REGIONAL INTEGRATION IN THE ARABIAN PENINSULA AND THE GULF: INVESTIGATION OF THE DYNAMICS AND CHALLENGES BEHIND YEMEN’S FAILURE TO JOIN THE GULF COOPERATION COUNCIL FOR THE ARAB GULF STATES (GCC)

SALEH MUBARAK SALEH BAZEAD

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

UNIVERSITI UTARA MALAYSIA

May, 2015
REGIONAL INTEGRATION IN THE ARABIAN PENINSULA AND THE GULF: INVESTIGATION OF THE DYNAMICS AND CHALLENGES BEHIND YEMEN’S FAILURE TO JOIN THE GULF COOPERATION COUNCIL FOR THE ARAB GULF STATES (GCC)

By

Saleh Mubarak Saleh Bazead

Thesis submitted to Ghazali Shafie Graduate School of Government, Universiti Utara Malaysia in fulfillment of the Requirement for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

May, 2015
PERMISSION TO USE

In presenting this thesis as a fulfillment of the requirement for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D) of Universiti Utara Malaysia, I hereby agree that the Library of the University may have free access to this thesis for use. I also agree that permission to copy the thesis in any form, in whole or some parts and portions of it. For academic purposes, may be granted by the Supervisor of the thesis, Dr. Mohd Azizuddin Mohd Sani, or in his absence, by the dean of the College of Law, Government and International Studies to which this thesis is submitted.

It is understood that any copying or publication or any kind of use of this thesis or part of it, therefore for the purpose of financial gains shall not be allowed without the prior notice or permission from the authorized persons or college. Similarly, due recognition shall be given to me and the Universiti Utara Malaysia for any scholarly use which may be made of any of the materials presented in this thesis.

Request for permission to copy or make use of material in this thesis in whole or in part shall be addressed to:

Dean
College of Law, Government and international Studies,
Universiti Utara Malaysia
06010
Kedah Darul Aman
ABSTRAK

Republik Yaman telah menyatakan kesediaan dan menyuarakan aspirasinya untuk menyertai Majlis Kerjasama Teluk (GCC) iaitu organisasi berpengaruh politik dan keselamatan bagi rantau Teluk Parsi. GCC juga telah menilai kesediaan Yaman lantas memberikan hujah bahawa Yaman gagal menganggotai GCC adalah kerana Yaman masih berhadapan dengan pelbagai masalah politik, ekonomi dan keselamatan domestik. Namun pandangan ini ditolak kerajaan Yaman yang beranggapan bahawa kegagalan Yaman untuk menyertai GCC adalah kerana Yaman sebagai negara republik dianggap mampu memberi persaingan kekuatan kepada kerajaan monarki Arab Saudi dan negara-negara Teluk lain serta menggugat keseimbangan di rantau Teluk Parsi. Oleh itu, kajian ini cuba menyelidiki masalah sebenar kegagalan Yaman menyertai GCC dan implikasi kepada kemasukan Yaman ke dalam organisasi tersebut. Maka objektif kajian ini adalah untuk menentukan punca dan aspek kegagalan Yaman untuk berintegrasi penuh di kalangan negara-negara Semenanjung Arab dan Teluk Parsi serta menjadi ahli penuh kepada GCC. Tambah lagi, kajian ini cuba untuk mengenal pasti faktor dan cara penyelesaian yang membolehkan Yaman menyertai keanggotaan GCC tersebut. Kajian ini juga menilai impak hubungan antara Yaman dengan negara-negara GCC selain penglibatan kuasa politik serantau dan antarabangsa seperti Mesir, Iran dan Amerika Syarikat yang mempengaruhi tindakan integrasi antara Yaman dan GCC. Kaedah kajian ini menggunakan pendekatan penyelidikan kualitatif secara kajian perpustakaan dan arkib serta temubual dengan aktor-aktor yang terlibat langsung di dalam proses memohon keanggotaan GCC dan hubungan antara Yaman dan negara-negara anggota GCC. Teori Fungsionalisme dan Neo-Functionalisme telah digunakan untuk mengkaji hubungan antara Yaman dan GCC khususnya berkaitan isu keanggotaan tersebut. Hasil dapatan kajian menunjukkan bahawa kegagalan Yaman untuk menyertai GCC adalah bermotifkan faktor politik dan sosio-ekonomi. Dengan tidak menyertai GCC, Yaman akan dipastikan untuk terus mundur dari segi sosio-ekonomi dan tidak mampu untuk menyaingi kekuatan Arab Saudi sebagai kuasa politik serantau yang mendominasi GCC. Selain itu, Yaman juga berada di dalam percaturan politik serantau Teluk yang berhadapan dengan pengaruh dan kuasa Iran. Oleh itu, dengan campurtangan kuasa besar seperti Amerika Syarikat (AS) di Yaman membolehkan kedudukan Arab Saudi diperkuatkan bagi menyaingi Iran dan Yaman terus berada di bawah pengaruh serta telunjuk Arab Saudi dan AS.

