MODEL FOR E-GOVERNMENT INITIATIVE IN PUBLIC SECTOR IN JORDAN

ALI MOHAMMAD AL-NAIMAT

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
UNIVERSITI UTARA MALAYSIA
2015
Permission to Use

In presenting this thesis in fulfilment of the requirements for a postgraduate degree from Universiti Utara Malaysia, I agree that the Universiti Library may make it freely available for inspection. I further agree that permission for the copying of this thesis in any manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purpose may be granted by my supervisor(s) or, in their absence, by the Dean of Awang Had Salleh Graduate School of Arts and Sciences. It is understood that any copying or publication or use of this thesis or parts thereof for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission. It is also understood that due recognition shall be given to me and to Universiti Utara Malaysia for any scholarly use which may be made of any material from my thesis.

Requests for permission to copy or to make other use of materials in this thesis, in whole or in part should be addressed to:

Dean of Awang Had Salleh Graduate School of Arts and Sciences
UUM College of Arts and Sciences
Universiti Utara Malaysia
06010 UUM Sintok
Abstrak


Kata Kunci: E-kerajaan, Model Inisiatif E-kerajaan, Faktor Kejayaan Kritikal, Teknik Delphi.
Abstract

E-government has become a global interest since it extended the public services through information communication technology (ICT) to allow access to information, improve transparency and efficiency. Many governments are interested to implement successful e-government initiatives. However, e-government implementation is not a simple task since the developing countries cannot directly adopt the implementation of e-government model which is mainly built in the context of developed countries. Previous studies have shown that many e-government projects in developing countries, like Jordan have encountered various problems after implementation phase. Hence, the objective of this study is to develop an e-government initiative model for the public sector in Jordan. In this study, unstructured interviews were conducted as a method for collecting the data. Thirty respondents involved in e-government projects such as managers, general managers and other levels of decision makers were selected from three Jordanian ministries namely the Ministry of Information and Communication Technology, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Labour. The initial success factors for e-government initiatives in Jordan were identified and analyzed qualitatively. Delphi technique was also used to determine and validate the critical success factors (CSFs). Ultimately, a novel Ali, Syazwan & Ruzaini’s e-government initiatives model for has been developed in this research. The model has four stages: (1) Emerging and Information Dissemination; (2) Two-Way Communication; (3) Integration and (4) E-democracy. The findings also revealed seven CSFs that should be taken into account to implement the e-government model which include top management support, vision and strategy, funding, information technology (IT) infrastructure, user computer efficacy, awareness and resistance to change. This study contributes to the body of knowledge in Socio Technical Theory (STT) toward the development of e-government initiatives model for public sector in Jordan. The empirical data from the study may provide input for government agencies to plan, design and implement future ICT projects in Jordan.

Keywords: E-government, E-government Initiatives Model, Critical Success Factors (CSF), Delphi Technique.
Acknowledgement

My deepest thanks to Almighty Allah for giving me the opportunity to complete my PhD thesis. I am grateful to the Almighty Allah. May peace and blessing of Allah be upon His beloved Prophet Muhammad (SAW), his family, and his companions.

In this occasion I would like to express my gratitude to a number of people whose admission, permission, and assistance contribute to finish my long story with PhD. My deepest and warmest gratitude to my supervisor Assoc. Prof. Dr. Wan Rozaini bt Sheik Osman for her assistance and patience in ensuring that the study reached completion. I am grateful for her understanding, advice, encouragement, and for making me confident in my work with timely feedback. I read the Fatihah for my second supervisor's soul Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mohd Syazwan Abdullah (God bless his soul and makes the resting place of paradise). I am grateful for his continuous guidance, fruitful feedback, moral support, and sharing of all his research experiences throughout these challenging years. I pray for him from the bottom of my heart to be in Heaven Insha’Allah.

I like to express my great appreciation to Assoc. Prof. Abdul Bashah Mat Ali, Dr. Farzana Kabir Ahmad, Dr. Rosli Bin Mohammed, Dr. Mohd. Khairie Ahmad and Dr. Kamarul Faizal Hashim for the useful comments and suggestions to improve my thesis.

