The copyright © of this thesis belongs to its rightful author and/or other copyright owner. Copies can be accessed and downloaded for non-commercial or learning purposes without any charge and permission. The thesis cannot be reproduced or quoted as a whole without the permission from its rightful owner. No alteration or changes in format is allowed without permission from its rightful owner.
L1 MEDIATION IN L2 WRITING WITHIN GROUPS OF LOW-PROFICIENT STUDENTS AT TERTIARY LEVEL

NOOR ‘IZZATI BINTI AHMAD SHAHIAI

MASTER OF EDUCATION
UNIVERSITI UTARA MALAYSIA
2016
Permission to Use

In presenting this thesis in fulfilment of the requirements for a postgraduate degree from Universiti Utara Malaysia, I agree that the University Library may make it freely available for inspection. I further agree that permission for the copying of this thesis in any manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purpose may be granted by my supervisor(s) or, in their absence, by the Dean of Awang Had Salleh Graduate School of Arts and Sciences. It is understood that any copying or publication or use of this thesis or parts thereof for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission. It is also understood that due recognition shall be given to me and to Universiti Utara Malaysia for any scholarly use which may be made of any material from my thesis.

Requests for permission to copy or to make other use of materials in this thesis, in whole or in part, should be addressed to:

Dean of Awang Had Salleh Graduate School of Arts and Sciences
UUM College of Arts and Sciences
Universiti Utara Malaysia
06010 UUM Sintok
Abstrak


Kata Kunci: Pengantaraan bahasa pertama, Pembelajaran bahasa kedua, Pencapaian rendah, Tahap pendidikan tinggi
Abstract

The use of Malay as the first language (L1) in learning English as a second language (L2) among low-proficient students at tertiary level has been a constant debate over the years. Previous studies, mainly using quantitative strategies, have generally shown positive preference among these learners while working individually. However, there is a need to investigate by using qualitative perspective on how L1 may assist in L2 learning especially in groups, as an alternative approach to language learning among these students. This qualitative case study uses Sociocultural Theory (SCT) as its main theoretical framework, whereby interaction is perceived as an input to trigger the mediated process of human mental functioning. This study aims to investigate the factors for low-proficient Malay students’ use of Malay (L1) during group discussion in English (L2) lesson. This study also investigates the process in which L1 mediation helps them to complete an L2 task conducted in groups. The main data is obtained via audio recording, video recorded observations and stimulated recall interviews on six low-proficient students in an L2 class in one higher education institution in Malaysia. Data was analyzed using thematic analysis approach. The findings show that L1 mediation is applied due to limited vocabulary in L2, difficulty in speech production, and to ensure mutual understanding of speech with one another. The mediation is achieved by employing memory recall, peer corrections, and peer assistance in both L1 and L2 in order to understand instructions in L2 task, to generate ideas in group discussion, and to present ideas into written form in L2. This study contributes to alternative teaching method in the classroom, especially towards tertiary level students with low proficiency in English, whereby they are allowed to use L1 to mediate their L2 learning. This study also implies a different perspective in the L1 and L2 controversial issue, in which the academic policy and educators’ rules need to be revisited especially if L1 can assist L2 learning.

Keywords: L1 mediation, L2 learning, Low-proficiency, Tertiary education
Acknowledgement

Praise is to Allah s.w.t. for making my path crossed with someone who truly deserves my very great appreciation, who has been infinitely contributing her knowledge, wisdom, time and effort in guiding me as a novice researcher through the path of joyous success. Assoc. Prof. Dr. Fauziah bt Abdul Rahim, my one and only supervisor has provided me with tremendous amount of work, assignments, reading materials, as well as useful techniques in doing research. This has made me realize that what matters most is not really the end product, but the entire journey that I have gone through.

I would also like to extend my thanks to Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ruzlan Md. Ali (Research Methodology), Dr Sarimah Shaik Abdullah (Qualitative Research in Education), and Dr Ahmad Azman Mokhtar (Academic Writing) for their advice and assistance throughout the lectures. I personally enjoyed the learner-friendly approach that they applied, and I am more than happy to recommend their classes to other students.

Finally, I wish to express my gratitude to those who have supported me financially, especially my former employers, UiTM Kedah and KLMUC, my current employer, UiTM Seri Iskandar, and MOE for MyBrain15 fund.

To my beloved parents and family; Roosilawaty, Ahmad Shafiai, Mohd Taufik, Khalif Irfan and Khalif Imran, this one is for you.

Thank you very much.
# Table of Contents

Permission to Use ....................................................................................................................... i  
Abstrak ....................................................................................................................................... ii  
Abstract ..................................................................................................................................... iii  
Acknowledgement .................................................................................................................... iv  
Table of Contents ..................................................................................................................... v  
List of Tables ............................................................................................................................ viii  
List of Figures .......................................................................................................................... ix  
List of Appendices .................................................................................................................... x  
Glossary of Terms ..................................................................................................................... xi  

**CHAPTER ONE INTRODUCTION OF THE RESEARCH ............................. 1**  
1.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 1  
1.2 Background of the Study ............................................................................................. 2  
1.3 Problem Statement ...................................................................................................... 7  
1.4 Research Objectives ................................................................................................... 11  
1.5 Research Questions ..................................................................................................... 11  
1.6 Significance of the Study ............................................................................................ 11  
1.7 Limitation of Study ...................................................................................................... 13  
1.8 Operational Definition ............................................................................................... 14  
1.9 Conclusion ................................................................................................................. 15  