Kata Kunci: Yaman, GCC, Arab Saudi, Functionalisme, integrasi serantau, Teluk Parsi
ABSTRACT

The Republic of Yemen was signalling its readiness to join the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC), an influential political and security organisation in Persian Gulf. GCC had also evaluated the readiness of Yemen, but decided that Yemen was not ready to become a new member of GCC because of domestic political, economical and security reasons. In response, the Yemeni government rejected the argument saying that the real reason was Yemen as a republic was perceived as a rival that will create political imbalance regionally to the monarchy governments of Saudi Arabia and other Gulf states. Therefore, this research aims to study the actual reasons behind the Yemen’s failed attempts to integrate fully in the Arab Peninsular and Persian Gulf and to become member of GCC. The objectives of this research are to determine reasons and aspects of Yemen’s failure to get GCC membership. Furthermore, this research tries to identify factors and ways to overcome this membership’s hurdle for Yemen. In addition, this research also evaluates the impact of relations between Yemen and GCC member states, besides the involvement of regional and global powers like Egypt, Iran and United States (US) in influencing Yemeni integration with GCC. This research utilises qualitative method through library and archival researches and interviews with actors who were directly involved or participated in the process of applying for GCC membership and Yemen-GCC relations. Theories of Functionalism and Neo-Functionalism are employed to analyse the Yemen-GCC relations especially on the membership issue. Findings of this research show that the failed attempts by Yemen to obtain GCC membership were politically and socio-economically motivated. By refusing to allow Yemen membership into GCC, Yemen was left to remain poor and be deprived in socio-economy in order to ensure it will not challenge the mighty Saudi Arabia as regional power that dominates the GCC. Moreover, Yemen is also at the forefront of Gulf regional politics against the influence and power of Iran. Hence, US intervention in Yemen will assist and strengthen Saudi Arabia in facing Iran and Yemen remains under the influence of Saudi Arabia and the US.

Keywords: Yemen, GCC, Saudi Arabia, Functionalism, regional integration, Persian Gulf.
ACKNOWLEDGMENT

I praise and thank Allah for granting me strength and courage to complete this PhD thesis successfully.

In completing this study, I am extremely thankful to my supervisor, Doctor Mohammad Azizuddin Mohammed Sani, whose encouragement, guidance and support from the initial to the final stage enabled me to understand and go through this research. Without his invaluable support, this thesis would be very hard to see its completion.

I am grateful to my big family (beloved parents, brothers, my beloved wife, uncles, and friends and colleagues) for encouraging me to finish my studies, particularly my parents, brothers, for their prayers, patience, and continuous love and moral support. I’m also grateful to many people for their support and advice during the preparation of this thesis.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Title page.............................................................................................................. ii

Permission to use.................................................................................................. iii

Absrak Malay....................................................................................................... iv

Abstract English.................................................................................................. v

Acknowledgements.............................................................................................. vi

Table of contents............................................................................................... vii

List of tables........................................................................................................ xviii

List of figures....................................................................................................... xix

Acronyms............................................................................................................. xxi
# CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.0 Background ................................................................. 1

1.1 Problem Statement ...................................................... 5

1.2 Objectives ........................................................................ 6

1.3 Research Questions ....................................................... 7

1.4 Significance of Study ...................................................... 7

1.5 Scope of the Study .......................................................... 8

1.6 Research Methodology ................................................... 9

1.6.1 Data Collection .......................................................... 10

1.6.2 Data Analysis .............................................................. 12

1.6.3 Main Interviews .......................................................... 13

1.6.3.1 Interview Protocols .................................................. 14

1.6.3.2 Thematic Analysis of Interviews ............................. 18

1.6.3.3 Dynamics and Challenges behind Yemen’s Failure to join the GCC .............................. 20

1.7 Organisation of the research ......................................... 20
# CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.0 Introduction ................................................................. 23

2.1 Major Literature on GCC-Yemen........................................ 23

2.1.1 Historical Factors...................................................... 29

2.1.2 Socioeconomics Factors.............................................. 34

2.1.3 Security Factors........................................................ 36

2.1.4 Yemen’s Stages of inclusion........................................ 48

2.1.5 Literature revaluation................................................ 49

2.2 Summary......................................................................... 50
CHAPTER THREE: REGIONAL INTEGRATION, DYNAMICS AND FAILURES: THEORETICAL EXPLANATION

