THE EFFECT OF AUDIT COMMITTEE AND EXTERNAL AUDITOR CHARACTERISTICS ON FINANCIAL REPORTING QUALITY



MASTER OF SCIENCE (INTERNATIONAL ACCOUNTING) UNIVERSITI UTARA MALAYSIA

2015

THE EFFECT OF AUDIT COMMITTEE AND EXTERNAL AUDITOR CHARACTERISTICS ON FINANCIAL REPORTING QUALITY

By:



Thesis submitted to

Othman Yeop Abdullah Graduate School of Business,

Universiti Utara Malaysia,

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirement for the Master of Science

(International Accounting)

PERMISSION TO USE

In presenting this research paper in partial fulfillment of the requirements for a Post graduate degree in MSc. International Accounting from the Universiti Utara Malaysia (UUM), I agree that the library of this university may make it freely available for inspection. I further agree that permission for copying this project paper in any manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purposes may be granted by my supervisor or in his absence, by the Dean of Othman Yeop Abdullah Graduate School of Business where, I did my research paper. It is understood that any copying or publication or use of this research paper parts of it for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission. It is also understood that due recognition shall be given to me and to the UUM in any scholarly use which may be made of any material in my research paper.

Request for permission to copy or to make other use of materials in this thesis in whole or in part should be addressed to:

Dean of Othman Yeop Abdullah Graduate School of Business

Universiti Utara Malaysia

06010 UUM Sintok

Kedah Darul Aman

ABSTRAK

Kajian ini adalah untuk mengenalpasti hubungan di antara ciri-ciri jawatankuasa audit dan ciri-ciri juruaudit luar (pembolehubah bebas) dan kualiti pelaporan kewangan (pembolehubah bersandar). Kajian lepas yang berkaitan dengan kualiti pelaporan kewangan mempunyai skop yang terhad dengan latar belakang Malaysia. Pembaharuan penyelidikan ini adalah ia menyumbang kepada dua dimensi ciri-ciri audit yang berbeza iaitu ciri-ciri jawatankuasa audit dan ciri-ciri juruaudit luar yang dikaji dalam skema yang sama. Kajian ini telah mengunakan sampel daripada Bursa Malaysia, tentunya 100 syarikat tersenarai teratas mengikut saham Bursa Malaysia.

Analisis laporan tahunan telah membuktikan bahawa jawatankuasa audit (berdikari, kepakaran, kerajinan) mempunyai keupayaan ramalan kepada kualiti pelaporan kewangan. Walaupun keputusan menunjukkan pemimpin industri didapati signifikan ke atas kualiti pelaporan kewangan tetapi pada sudut lain, firma audit yang besar tidak signifikan ke atas kualiti pelaporan kewangan. Kajian ini telah menambahkan pemahaman mengenai amalan jawatankuasa audit dan prosedur literatur perakaunan dalam konteks di Malaysia. Kajian ini tidak boleh dibuat kesimpulan umum kerana kajian mengambil 100 syarikat tersenarai teratas dari Malaysia. Keputusan kajian ini mungkin berubah jika kajian akan datang mengambil koleksi sampel yang berbeza.

Kata kunci: Jawatankuasa Audit, Juruaudit Luar, Kualiti Laporan Kewangan

Universiti Utara Malaysia

ABSTRACT

This study aims to examine the relationship between audit committee characteristics and external auditors' characteristics (independent variables) and financial reporting quality (dependent variable). Past studies related to the financial reporting quality has limited scope with regard to Malaysian background. The novelty of this research, therefore, is that it accounts for two different dimensions of audits characteristics i.e. audit committee characteristics and external auditors' characteristics that are examined in the same schema. The study used the sample firms from the Bursa Malaysia, explicitly top 100 performing firms according to the Bursa Malaysia stock exchange.

The analysis of annual reports has proven that audit committee (independence, expertise, and diligence) has the prediction capability to financial reporting quality. Although results indicate that industry leader has significant impact on financial reporting quality, but on other side, large audit firms do not have any significant effect on financial reporting quality. This study adds the knowledge of audit committee practices and procedures in accounting literature regarding Malaysian context. The results of this study cannot be generalized because study used top 100 performing firms from Malaysia. The results of this study might be changed if future researches use different set of sample firms.

Keywords: Audit Committee, External Auditor, Financial Reporting Quality

Universiti Utara Malaysia

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

First and foremost, I am extremely thankful to almighty Allah, who helped me to complete my study.

I want to express my thanks and gratitude to my supervisor Dr. Kamarul Bahrain Bin Abdul Manaf, for his patience, support, guidance and for sharing his wisdom and experience with me during my academic career. Specifically, special thanks go to him for his contributions to the success of the research and his continued encouragement also without his support this work could not accomplished.

I am grateful to my father "Jawhar" who is always the real builder in our family, also when I need his kindness, support, encourage and precious guidance provide me to overcome problems in my life. Also I am eternally grateful to my father in law "Ali" for his encouragement and support during my studies.

Moreover, I want to express my sincere thanks to my dear wife Zainab. She has the courage to achieve my study and come true our dreams, also I hope succeed in her master of civil engineering. Thank you so much to be in my life and take care my two lovely kids Aland and Blnd "All my love to them for finding me the light wherever it was far away".