On a more personal level, I would also like to express my gratitude to my parents who were the real teachers who educated and encouraged me. I pray for them from the bottom of my heart to give them Baraka in their life. I will never forget the help of my two brothers who were very cooperative and helpful to me, Bssam and Essam, as well as my sisters. My gratitude also goes to all my colleagues in the PhD journey,
among them are Feras, Moath, Mejhem and Omar Tarawneh, Wa’el Naimat, Dr. Mohammad Noor Al-Adwan, Ibrahim shamayleh and many others, specifically for the discussions and sometimes the heated arguments on the better ways to perform my research.

Thank You All Very Much
Table of Contents

Permission to Use........................................................................................................................................i
Abstrak .................................................................................................................................................. ii
Abstract .................................................................................................................................................. iii
Acknowledgement .................................................................................................................................. iv
Table of Contents .................................................................................................................................. vi
List of Tables ......................................................................................................................................... vi
List of Figures ....................................................................................................................................... xii
List of Appendices ................................................................................................................................ xiii
List of Abbreviations ............................................................................................................................ xiv

CHAPTER ONE INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................... 1
1.1 Background ....................................................................................................................................... 1
1.2 Problem Statement ............................................................................................................................ 6
1.3 Research Questions ........................................................................................................................... 8
1.4 Research Objectives ......................................................................................................................... 9
1.5 Scope of Study ................................................................................................................................ 9
1.6 Research Strategy .......................................................................................................................... 11
1.7 Research Contributions ................................................................................................................ 14
1.8 Thesis Organization ....................................................................................................................... 15

CHAPTER TWO LITERATURE REVIEW ............................................................................ 18
2.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................................................... 18
2.2 Definition of concept ...................................................................................................................... 19
   2.2.1 E-government .......................................................................................................................... 19
   2.2.2 Critical Success Factors ........................................................................................................ 22
2.3 Categories of E-government ........................................................................................................ 22
   2.3.1 Government to Citizen (G2C) ............................................................................................... 23
   2.3.2 Government to Businesses (G2B) ......................................................................................... 24
   2.3.3 Government to Government (G2G) .................................................................................... 25
   2.3.4 Government to Employee (G2E) ........................................................................................ 26
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Models of E-government Implementation</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1 Layne and Lee’s Four-Stage Model</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2 United Nation’s (UN / ASPA) Five Stage Model</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.3 Gartner’s Four Stage Model</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.4 Deloitte &amp; Touch’s Six-Stage Model</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.5 Hiller &amp; Blanger’s Five-Stage Model</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.6 Moon’s Five-Stage Model</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.7 World Bank’s Three-Stage Model</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.8 Chandler and Emanuel’s Four-Stage Model</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.9 Howard’s Three-Stage Model</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.10 UK’s Five Stage Model</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.11 PPR’s Four Stage Model</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.12 West’s Four Stage Model</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.13 Watson &amp; Mundy’s Three Stage Model</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.14 Siau &amp; Long’s Five Stage Model</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.15 Accenture’s Five-Stage Model</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.16 Asia Pacific’s Six-Stage Model</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.7 World Bank’s Three-Stage Model</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Comparative Analysis of E-Government Implementation Models</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 E-Government in Developing Countries</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.1 Benefits of E-government Implementation in Developing Countries</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.2 Barriers of E-government initiatives in Developing Countries</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.2.1 Strategy Barriers</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.2.2 Technology Barriers</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.2.3 Policy Barriers</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.2.4 Organisational Barriers</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7 Jordan E-government Implementation</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.1 Overview of Jordan</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.2 E-government in Jordan</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.3 The Stages of E-government Model in Jordan</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.4 E-government Services in Jordan</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8 Theories in E-Government Studies</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.8.1 Social Technology Theory (STT) ................................................................. 96

2.9 Review on Past Related Works on Critical Success Factors for the Implementation of E-government Initiatives ................................................................. 97
  2.9.1 Organization Factors ............................................................................. 101
  2.9.2 Technology Factors ............................................................................ 104
  2.9.3 People Factors .................................................................................... 106