3.0 Introduction ........................................................................................................... 35

3.1 Terminologies: Region, Regional Integration and Regionalism .................................... 35

3.2 Regionalism and Regional Integration in the Arabian Peninsula and the Gulf ................. 61

3.3 Theories of integration ............................................................................................ 67

3.3.1 Functionalism .................................................................................................... 68

3.3.2 Neofunctionalism ............................................................................................. 73

3.4 Regional integration theories and Yemen’s inclusion into the GCC .......................... 82

3.5 Summary .............................................................................................................. 86
CHAPTER FOUR: YEMEN: NATION BUILDING EFFORTS

4.0 Introduction................................................................................ 88

4.1 Geography.................................................................................. 88

4.2 Medieval Chronology............................................................... 91

4.3 Former North Yemen............................................................... 92

4.4 Former South Yemen ............................................................... 93

4.5 Unrest and Civil War ............................................................... 96

4.6 War Aftermath........................................................................... 97

4.7 Yemen and GCC: Events Development .................................... 98

4.7.1 Pre Independence Era......................................................... 98

4.7.2 Seventies, Events in the Yemeni Independence.................... 100

4.7.3 The Eighties.......................................................................... 101

4.8 The Commence Of a Lengthy Journey ..................................... 101

4.9 Regional Context..................................................................... 106
# CHAPTER FIVE: GCC: ROOTS AND POSSIBILITY OF SOUTHERN EXPANSION

5.0 Introduction ........................................................................................................ 155
5.1 The Nature of the GCC .................................................................................. 155
5.2 Emergence of the GCC .................................................................................. 156
  5.2.1 Antecedent Efforts at Cooperation ......................................................... 156
  5.2.2 GCC: Origins and Establishment ........................................................... 158
  5.2.3 Pre-integration Perspective .................................................................... 162
  5.2.4 Historical Familiarity ............................................................................. 163
  5.2.5 Economic Structure and Underdevelopment ......................................... 164
  5.2.6 Variation in Size and Capabilities ......................................................... 165
  5.2.7 Characteristics of the GCC .................................................................... 165
    5.2.7.1 External Factors ............................................................................... 165
    5.2.7.2 Core of the GCC ............................................................................. 166
  5.2.8 Political Nature of the GCC ................................................................... 167
  5.2.9 GCC Organizational Structures and Objectives ..................................... 168
    5.2.9.1 The Supreme Council ...................................................................... 169
    5.2.9.2 The Ministerial Council ................................................................... 174
    5.2.9.3 The Secretariat General ................................................................... 176
    5.2.9.4 The Charter .................................................................................... 179
    5.2.9.5 GCC Objectives ............................................................................. 181
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.3 GCC: A primary, but deficient</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 GCC, A Loose Form of Regional Integration</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5 GCC: Issues, and Enlargement</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6 Summary</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER SIX: INVESTIGATING DYNAMICS AND CHALLENGES OF</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>YEMEN’S GCC MEMBERSHIP: CAUSES OF EXCLUSION</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.0 Introduction</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Causes of Exclusion</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 Causes of Exclusion: Further Analysis</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 Summary</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER SEVEN: INVESTIGATING DYNAMICS AND CHALLENGES OF</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>YEMEN’S GCC MEMBERSHIP: CHALLENGES AND FAILURE ASPECTS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.0 Introduction</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Challenges and Failure Aspects</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Challenges and Failure Aspects: Further Discussions</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Summary</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER EIGHT: INVESTIGATING DYNAMICS AND CHALLENGES OF YEMEN’S-GCC MEMBERSHIP: RESOLVE PROBLEMS

8.0 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 216
8.1 Resolve Problems ....................................................................................................... 217
8.2 Merging Themes Discussions .................................................................................. 222
8.3 Summary ...................................................................................................................... 236

CHAPTER NINE: DYNAMICS OF YEMEN-GCC RELATIONS AFTER THE ARAB SPRING

9.0 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 238
9.1 Yemen: Revolution of its own.................................................................................... 249
9.2 Yemen’s revolution dynamics ..................................................................................... 241
9.3 GCC’s responses to the Arab Spring........................................................................ 243
   9.3.1 Inside vs. outside the GCC.................................................................................... 244
   9.3.2 Monarchies vs. republics...................................................................................... 246
   9.3.3 Sunnis vs. Shiites............................................................................................... 248
9.4 The double standard of the GCC: the challenges ahead.......................................... 249
9.5 Summary ...................................................................................................................... 252
CHAPTER TEN: CONCLUSIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND IMPLICATIONS