My mother Ateya and grandmother Fatma, they always gave me pray for me that I would get everything which is good in my life. Really thankful to my brothers, Hemn, Headi, Ahmed and lovely sister Zainab, being supportive to me during the course. I would like to deepest thank to my real and dear friend, Sangar Yousif Alqasab.

Aram Jawhar Mohammad

TABLE OF CONTENT

PERMISSION TO USE	iii
ABSTRAK	v
ABSTRACT	iv
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	v
TABLE OF CONTENT	vii
LIST OF TABLES	X
LIST OF FIGURES	xi
LIST OF ABBREVIATION	xii
APENDIX	xiii
CHAPTER ONE	
INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background of Study	2
1.2 Problem Statement	
1.3 Research Questions	
1.4 Research objectives	8
1.5 Significance of Study	8
1.5.1 Theoretical	8
1.5.2 Practical	
1.6 Scope of the Study	9
1.7 Organization of the Study	9
CHAPTER TWO	
LITERATURE REVIEW	11
2.1 Financial Reporting Quality	11
2.1.1 Financial Reporting Quality and Audit Committee Characteristics	12
2.1.2 Financial Reporting Quality and External Audit Characteristics	13
2.1.3 Empirical Studies of Financial Reporting Quality	14
2.2 Audit Committee Characteristics	16
2.2.1 Audit Committee Independence	16
2.2.2 Audit Committee Expertise	22
2.2.3 Audit Committee Diligence	26
2.3 External Auditor Characteristics	28
2.3.1 Large Audit firms	28
2.3.2 Industry Leader	32

2.4 Underpinning Theories	34
2.4.1 Stakeholder Theory	34
2.4.2 Signaling Theory	35
2.4.3 Agency Theory	38
2.5 Summary of the Chapter	39
CHAPTER THREE	
HYPOTHESIS DEVELOPMENT AND METHODOLOGY	40
3.1 Introduction	40
3.2 Research Framework	41
3.3 Hypothesis Development	44
3.3.1 Audit Committee Independence and Financial Reporting Quality	44
3.3.2 Audit Committee Expertise and Financial Reporting Quality	45
3.3.3 Audit Committee Diligence and Financial Reporting Quality	46
3.3.4 Large Audit Firm and Financial Reporting Quality	46
3.3.5 Industry Leader and Financial Reporting Quality	
3.4 Data Collection.	
3.5 Data Collection Procedures	49
3.6 Model Specification and Ordinary Least Square Regressions	49
3.7 Measurement of the Variables	
3.7.1 Dependent Variable	50
3.7.2 Independent Variables	51
3.7.3 Unit of Analysis	52
3.7.4 Statistical Technique	52
3.7.5 Correlation of Variables	53
3.7.6 Regression of Variables	54
3.8 Summary for the Chapter	54
CHAPTER FOUR	
FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION	55
4.1 Introduction	55
4.2 Descriptive Analysis	55
4.3 Correlation Analysis	60
4.4 Regression Analysis	61
4.5 Summary of the Chapter	67

CHAPTER FIVE

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	68
5.1 Introduction	68
5.2 Discussion of the Results	68
5.3 Limitations and Recommendations for Future Research	71
5.4 Conclusion	73
Deferences	74



LIST OF TABLES

Table 4.1	Descriptive Statistics	56
Table 4.2	Correlation Matrix	60
Table 4.3	Estimates of Auxiliary Regression Estimating NDAC	61
Table 4.4	Estimates of Regression Estimating FRQ	64



LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1 Framework of the study





LIST OF ABBREVIATION

MCCG Malaysian Code of Corporate Governance

IFRS International Financial Reporting Standard

FRQ Financial Reporting quality

ACI Audit Committee Independence

ACE Audit Committee Expertise

ACD Audit Committee Diligence

EALAF External Auditor Large Audit Firm

EAIL External Auditor Industry Leader

TAC Total Accrual

REV Revenue Utara Malaysia

REC Receivable

PPE Property, Plant and Equipment

ROA Return on Assets

DAC Discretionary accrual

NDAC Non - Discretionary accrual

APENDIX

List of Companies 88



CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

It is generally believed that fundamental pillar of capital markets is financial reporting quality as efficient resource allocation is determined by such information. When the true performance of a firm is neither disclosed in the annual reports nor reflected in the reported earnings then economy, different companies, individual employees and investors face huge losses (Pergola & Verreault, 2009). Similarly, the evidences of Schipper and Vincent (2003) claim that stakeholders are very much concerned in financial reporting quality disclosed in annual reports as this information highly influence their decision making, specifically information related to investments and contracting.

It is generally argued that information about low and poor financial reporting quality leads to unintended transfer of wealth. The most important role that corporate governance system plays closely monitor financial reporting and earnings quality of a firm (Cohen, Krishnamoorthy, & Wright, 2004). However, significant relation between poor financial reporting quality and different mechanisms of corporate governance is revealed by past studies that particularly discuss hot issues like manipulation, earnings management, flaws in internal control system and financial statement frauds (Beasley, Carcello, Hermanson, & Lapides, 2000; Beasley, 1996; Carcello & Neal, 2000; Dechow & Skinner, 2000; Klein, 2002; Krishnan, 2001). Four major stakeholders watch over corporate governance of a firm which includes external auditors, internal audit, governing board, including audit committee,