2.10 Summary .................................................................................................. 108

CHAPTER THREE RESEARCH METHODOLOGY ............................................. 110

3.1 Introduction ............................................................................................. 110
3.2 Research Methodology Phases ............................................................... 112
3.3 Phases One: Preliminary Phase ............................................................... 113
3.4 Phases Two: Theoretical Phase .............................................................. 114
3.5 Phase Three: Practical Phase ................................................................. 116
  3.5.1 Preparation Process ........................................................................... 118
  3.5.2 Execution Process ............................................................................... 120
    3.5.2.1 Phenomenological study ............................................................... 121
    3.5.2.2 Data Collection Methods ............................................................. 124
    3.5.2.3 Interview Technique ................................................................. 125
    3.5.2.4 Interview Translation ................................................................. 128
    3.5.2.5 Respondents Background ........................................................... 129
  3.5.3 Analysis Process ................................................................................. 134
  3.5.4 Verification Process ............................................................................ 134
    3.5.4.1 The Delphi Process ....................................................................... 136
3.6 Phases Four: Development phase ............................................................ 137
3.7 Summary .................................................................................................. 139

CHAPTER FOUR FINDING & DEVELOPE E-GOVERNMENT IMPLEMENTATION MODEL ......................................................... 140

4.1 Introduction ............................................................................................. 140
4.2 Data Analysis .......................................................................................... 140
4.3 Organizational Factors Analysis ............................................................. 146
CHAPTER FIVE CONCLUSION AND FUTURE WORKS ................................................................. 226
5.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................... 226
5.2 Research Summary .............................................................................................. 226
  5.2.1 Preliminary phase ............................................................................................ 227
  5.2.2 Theoretical Study ........................................................................................... 227
  5.2.3 Practical Phase ............................................................................................... 229
  5.2.4 Development phase ....................................................................................... 231
5.3 Research Contributions ....................................................................................... 233
  5.3.1 Conceptual Model for E–government Implementation ................................ 233
  5.3.2 Critical Success Factors for E–government Implementation in Jordan ... 234
  5.3.3 Merging Practical Findings with Experts’ View ......................................... 235
5.4 Limitations of the Research ................................................................................ 235
5.5 Recommendations for Future Work .................................................................... 237
REFERENCES .................................................................................................................. 240
List of Tables

Table 2.1 A Summary Comparison of the e-Government Implementation Models .61
Table 2.2 Properties and Characteristic of Previous E-government Implementation Models.................................................................................................................64
Table 2.3 Benefits of E-government Implementation...................................................69
Table 2.4 Summary of Success Factors of E-government Implementation in Developing Countries.................................................................................................................99
Table 3.1 Study the Respondents’ Background Information ........................................130
Table 4.1 The Schedule Expert Reviewers Meetings .......................................................199
Table 4.2 Interval Scale for the Importance of Implementation....................................200
Table 4.3 Delphi First Round Results............................................................................201
Table 4.4 Delphi Second Round Results.......................................................................204
## List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1.1.</td>
<td>Development Stages of Model for E-government Implementation initiatives in Jordan</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.1.</td>
<td>Relationship between Major E-government Stakeholders (Adopted from Siau &amp; Long, 2005)</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.2.</td>
<td>Layne and Lee’s Four Stage Models, (Adopted from Layne &amp; Lee, 2001)</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.3.</td>
<td>United Nation’s (UN / ASPA) Five Stage Model (Adopted from United Nations, 2008)</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.4.</td>
<td>Gartner Group Model (Adopted from Zarei et al., 2008)</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.5.</td>
<td>World Bank’s Model (Adopted from Al-Hashmi &amp; Darem, 2003)</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.7.</td>
<td>Public Sector Process Rebuilding (PPR) model (Adopted from Andersen &amp; Henriksen, 2006)</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.8.</td>
<td>Jordan Geographical Location</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.9.</td>
<td>E-readiness in the Arab World (Adopted from UN, 2008)</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.10.</td>
<td>ICT Penetration Rates per 100 Inhabitants as % (Adapted from Hwang &amp; Mohammed, 2008)</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.11.</td>
<td>Jordan E-Transformation Current and Target Maturity (Adopted from MoICT, 2013)</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.12.</td>
<td>Jordan E-government Portal (<a href="http://www.jordan.gov.jo">www.jordan.gov.jo</a>)</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.13.</td>
<td>The National Contact Centre services</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.1.</td>
<td>Research Process</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.2.</td>
<td>Inputs, Activities and Deliverable of Preliminary phase</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.3.</td>
<td>Inputs, Activities and Deliverable of Theoretical Phase</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.4.</td>
<td>Inputs, Activities and Deliverable of Practical Phase</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.5.</td>
<td>Inputs, Activities and Deliverable of Development phase</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.1.</td>
<td>Nvivo Coding Structure</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.2.</td>
<td>Numbers of References Reviewed by Responders on Success Factors that Influence the Implementation of E-government Initiatives in Jordan</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.3.</td>
<td>Main Success Factors and Sub-success Factors of E-government Implementation</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.4.</td>
<td>Illustrates the Organizational Factor and Sub-success Factors that will lead to Successful E-government Implementation in Jordan</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.5.</td>
<td>Illustrates the Technology Factor and Sub-success Factors that will lead to the Success of E-government Implementation in Jordan</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.6.</td>
<td>Illustrates the People Factor and Sub-success Factors that will lead to the Success of the E-government Implementation in Jordan</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.7.</td>
<td>Experts Review Process</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.8.</td>
<td>Ali, Syazwan &amp; Ruzaini’s Four Stages Model (2014)</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.1.</td>
<td>Theoretical Steps</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.2.</td>
<td>Practical Steps</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.3.</td>
<td>Development phase</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Appendices