10.0 Executive Summary .............................................................................. 254

10.1 Post Arab Spring: Necessary Recalculations ........................................ 260

10.2 Revisiting Integration Theories ............................................................. 261

10.3 Restatement of a problem ...................................................................... 262

10.4 Mutual Benefits of Yemen’s Inclusion .................................................. 264
   10.4.1 Providing Hard Power .................................................................... 264
   10.4.2 Border Conflicts Elimination ......................................................... 264
   10.4.3 Joint military Training and Cooperation ......................................... 265
   10.4.4 Yemeni Labours in the GCC .......................................................... 266
   10.4.5 Economic Benefits ........................................................................ 268
   10.4.6 Countering Threats from Within and Abroad ............................... 269

10.5 Practical Implications ........................................................................... 271
   10.5.1 Yemeni Regime ............................................................................ 272
   10.5.2 GCC Members ............................................................................. 272
   10.5.3 International Donors .................................................................... 275
   10.5.4 Other Stakeholders ...................................................................... 276

STUDY PUBLICATIONS .................................................................................. 277

REFERENCES ................................................................................................ 278
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1 Steps in thematic analytical process..........................19

Table1.2: Themes on Research Questions Analytical Process...........20

Table 4.1: Yemen’s economic indicators....................................125

Table 4.1: GCC member states economic indicators......................161
List of Figures

Figure 1: Map of GCC-Yemen.................................................................90
ACRONYMS

ACC: Arabian Cooperation Council

AMU: Arab Mughrib Union

AQAP: Al-Qaida in the Arabian Peninsula

ASEAN: Association of South East Asian Nations

BPD: Barrel Per Day

CE: Causes of Exclusion

CECLA: Latin America Coordination Commission

CI: Challenges of Inclusion

DAC: Development Assistant Committee

EAC: East African Community

ECOWAS: Economic Community of West African States

EU: European Union

FA: Failure Aspects

FLOSY: Front for Liberation of Occupied South Yemen

GCC: Gulf Cooperation Council

GDP: Gross Domestic Product

GPC: General People’s Congress
ICC: Islamic Conference Cooperation
IDP: International Development Program
IMF: International Monetary Fund
KSA: Kingdom of Saudi Arabia
MECO: Military Economic Corporation
NATO: North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NGO: None Governmental Organization
NLF: National Liberation Front
PDRY: People’s Democratic Republic of Yemen
REC: Regional Economic Committee
RP: Resolve the Problems
UAE: United Arab Emirates
UN: United Nation
UNDP: United Nations Development Program
UNHCR: United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
WTO: World Trade Organization
YAR: Yemen Arab Republic
YECO: Yemeni Economic Corporation
YIP: Yemeni Islah Party
YSP: Yemeni Socialist Party

USA: United States of America
CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.0 Background

Yemen’s interest in joining the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) dates back to the 1980s when the Council was first established and comprised of Saudi Arabia, Qatar, Bahrain, Kuwait, and United Arab Emirates (GCC Charter\(^1\), 1981) (Nakhleh, 1986; Abdullah, 1999; Pinfari, Economics, Centre, 2009; Razavi & Kirsten, 2011; Mohammed, 2011). Several political obstacles hindered Yemen’s accession to GCC during that period. This study explores what remains from these early obstacles, what has been removed, and if any new obstacles have arisen.

There are many challenges to Yemen’s complete acceptance into the GCC regional system. If one wishes to clearly define Yemen’s official stage of Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) accession, it is slowly moving towards the accomplishment of its goals and successful compliance with the Gulf regional system although, most efforts have proven fruitless largely because, “Yemen is not able to maintain political stability, overcome corruption, and implement

\(^1\) GCC Charter is attached in the Appendix
The contents of the thesis is for internal user only
REFERENCES


Al-Agbari.(1995). Yemen and Gulf Cooperation Council Countries. political, economic, cultural, and security dimensions for Yemen's membership into the Gulf Cooperation Council Yemen, San’aa, Yemeni Centre for strategic studies.


Al-Fosail. (2002). The Economic Dimension of Yemen's Accession to the GCC: possible economic cooperation and future prospects. political, economic, cultural, and security dimensions for Yemen's membership into the Gulf Cooperation Council Yemen, San’aa, Yemeni Centre for strategic studies.

Al-Ga’aly.(2004). Yemen's internal problems affecting its regional and international relations.