The contents of the thesis is for internal user only

References

- (PCAOB), P. C. A. O. B. (2007). An Audit of Internal Control over Financial Reporting That Is Integrated with an Audit of Financial Statements. Auditing Standard No. 5. PCAOB Washington, DC.
- Abbott, L. J., Parker, S., & Peters, G. F. (2004). Audit committee characteristics and restatements. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 23(1), 69–87.
- Abbott, L. J., Parker, S., & Peters, G. F. (2012). Internal audit assistance and external audit timeliness. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 31(4), 3–20.
- Abbott, L. J., Parker, S., Peters, G. F., & Raghunandan, K. (2003). The association between audit committee characteristics and audit fees. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 22(2), 17–32.
- Abbott, L. J., Daugherty, B., Parker, S., & Peters, G. F. (2015). Internal audit quality and financial reporting quality: The joint importance of independence and competence. *Journal of Accounting Research*.
- Aboody, D., & Lev, B. (2000). Information asymmetry, R&D, and insider gains. *Journal of Finance*, 2747–2766.
- Adiguzel, H. (2013). Corporate Governance, Family Ownership and Earnings Management: Emerging Market Evidence. *Accounting and Finance Research*, 2(4), p17.
- Afify, H. A. E. (2009). Determinants of audit report lag: Does implementing corporate governance have any impact? Empirical evidence from Egypt. *Journal of Applied Accounting Research*, 10(1), 56–86.
- Agacer, G. (n.d.). M., and TS Doupnik.: 1991, Perceptions of Auditor Independence: A Cross-Cultural Study'. *International Journal of Accounting*, 26, 220–237.
- Aggarwal, R., Erel, I., Stulz, R. M., & Williamson, R. (2007). Do US firms have the best corporate governance? A cross-country examination of the relation between corporate governance and shareholder wealth. National Bureau of Economic Research.
- Agrawal, A., & Chadha, S. (2005). Corporate governance and accounting scandals. *Journal of Law and Economics*, 48(2), 371–406.
- Ahmad-Zaluki, N. A., & Nordin Wan-Hussin, W. (2010). Corporate governance and earnings forecasts accuracy. *Asian Review of Accounting*, 18(1), 50–67.
- Ali, A. M., Gloeck, J. D., Ali, A., Ahmi, A., & Sahdan, M. H. (2007). Internal audit in the state and local governments of Malaysia. *Southern African Journal of Accountability and Auditing Research*, 7, 25–57.

- Almutairi, A. R., Dunn, K. A., & Skantz, T. (2009). Auditor tenure, auditor specialization, and information asymmetry. *Managerial Auditing Journal*, 24(7), 600–623.
- Ameer, R., Ramli, F., & Zakaria, H. (2010). A new perspective on board composition and firm performance in an emerging market. *Corporate Governance: The International Journal of Business in Society*, 10(5), 647–661.
- Amernic, J. H., Kanungo, R., & Aranya, N. (1983). Professional and work values of accountants. *The International Journal of Accounting*, 18(2), 177–192.
- Anderson, R. C., Mansi, S. A., & Reeb, D. M. (2004). Board characteristics, accounting report integrity, and the cost of debt. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 37(3), 315–342.
- Ashbaugh, H., LaFond, R., & Mayhew, B. W. (2003). Do nonaudit services compromise auditor independence? Further evidence. *The Accounting Review*, 78(3), 611–639.
- Ashbaugh-Skaife, H., Collins, D. W., & Kinney, W. R. (2007). The discovery and reporting of internal control deficiencies prior to SOX-mandated audits. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 44(1), 166–192.
- Ataullah, A., Davidson, I., Le, H., & Wood, G. (2014). Corporate diversification, information asymmetry and insider trading. *British Journal of Management*, 25(2), 228–251.
- Bae, G. S., Cheon, Y. S., & Kang, J.-K. (2008). Intragroup propping: Evidence from the stock-price effects of earnings announcements by Korean business groups. *Review of Financial Studies*, 21(5), 2015–2060.
- Ball, R., & Brown, P. (1968). An empirical evaluation of accounting income numbers. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 159–178.
- Balsam, S., Krishnan, J., & Yang, J. S. (2003). Auditor industry specialization and earnings quality. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 22(2), 71–97.
- Bame-Aldred, C. W., Brandon, D. M., Messier Jr, W. F., Rittenberg, L. E., & Stefaniak, C. M. (2012). A summary of research on external auditor reliance on the internal audit function. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 32(sp1), 251–286.
- Barth, M. E., & So, E. C. (2014). Non-diversifiable volatility risk and risk premiums at earnings announcements. *The Accounting Review*, 89(5), 1579–1607.
- Baumeister, C., & Peersman, G. (2013). The role of time □varying price elasticities in accounting for volatility changes in the crude oil market. *Journal of Applied Econometrics*, 28(7), 1087–1109.