Appendix A Interview Questionnaire (English Version).................................264
Appendix B Example of a Translated Interview with the E-government Director of Government Management (English Version) .........................................................271
Appendix C Interview Questionnaire (Arabic Version) ........................................278
Appendix D Example of Interview with the E-government Director of Government Management (Arabic Version) .................................................................284
Appendix E Official Letter for Data Collection.....................................................290
Appendix F Certificate of Thesis Editing & Proofreading .....................................292
Appendix G Official Letters from Jordanian Ministries to Confirm Data Collection from this Ministries ............................................................293
Appendix H Revealed of the Names of the Participants in the Data Collection Process ........................................................................................................296
Appendix I Official Letter for Experts Review.......................................................299
Appendix J Experts Interview Questionnaire ........................................................300
Appendix K Example of Interview with the E-government Experts .......................306
Appendix L Session Dering Interview................................................................314
Appendix M Some of the CV for Experts.............................................................316
Appendix N Session Dering Experts Interview ....................................................341
# List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CSFs</td>
<td>Critical Success Factors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoICT</td>
<td>Ministry of Information and Communication Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT</td>
<td>Information Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-government</td>
<td>Electronic government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CS</td>
<td>Computer systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIS</td>
<td>Management Information Systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QSR</td>
<td>Qualitative Solutions &amp; Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G2G</td>
<td>Government-to-Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G2B</td>
<td>Government-to-Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G2C</td>
<td>Government-to-Citizen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G2E</td>
<td>Government-to-Employee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>Information and Communication Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IS</td>
<td>Information Systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STT</td>
<td>Social Technology Theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICDL</td>
<td>International Computer Driving License</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPSS</td>
<td>Statistical Package for Social Sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPD</td>
<td>Continuing Professional Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>United States of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMO</td>
<td>Program Management Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PKI</td>
<td>Public Key Infrastructure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SGN</td>
<td>Secure Government Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNB</td>
<td>Government National Backbone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASPA</td>
<td>American Society for Public Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organizations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER ONE
INTRODUCTION

This chapter describes the broad overview and explains the purpose of the study. This chapter is divided into several sections which begin with an overview of the research background, problem statement, research questions and research objectives. In addition, the explanation on the research scope, research strategy, research contributions and the overall thesis organization has been provided, which assist in understanding the research groundwork.

1.1 Background

The rapid developments in ICT have a profound impact on organizations, governments and society. It also has promoted emerging fields such as e-commerce, e-learning, e-health and e-government as a way to disseminate information to public. E-government is one of interesting ICT applications which has been identified to be an important field of research (Alshehri & Drew, 2010). E-government can be defined as the use of ICT, especially Internet-based applications, phones, and other digital means to deliver e-government services (Basu, 2004; Rahman, 2007).

The World Bank (2011) on the other hand has defined e-government as:

“The use of information technologies (such as Wide Area Networks, the Internet, and mobile computing) by government agencies has the ability to transform relations with citizens, businesses, and other arms of government. These technologies can serve a variety of different ends: better delivery of government services to citizens, improved interactions with business and industry, citizen empowerment through access to information, or more efficient government management. The resulting benefits can be less corruption, increased transparency, greater convenience, revenue growth, and/or cost reductions”.

The contents of the thesis is for internal user only
REFERENCES


Martínez Zamorano, D., & van Bohemen, J. (2009). Implementing strategic change through projects: Identifying CSFs within the setting of SMEs