Al-Hazmi. (2003). developing the collective security system for the GCC. Yemen and the world, Yemen's interaction with the world in the last decade of the twenty century centre for future studies and french centre for Yemeni studies Yemen, San'aa, centre for future studies and french centre for Yemeni studies.


Almaitamy, M. A. (2002). Economic reforms in international relations file. Yemen and the world, Yemen's interaction with the world in the last decade of the twenty century centre for future studies and french centre for Yemeni studies Yemen, San'aa, centre for future studies and french centre for Yemeni studies.

Al-Motairy.(1993). the GCC and the challenges of establishing an integrated capability for upholding security.

Almuayid, A. (2002). the Yemeni relations with Iraq and Iran, ten years of Yemen's Unity. Yemen and the world, Yemen's interaction with the world in the last decade of the twenty century, Yemen, San'aa, future studies centre and the french centre for Yemeni studies.


Almutawakil, M. A. (2002). Yemen and the Gulf second war. Yemen and the world, Yemen's interaction with the world in the last decade of the twenty century centre for future studies and french centre for Yemeni studies, Yemen, San'a, centre for future studies and french centre for Yemeni studies.


Al-Sabri. (2002). The security dimension of Yemen’s accession to the GCC.

Al-Sagaf.(2002). the relations between Yemen and GCC prior to Yemen’s official membership request.


Alshibany, Y. (2002). Yemen's attitude from the Iraqi invasion of Kuwait (legal Dimension). Yemen and the world, Yemen's interaction with the world in the last decade of the twenty century centre for future studies and frenchcentre for Yemeni studies, Yemen, San'aa, centre for future studies and frenchcentre for Yemeni studies.


Burke, E. (2012). ‘One blood and one destiny’? Yemen’s relations with the Gulf Cooperation Council.


DehghaniFiruzabadi J (2009), Foreign Policy of Islamic Republic of Iran, Samt Publication. Tehran.


Dougherty James e. and Robert Pfaltzgraff,(2001), Contending Theories of International Relations :a Comperhensive


Dystrymo, B. (2002). Yemen and Globalisation and Removal of Poverty. Yemen and the world, Yemen’s interaction with the world in the last decade of the
twenty century centre for future studies and French centre for Yemeni studies, centre for future studies and French centre for Yemeni studies.

*Economic Bulletin*, 16 February 2012,


Fakeera, J. I. (2004). Yemen and the Cooperation Council for the Arab Gulf States, from creation to the gradual convergence, political, economic, cultural, and security dimensions for Yemen's membership into the Gulf Cooperation Council Yemen, San’aa, Yemeni Centre for strategic studies.

Fakeera. (2002). Yemen and the GCC, from establishment to gradual approach, economic, cultural, and security dimensions for Yemen’s membership into the Gulf Cooperation Council Yemen, San'aa, Yemeni Centre for strategic studies.


Fielding-Smith, A., 2010. State Maintains Grip on Yemen’s Civil Society. Financial Times, 7


Ibrahim Saif, Rand Fakhoury, “Lessons from the Gulf’s Twin Shocks”, in International


Johnsen, G., 2007. Empty Economic Reforms Slow Bid to Join the GCC. Arab Reform


Mahjoub, T., 2010. Yemen Calls on International Donors to Honor Aid Pledges. Agence


news, a. (2000). speech bu former GCC secretary general

No'Man. (2002). bases determining the relations between Yemen and the GC countries.political, economic, cultural, and security dimensions for Yemen's membership into the Gulf Cooperation Council Yemen, San'aa, Yemeni Centre for strategic studies. Observer, 23 March.


Peskin, D., 2009. European EADS Company to Carry Out One of Biggest Mideast Security

*Adelphi Series, 51*(420), 123-134.


Rutledge, E. (2006). Is Yemen Ready to Join the GCC?


Steve C. Caton, (2010). Yemen ought to be a full member of the GCC.Retrieved October 2010 from http://mideast.foreignpolicy.com/posts/2010/10/08/Yemen_ought_to_be_a_full_member_of_the_GCC.


Stracke, N. and M. Haidar, 2010. The Southern Movement in Yemen. Gulf Research Center,


Turath, O. (2002). Republic of Yemen in ten years: Days and events. Yemen and the world, Yemen's interaction with the world in the last decade of the twenty century, Yemen, San'aa, centre for future studies and frenchcentre for Yemeni studies.


Yahya, N. (2010). The cultural dimension of the Yemeni Gulf relations. Historical, political, economic, cultural, and security dimensions of the Yemeni Gulf relations. Yemen, San'aa, Yemen Centre of strategic studies.