- Baxter, P., & Cotter, J. (2009). Audit committees and earnings quality. *Accounting & Finance*, 49(2), 267–290.
- Beasley, M. S. (1996). An empirical analysis of the relation between the board of director composition and financial statement fraud. *Accounting Review*, 443–465.
- Beasley, M. S., Carcello, J. V, Hermanson, D. R., & Lapides, P. D. (2000). Fraudulent financial reporting: Consideration of industry traits and corporate governance mechanisms. *Accounting Horizons*, 14(4), 441–454.
- Beaver, W. H. (1968). The information content of annual earnings announcements. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 67–92.
- Becker, C. L., DeFond, M. L., Jiambalvo, J., & Subramanyam, K. R. (1998). The effect of audit quality on earnings management. *International reviews of immunology*, 16, 1–24.
- Bedard, J., Chtourou, S. M., & Courteau, L. (2004). The effect of audit committee expertise, independence, and activity on aggressive earnings management. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 23(2), 13–35.
- Bernard, V. L., & Thomas, J. K. (1989). Post-earnings-announcement drift: delayed price response or risk premium? *Journal of Accounting Research*, 1–36.
- Bharath, S. T., Sunder, J., & Sunder, S. V. (2008). Accounting quality and debt contracting. *The Accounting Review*, 83(1), 1–28.
- Boubaker, A., Mensi, W., & Nguyen, D. K. (2008). More on corporate diversification, firm size and value creation. *Economics Bulletin*, 7(3), 1–7.
- Bou-Raad, G. (2000). Internal auditors and a value-added approach: the new business regime. *Managerial Auditing Journal*, 15(4), 182–187.
- Bozzolan, S., Favotto, F., & Ricceri, F. (2003). Italian annual intellectual capital disclosure: an empirical analysis. *Journal of Intellectual Capital*, 4(4), 543–558.
- Bradbury, M., Mak, Y. T., & Tan, S. M. (2006). Board characteristics, audit committee characteristics and abnormal accruals. *Pacific Accounting Review*, 18(2), 47–68.
- Bradshaw, M. T., Drake, M. S., Myers, J. N., & Myers, L. A. (2012). A reexamination of analysts' superiority over time-series forecasts of annual earnings. *Review of Accounting Studies*, 17(4), 944–968.
- Brennan, N. (2001). Reporting intellectual capital in annual reports: evidence from Ireland. *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, 14(4), 423–436.

- Brown-Liburd, H. L., & Wright, A. M. (2011). The effect of past client relationship and strength of the audit committee on auditor negotiations. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 30(4), 51–69.
- Cadbury, A. (1992). The Committee on the Financial Aspects of Corporate Governance and Gee and Co. *Ltd. Report*, *61*.
- Campbell, D., & Rahman, M. R. A. (2010). A longitudinal examination of intellectual capital reporting in Marks & Spencer annual reports, 1978–2008. *The British Accounting Review*, 42(1), 56–70.
- Campbell, D., Moore, G., & Shrives, P. (2006). Cross-sectional effects in community disclosure. *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, 19(1), 96-114.
- Campbell, J. L., Hansen, J., Simon, C. A., & Smith, J. L. (2014). Audit Committee Stock Options and Financial Reporting Quality after the Sarbanes-Oxley Act of 2002. *AUDITING: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 34(2), 91-120.
- Carcello, J. V, Hermanson, D. R., Neal, T. L., & Riley, R. A. (2002). Board Characteristics and Audit Fees*. *Contemporary Accounting Research*, 19(3), 365–384.
- Carcello, J. V, Hermanson, D. R., & Ye, Z. (2011). Corporate governance research in accounting and auditing: Insights, practice implications, and future research directions. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 30(3), 1–31.
- Carcello, J. V, & Neal, T. L. (2000). Audit committee composition and auditor reporting. *The Accounting Review*, 75(4), 453–467.

Universiti Utara Malavsia

- Carcello, J. V, & Neal, T. L. (2003). Audit committee characteristics and auditor dismissals following "new" going-concern reports. *The Accounting Review*, 78(1), 95–117.
- Carson, E., Simnett, R., Soo, B. S., & Wright, A. M. (2012). Changes in audit market competition and the Big N premium. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 31(3), 47–73.
- Chang, H., Cheng, C. S. A., & Reichelt, K. J. (2010). Market reaction to auditor switching from Big 4 to third-tier small accounting firms. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 29(2), 83–114.
- Chandrasekhar, K., &Vishwanath, S. R. (2009). Advanced corporate finance. PHIL earning Pvt. Ltd..
- Chen, C., Lin, C., & Lin, Y. (2008). Audit Partner Tenure, Audit Firm Tenure, and Discretionary Accruals: Does Long Auditor Tenure Impair Earnings Quality?. *Contemporary Accounting Research*, 25(2), 415–445.

- Chen, B., Chi, W., & Lin, W. Y. (2012). Auditors' Brand-Name Reputation, Audit Office Size and the Impact of Client Importance on Audit Quality at the Office Level: Evidence from China, College of Business Illinois. In Zhongnan University of Economics and Law and National Chengchi University Working paper.
- Cheung, D. K. C., & Sami, H. (2000). Price and trading volume reaction: the case of Hong Kong companies' earnings announcements. *Journal of International Accounting, Auditing and Taxation*, 9(1), 19–42.
- Chewning, E. G., Coller, M., & Tuttle, B. (2004). Do market prices reveal the decision models of sophisticated investors?: Evidence from the laboratory. *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, 29(8), 739–758.
- Chi, H. Y., & Chin, C. L. (2011). Firm versus partner measures of auditor industry expertise and effects on auditor quality. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 30(2), 201-229.
- Choi, J.-H., Jeon, K.-A., & Park, J.-I. (2004). The role of audit committees in decreasing earnings management: Korean evidence. *International Journal of Accounting, Auditing and Performance Evaluation*, *I*(1), 37–60.
- Chouchene, I. (2010). The determinants of the presence of independent directors in French board companies. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 5(5), p144.
- Chung, H., & Kallapur, S. (2003). Client importance, nonaudit services, and abnormal accruals. *The Accounting Review*, 78(4), 931–955.
- Cohen, J. R., Krishnamoorthy, G., & Wright, A. (2004). The corporate governance mosaic and financial reporting quality. *Journal of Accounting Literature*, 87–152.
- Cohen, J. R., Hoitash, U., Krishnamoorthy, G., & Wright, A. M. (2013). The effect of audit committee industry expertise on monitoring the financial reporting process. *The Accounting Review*, 89(1), 243-273.
- Committee, B. R. (1999). Audit Committee Characteristics and Restatements: A Study of the Efficacy of Certain Blue Ribbon Committee Recommendations. New York Stock Exchange and National Association of Securities Dealers, New York, NY.
- Cooper, B. J., Leung, P., & Mathews, C. M. H. (1996). Benchmarking-a comparison of internal audit in Australia, Malaysia and Hong Kong. *Managerial Auditing Journal*, 11(1), 23–29.
- Cormier, D., & Gordon, I. M. (2001). An examination of social and environmental reporting strategies. *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, 14(5), 587–617.

