of Tables

Table 3.1 Phases of thematic analysis ............................................................123
Table 3.2 Inductive and deductive themes ..................................................132
Table 3.3 Number of editorials analyzed ....................................................135
Table 4.1 Prominent issues of War on Terror highlighted by British press ....219
Table 5.1 Prominent issues of the War on Terror highlighted by Pakistani press ....335
Table 6.1 Prominent issues from Pakistani and British press ......................434
List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Framing process..................................................................................................................35
Figure 1.2: Agenda setting....................................................................................................................37
Figure 1.3: Conceptual frame work for framing the war on terror..................................................38
Figure 1.4: Agenda setting process....................................................................................................39
Figure 1.5: Integrated frame work.....................................................................................................40
Figure 3.1: Structure of a thematic network.......................................................................................125
Figure 4.1: Stance of Coverage by British press on War on Terror..............................................151
Figure 4.2: Thematic model of anti war frame by the British newspapers.................................188
Figure 4.3: Thematic model of rebuilding frame by the British newspapers..............................195
Figure 4.4: Thematic model of humanitarian frame by the British newspapers..................200
Figure 4.5: Thematic model of pro war frame by the British newspapers.................................205
Figure 4.7: Media Conformity to Foreign Policy, Coverage of War on Terror by the British press..........................................................................................................................209
Figure 4.8: Thematic model on media conformity of the British press on the coverage of war on terror..........................................................................................................................217
Figure 4.9: Thematic model on the prominent issues identified by the British press..................218
Figure 4.10: Thematic model on the interviews of British informants...........................................248
Figure 5.1: Stance of Coverage by Pakistani and British press on War on Terror..................266
Figure 5.2: Thematic model of Nvivo regarding anti war frame......................................................299
Figure 5.3: Thematic model of Nvivo regarding rebuilding frame...............................................306
Figure 5.4: Thematic model of Nvivo regarding humanitarian frame.............................................312
Figure 5.5: Media Conformity to Foreign Policy on the coverage of War on Terror by Pakistani newspapers.................................................................320

Figure 5.6: Thematic model of Nvivo on media conformity of Pakistani press regarding the coverage of war on terror.................................................................333

Figure 5.7: Thematic model on the prominent issues regarding War on Terror by the coverage of Pakistani newspapers.........................................................335

Figure 5.8: Thematic model on the interviews of Pakistani informants...............370
List of Appendix

Appendix A  Newspapers bibliography..................................................505
Appendix B  Pakistani and British informants........................................535
Appendix C  Interview Protocol..............................................................539
Appendix D  Time line events: War on terror..........................................542
CHAPTER ONE
INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of the Study

The September 11 attacks have had a substantial impact on the history of United States since the war of 1812 or Japanese strike on Pearl Harbour in 1941 (Lansford, Watson, Robert & Covarrubias, 2009) which consequently, led the ‘war on terror’ later on. The media provided unprecedented coverage to the incident by reporting spectacular images, prominent personalities and human tragedy (Monahan, 2010). Within a limited time span the news channels were loaded with the stories of terrorist attacks. As Debatin (2002) observed; “The whole world was watching the events in real time or very shortly after the events occurred” (p. 165). Moreover, “thousands of hours of television and radio programming and an immeasurable amount of print-based reportage and commentary in newspapers and magazines and on the Internet were devoted to the attacks” (Monahan, 2010, p. 11). The news channels created live pictures in front of its spectators. Reaction to this tragedy ranged from “unprecedented responses of sympathy and empathetic support” to “elation and celebration” (Hacten & Scotton, 2002, p. ix). Several studies illustrated that after 9/11 attacks the people moved towards media for getting latest information (Abel, Miller & Filak 2005; Carey, 2003; Greenberg, Hofschire & Lachlan, 2002).
The contents of the thesis is for internal user only
References


Johnson, C. A., (2003, January 3). War; agenda unmasked; deposing Hussain was a distant dream for administration officials_ until 9/11. Los Angeles Times.