**CHAPTER TWO REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE ................... 16**  
2.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................... 16  
2.2 Sociocultural Theory as a Theoretical Framework .................................................... 17  
2.3 Exploring the Importance of Social Interaction in Language Learning ............... 21  
  2.3.1 Collaborative Learning within L2 Learners’ Group Work ........................................ 22  
  2.3.2 Learners’ Ways of Learning L2 .............................................................................. 24  
  2.3.3 Considering Discourse and Conversational Analysis ............................................ 27  
2.4 The Use of L1 Mediation in L2 Learning .................................................................... 30  
2.5 Teachers’ Attitude towards L1 Mediation in L2 Learning .......................................... 38  
2.6 Writing Task for L2 Learners ....................................................................................... 41  
2.7 Conclusion .................................................................................................................... 45
# CHAPTER THREE RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................ 46
3.2 Research Design ................................................................................................... 46
3.3 Quality and Ethics in Research ............................................................................ 47
  3.3.1 Autonomy .................................................................................................. 47
  3.3.2 Anonymity ................................................................................................ 47
  3.3.3 Validity and Trustworthiness .................................................................... 48
3.4 Selection of Participants in the Main Study ........................................................ 50
  3.4.1 Participants in Group A ............................................................................ 53
  3.4.2 Participants in Group B .............................................................................. 53
3.5 Research Instruments ........................................................................................... 54
  3.5.1 Observation Fieldnotes and Interview Protocol ........................................ 55
  3.5.2 Researcher as an Instrument ...................................................................... 57
3.6 Data Collection Procedure ................................................................................... 58
  3.6.1 Assigning L2 Writing Task to the Participants ........................................ 59
  3.6.2 Setting Up Audio and Video Recording Devices ...................................... 59
  3.6.3 The Use of Stimulated Recall Interviews ................................................ 61
3.7 Data Analysis .................................................................................................... 62
  3.7.1 Transcription .............................................................................................. 63
  3.7.2 Organization ............................................................................................... 64
  3.7.3 Familiarization ........................................................................................... 65
  3.7.4 Coding ........................................................................................................ 66
  3.7.5 Categories or Themes ................................................................................ 66
3.8 The Execution of Pilot Studies ............................................................................ 67
  3.8.1 Background of Pilot Study 1...................................................................... 67
  3.8.2 Findings for Pilot Study 1 ........................................................................ 68
  3.8.3 Background of Pilot Study 2...................................................................... 69
  3.8.4 Findings for Pilot Study 2 ........................................................................ 70
  3.8.5 Background of Pilot Study 3...................................................................... 71
  3.8.6 Findings for Pilot Study 3 ........................................................................ 72
  3.8.7 Conclusion from Pilot Studies ................................................................... 72
3.9 Emerging Strategies from Pilot Studies .............................................................. 73
List of Tables

Table 1.1 English Performance SPM 2010 - 2011 Based on Locations…………………………4
Table 3.1 Background of the Participants ...........................................................................52
Table 3.2 Sample of Descriptive Fieldnotes and Interview Protocol .................................56
Table 3.3 Transcription Symbols .......................................................................................63
Table 4.1 Strategies Emerged from the Main Data ............................................................75
List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Cambridge 1119 English Performance SPM 2010 Based on Ethnicity………………3

Figure 2.1: The Zone of Proximal Development…………………………………………………20

Figure 2.2: Typology of Qualitative Research…………………………………………………28

Figure 2.3: Writing Process Model…………………………………………………………………..43

Figure 3.1: Position of Camera in L2 Classrooms………………………………………………49

Figure 3.2: Research Design Framework…………………………………………………………..58

Figure 3.3: Seating Arrangement and Position of Recording Devices……………………………61
List of Appendices

Appendix A ...................................................................................................................... 134
Appendix B ...................................................................................................................... 138
Appendix C ...................................................................................................................... 139
Appendix D ...................................................................................................................... 141
Glossary of Terms

**GPMP** – *Gred Purata Mata Pelajaran* (Subject Average Grade)

**L1** – First language in this study (Malay)

**L2** – Second language in this study (English)

**MOE** – Ministry of Education

**MUET** – Malaysian University English Test

**PPSMI** – *Pengajaran dan Pembelajaran Sains dan Matematik dalam Bahasa Inggeris* (Teaching of Science and Math in English)

**SCT** – Sociocultural Theory

**ZPD** – The Zone of Proximal Development
CHAPTER ONE
INTRODUCTION OF THE RESEARCH

1.1 Introduction

Second language (henceforth will be referred to as L2) can either be acquired or learned, but both terms are controversial as it is difficult to determine whether one’s proficiency in a second language is as equal as the first language (henceforth will be referred to as L1) (Denham & Lobeck, 2013). However, some previous works have used the terms alternately without any emphasis on the differences (Malone, 2012; Nazary, 2008). For easier discussion, this study will only use the term L2 learning as reference to the process of obtaining the ability in using L2. Furthermore, this study is conducted in a classroom setting, making the term “learning” a more appropriate word than “acquisition”.

The influence of colonial era has led to English language being recognized as the L2 in this country and Malay language being the official and national language, or L1. Nonetheless, as years pass by, the standard of English has deteriorated in the urban and especially so in the rural areas where English is hardly spoken. In fact, English use is still minimal and mostly for school purposes (Hazita, 2006). Due to the limited practice of English within some communities in Malaysia, many students struggle to learn the language. Thus, there is a need to understand how students who lack the mastery of L2 learn the language.
REFERENCES


Roussol, K. H. (2010). *Teachers’ and Students’ Perceptions towards the Use of Arabic in Secondary Level English Language Classrooms.* Sharjah: AUS.