- Cornett, M. M., McNutt, J. J., & Tehranian, H. (2009). Corporate governance and earnings management at large US bank holding companies. *Journal of Corporate Finance*, 15(4), 412–430.
- Crabtree, A. D., Brandon, D. M., & Maher, J. J. (2006). The impact of auditor tenure on initial bond ratings. *Advances in Accounting*, 22, 97–121.
- Craswell, A. T., Francis, J. R., & Taylor, S. L. (1995). Auditor brand name reputations and industry specializations. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 20(3), 297–322.
- Dalton, D. R., Daily, C. M., Johnson, J. L., & Ellstrand, A. E. (1999). Number of directors and financial performance: A meta-analysis. *Academy of Management Journal*, 42(6), 674–686.
- Dallal, G. V. (1999). The little handbook of statistical practice. Gerard V. Dallal.
- Das, S., & Shroff, P. K. (2002). Fourth quarter reversals in earnings changes and earnings management. *Available at SSRN 308441*.
- Davidson, R. A., & Neu, D. (1993). A note of the association between audit firm size and audit. *Contemporary Accounting Research*, 9(2), 479.
- Davidson, R., Goodwin Stewart, J., & Kent, P. (2005). Internal governance structures and earnings management. *Accounting & Finance*, 45(2), 241–267.
- Davis, J. H., Schoorman, F. D., & Donaldson, L. (1997). Davis, Schoorman, and Donaldson reply: The distinctiveness of agency theory and stewardship theory. JSTOR.
- De Jong, A., Roosenboom, P., DeJong, D. V, & Mertens, G. (2005). Royal Ahold: a failure of corporate governance. *ECGI-Finance Working Paper*, (67).
- DeAngelo, L. E. (1981). Auditor size and audit quality. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 3(3), 183–199.
- Dechow, P., Ge, W., & Schrand, C. (2010). Understanding earnings quality: A review of the proxies, their determinants and their consequences. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 50(2), 344–401.
- Dechow, P. M., & Dichev, I. D. (2002). The quality of accruals and earnings: The role of accrual estimation errors. *The Accounting Review*, 77(s-1), 35–59.
- Dechow, P. M., & Skinner, D. J. (2000). Earnings management: Reconciling the views of accounting academics, practitioners, and regulators. *Accounting Horizons*, 14(2), 235–250.

- Dechow, P. M., Sloan, R. G., & Sweeney, A. P. (1995). Detecting earnings management. The Ac-counting Review 7O (April): 193-225., and. 1996. Causes and consequences of earnings manipulation: An analysis of firms subject to enforcement actions by the SEC. *Contemporary Accounting Research*, 13, 1–36.
- DeFond, M. L., & Francis, J. R. (2005). Audit research after sarbanes-oxley. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 24(s-1), 5–30.
- Dellaportas, S., Leung, P., Cooper, B. J., Rochmah Ika, S., & Mohd Ghazali, N. A. (2012). Audit committee effectiveness and timeliness of reporting: Indonesian evidence. *Managerial Auditing Journal*, 27(4), 403–424.
- Demerjian, P. R., Lev, B., Lewis, M. F., & McVay, S. E. (2012). Managerial ability and earnings quality. *The Accounting Review*, 88(2), 463–498.
- DeZoort, F. T. (1998). An analysis of experience effects on audit committee members' oversight judgments. *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, 23(1), 1–21.
- Dhaliwal, D. A. N., Naiker, V. I. C., & Navissi, F. (2010). The Association Between Accruals Quality and the Characteristics of Accounting Experts and Mix of Expertise on Audit Committees*. *Contemporary Accounting Research*, 27(3), 787–827.
- Edvinsson, L., & Malone, M. S. (1997). Intellectual Capital: Realizing Your Company's True Value by Finding Its Hidden Brainpower.
- Efendi, J., Smith, L. M., & Wong, J. (2011). Longitudinal analysis of voluntary adoption of XBRL on financial reporting. *International Journal of Economics and Accounting*, 2(2), 173–189.
- Epstein, R. A., & Epstein, R. A. (2009). Simple rules for a complex world. Harvard University Press.
- Fagbemi, T. O., & Uadiale, O. M. (2011). An appraisal of the determinants of timeliness of audit report in Nigeria: Evidence from selected quoted companies. In *The New Orleans International Academic Conference New Orleans, Louisiana USA*.
- Fama, E. F., & Jensen, M. C. (1983). Separation of ownership and control. *Journal of Law and Economics*, 301–325.
- Farber, D. B. (2005). Restoring trust after fraud: Does corporate governance matter? *The Accounting Review*, 80(2), 539–561.
- Fitz-Gibbon, C. T. and Morris, L. L. (1987), How to Analyze Data (Newburry, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.).
- Fontaine, R., & Pilote, C. (2011). Clients' preferred relationship approach with their financial statement auditor. *Current Issues in Auditing*, 6(1), P1–P6.

- Francis, J. R., & Krishnan, J. (1999). Accounting Accruals and Auditor Reporting Conservatism*. *Contemporary Accounting Research*, 16(1), 135–165.
- Francis, J. R., & Michas, P. N. (2012). The contagion effect of low-quality audits. *The Accounting Review*, 88(2), 521-552.
- García, L. S., Barbadillo, E. R., & Pérez, M. O. (2012). Audit committee and internal audit and the quality of earnings: empirical evidence from Spanish companies. *Journal of Management & Governance*, 16(2), 305–331.
- Geiger, M. A., & Raghunandan, K. (2002). Auditor tenure and audit reporting failures. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 21(1), 67–78.
- Ghosh, A., & Moon, D. (2005). Auditor tenure and perceptions of audit quality. *The Accounting Review*, 80(2), 585–612.
- Goddard, A. R., & Masters, C. (2000). Audit committees, Cadbury Code and audit fees: an empirical analysis of UK companies. *Managerial Auditing Journal*, 15(7), 358–371.
- Gramling, A. A., Maletta, M. J., Schneider, A., & Church, B. K. (2004). The role of the internal audit function in corporate governance: A synthesis of the extant internal auditing literature and directions for future research. *Journal of Accounting Literature*, 23, 194.
- Gras-Gil, E., Marin-Hernandez, S., & Garcia-Perez de Lema, D. (2012). Internal audit and financial reporting in the Spanish banking industry. *Managerial Auditing Journal*, 27(8), 728–753.

Universiti Utara Malavsia

- Gray, R., Kouhy, R., & Lavers, S. (1995). Corporate social and environmental reporting: a review of the literature and a longitudinal study of UK disclosure. *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, 8(2), 47–77.
- Guthrie, J., Petty, R., & Ricceri, F. (2006). The voluntary reporting of intellectual capital: comparing evidence from Hong Kong and Australia. *Journal of Intellectual Capital*, 7(2), 254–271.
- Hamid, K. C. A., Othman, S., & Rahim, M. A. (2015). Independence and Financial Knowledge on Audit Committee with Non-compliance of Financial Disclosure:
 A Study of Listed Companies Issued with Public Reprimand in Malaysia.
 Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences, 172, 754–761.
- Haniffa, R., Abdul Rahman, R., & Haneem Mohamed Ali, F. (2006). Board, audit committee, culture and earnings management: Malaysian evidence. *Managerial Auditing Journal*, 21(7), 783–804.
- Hanim Fadzil, F., Haron, H., & Jantan, M. (2005). Internal auditing practices and internal control system. *Managerial Auditing Journal*, 20(8), 844–866.

- Hasseldine, J., Salama, A. I., & Toms, J. S. (2005). Quantity versus quality: the impact of environmental disclosures on the reputations of UK Plcs. *The British Accounting Review*, *37*(2), 231–248.
- Hay, D. (2013). Further Evidence from Meta Analysis of Audit Fee Research. *International Journal of Auditing*, 17(2), 162–176.
- Holland, J. (2003). Intellectual capital and the capital market-organisation and competence. *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, 16(1), 39–48.
- Hope, O. K., Thomas, W. B., & Vyas, D. (2013). Financial reporting quality of US private and public firms. *The Accounting Review*, 88(5), 1715-1742.
- Huang, S., & Thakor, A. V. (2013). Investor heterogeneity, investor-management disagreement and share repurchases. *Review of Financial Studies*, 26(10), 2453–2491.
- Ibrahim, A. B. (2015). Strategy Types and Small Firms' Performance An Empirical Investigation. *Journal of Small Business Strategy*, 4(1), 13–22.
- Ismail, N. A., & Abidin, A. Z. (2009). Perception towards the importance and knowledge of information technology among auditors in Malaysia. *Journal of Accounting and Taxation*, *I*(4), 61–69.
- Jamal, A. (2003). Retailing in a multicultural world: the interplay of retailing, ethnic identity and consumption. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 10(1), 1–11.
- Jenkins, D. S., & Velury, U. (2008). Does auditor tenure influence the reporting of conservative earnings? *Journal of Accounting and Public Policy*, 27(2), 115–132.
- Jensen, H. L., & Yiu, K. (1995). Audit independence and Confucian values. In Proceedings of the Seventh Asian-Pacific Conference in International Accounting Issues, California State University, Fresno, CA.
- Jensen, M. C., & Meckling, W. H. (1976). Theory of the firm: Managerial behavior, agency costs and ownership structure. *Journal of Financial Economics*, 3(4), 305–360.
- Jones, J. J. (1991). Earnings management during import relief investigations. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 193–228.
- Jubb, C., & Lin, R. Y. (2012). Rewarding Audit Committee Members: Does it Influence Diligence and Financial Reporting Quality?. Available at SSRN 2190314.
- Kalbers, L. P., & Fogarty, T. J. (1993). Audit committee effectiveness: An empirical investigation of the contribution of power. *Auditing*, *12*(1), 24.

- Karamanou, I., & Vafeas, N. (2005). The association between corporate boards, audit committees, and management earnings forecasts: An empirical analysis. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 43(3), 453–486.
- Khurana, I. K., & Raman, K. K. (2004). Litigation risk and the financial reporting credibility of Big 4 versus non-Big 4 audits: Evidence from Anglo-American countries. *The Accounting Review*, 79(2), 473–495.
- Kim, Y., Park, M. S., & Wier, B. (2012). Is earnings quality associated with corporate social responsibility?. *The Accounting Review*, 87(3), 761-796.
- Klein, A. (2002). Audit committee, board of director characteristics, and earnings management. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 33(3), 375–400.
- Krishnan, J. (2001). Corporate governance and internal control: An empirical analysis. In *American Accounting Association Annual Meeting*. Atlanta, Georgia.
- Krishnan, J. (2005). Audit committee quality and internal control: An empirical analysis. *The Accounting Review*, 80(2), 649–675.
- Krogstad, J. L., Ridley, A. J., & Rittenberg, L. E. (1999). Where We're Going: How the new definition of internal auditing impacts the profession's evolution. *Internal Auditor*, 56, 26–33.
- Lalonde, C., & Adler, C. (2015). Information asymmetry in process consultation: An empirical research on leader-client/consultant relationship in healthcare organizations. *Leadership & Organization Development Journal*, 36(2), 177–211.
- Lang, M., & Lundholm, R. (1993). Cross-sectional determinants of analyst ratings of corporate disclosures. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 246–271.
- Larson, R. K., Herz, P. J., & Kenny, S. Y. (2011). Academics and the development of IFRS: An invitation to participate. *Journal of International Accounting Research*, 10(2), 97–103.
- Leung, P., Cooper, B. J., Cooper, B. J., Leung, P., & Wong, G. (2006). The Asia Pacific literature review on internal auditing. *Managerial Auditing Journal*, 21(8), 822–834.
- Li, J., Mangena, M., & Pike, R. (2012). The effect of audit committee characteristics on intellectual capital disclosure. *The British Accounting Review*, 44(2), 98 110.
- Lin, J. W., Li, J. F., & Yang, J. S. (2006). The effect of audit committee performance on earnings quality. *Managerial Auditing Journal*, 21(9), 921–933.

- Lin, S., Pizzini, M., Vargus, M., & Bardhan, I. R. (2011). The role of the internal audit function in the disclosure of material weaknesses. *The Accounting Review*, 86(1), 287–323.
- Loderer, C., & Waelchli, U. (2009). Firm age and performance. *University of Bern, Working Paper*.
- Madawaki, A. (2012). Audit Committee Characteristics and Financial Reporting Quality: Evidence from Nigerian Listed Companies. *Unpublished Thesis, Universiti Utara Malaysia*.
- Magness, V. (2006). Strategic posture, financial performance and environmental disclosure: An empirical test of legitimacy theory. *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, 19(4), 540–563.
- Mangena, M., & Pike, R. (2005). The effect of audit committee shareholding, financial expertise and size on interim financial disclosures. *Accounting and Business Research*, 35(4), 327–349.
- Mansi, S. A., Maxwell, W. F., & Miller, D. P. (2004). Does auditor quality and tenure matter to investors? Evidence from the bond market. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 42(4), 755–793.
- Mansor, N., Che-Ahmad, A., Ahmad-Zaluki, N. A., & Osman, A. H. (2013). Corporate governance and earnings management: A study on the Malaysian family and non-family owned PLCs. *Procedia Economics and Finance*, 7, 221–229.
- Mathews, C., Cooper, B. J., & Leung, P. (1994). A Profile of Internal Audit in Malaysia–1994. *Institute of Internal Auditors–Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur*.
- McDaniel, L., Martin, R. D., & Maines, L. A. (2002). Evaluating financial reporting quality: The effects of financial expertise vs. financial literacy. *The Accounting Review*, 77(s-1), 139–167.
- McMullen, D. A. (1996). Audit committee performance: An investigation of the consequences associated with audit committees. *Auditing*, 15(1), 87.
- Mohamed, Z., Mat Zain, M., Subramaniam, N., Yusoff, W., & Fadzilah, W. (2012). Internal audit attributes and external audit's reliance on internal audit: implications for audit fees. *International Journal of Auditing*, 16(3), 268–285.
- Mohd Saleh, N., Mohd Iskandar, T., & Mohid Rahmat, M. (2007). Audit committee characteristics and earnings management: Evidence from Malaysia. *Asian Review of Accounting*, 15(2), 147–163.
- Myers, J. N., Myers, L. A., Palmrose, Z.-V., & Scholz, S. (2003). Mandatory auditor rotation: Evidence from restatements. *Academic Working*.

- Myers, J. N., Myers, L. A., & Omer, T. C. (2003). Exploring the term of the auditorclient relationship and the quality of earnings: A case for mandatory auditor rotation?. *The Accounting Review*, 78(3), 779-799.
- Nurunnabi, M., Hossain, M., & Hossain, M. (2011). Intellectual capital reporting in a South Asian country: evidence from Bangladesh. *Journal of Human Resource Costing & Accounting*, 15(3), 196–233.
- NYSE (2009), Listed Company Manual, New York Stock Exchange, New York, NY, available at: www.nysemanual.nyse.com/lcm/
- Ou, J. A., & Penman, S. H. (1989). Accounting measurement, price-earnings ratio, and the information content of security prices. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 111–144.
- Owusu-Ansah, S., & Leventis, S. (2006). Timeliness of corporate annual financial reporting in Greece. *European Accounting Review*, 15(2), 273–287.
- Palmrose, Z.-V. (1986). Audit fees and auditor size: Further evidence. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 97–110.
- Pergola, T. M., & Verreault, D. A. (2009). Motivations and potential monitoring effects of large shareholders. *Corporate Governance: The International Journal of Business in Society*, 9(5), 551–563.
- Prawitt, D. F., Smith, J. L., & Wood, D. A. (2009). Internal audit quality and earnings management. *The Accounting Review*, 84(4), 1255–1280.
- Raghunandan, K., & Rama, D. V. (2007). Determinants of audit committee diligence. *Accounting Horizons*, 21(3), 265–279.
- Rennie, M. D., Kopp, L. S., & Lemon, W. M. (2010). Exploring trust and the auditor-client relationship: Factors influencing the auditor's trust of a client representative. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 29(1), 279–293.
- Riahi-Belkaoui, A. (2003). Intellectual capital and firm performance of US multinational firms: a study of the resource-based and stakeholder views. *Journal of Intellectual Capital*, 4(2), 215–226.
- Rose, C., & Mejer, C. (2003). The Danish corporate governance system: from stakeholder orientation towards shareholder value. *Corporate Governance: An International Review*, 11, 335–344.
- Scarbrough, D. P., Rama, D. V, & Raghunandan, K. (1998). Audit committee composition and interaction with internal auditing: Canadian evidence. *Accounting Horizons*, 12(1), 51.
- Schipper, K., & Vincent, L. (2003). Earnings quality. Accounting Horizons, 17, 97.

- Schleicher, T., Hussainey, K., & Walker, M. (2007). Loss firms' annual report narratives and share price anticipation of earnings. *The British Accounting Review*, 39(2), 153–171.
- Schmidt, J., & Wilkins, M. S. (2012). Bringing darkness to light: The influence of auditor quality and audit committee expertise on the timeliness of financial statement restatement disclosures. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 32(1), 221-244.
- Sengupta, P. (1998). Corporate disclosure quality and the cost of debt. *Accounting Review*, 459–474.
- Sharma, V. D. (2004). Board of director characteristics, institutional ownership, and fraud: Evidence from Australia. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 23(2), 105–117.
- Sharma, V. D., & Iselin, E. R. (2012). The association between audit committee multiple-directorships, tenure, and financial misstatements. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 31(3), 149–175.
- Siagian, F. T., & Tresnaningsih, E. (2011). The impact of independent directors and independent audit committees on earnings quality reported by Indonesian firms. *Asian Review of Accounting*, 19(3), 192–207.
- Singhvi, S. S. (1968). Characteristics and implications of inadequate disclosure: A case study of India. *The International Journal of Accounting*, 3(2), 29–43.
- Smith, R. (2003). Audit committees combined code guidance. *London: Financial Reporting Council*.
- Too, S. W., Wan Yusoff, W. F., & Chase, R. (2015). Exploring Intellectual Capital Disclosure as a Mediator for the Relationship between IPO Firm-Specific Characteristics and Underpricing. *Journal of Intellectual Capital*, 16(3).
- Vafeas, N. (1999). Board meeting frequency and firm performance. *Journal of Financial Economics*, 53(1), 113–142.
- Vafeas, N. (2005). Audit committees, boards, and the quality of reported earnings. *Contemporary Accounting Research*, 22(4), 1093–1122.
- Vergauwen, P. G. M. C., & Van Alem, F. J. C. (2005). Annual report IC disclosures in the Netherlands, France and Germany. *Journal of Intellectual Capital*, 6(1), 89–104.
- Wallace, Kamal Naser & Araceli Mora (1994): The Relationship Between the Comprehensiveness of Corporate Annual Reports and Firm Characteristics in Spain, *Accounting and Business Research*, 25:97, 41-53.

- Walsh, J. P., & Seward, J. K. (1990). On the efficiency of internal and external corporate control mechanisms. *Academy of Management Review*, 15(3), 421–458.
- Whiting, R. H., & Woodcock, J. (2011). Firm characteristics and intellectual capital disclosure by Australian companies. *Journal of Human Resource Costing & Accounting*, 15(2), 102–126.
- Xie, B., Davidson, W. N., & DaDalt, P. J. (2003). Earnings management and corporate governance: the role of the board and the audit committee. *Journal of Corporate Finance*, 9(3), 295–316.
- Yang, J. S., & Krishnan, J. (2005). Audit committees and quarterly earnings management. *International Journal of Auditing*, 9(3), 201–219.
- Ye, P., Carson, E., & Simnett, R. (2011). Threats to auditor independence: The impact of relationship and economic bonds. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 30(1), 121–148.
- Yi, A., & Davey, H. (2010). Intellectual capital disclosure in Chinese (mainland) companies. *Journal of Intellectual Capital*, 11(3), 326–347.
- Zhang, J. (2008). The contracting benefits of accounting conservatism to lenders and borrowers. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 45(1), 27–54.

Universiti Utara Malaysia