

**MALAYSIAN TEACHERS' EVALUATION
OF FORM ONE (KBSM) ENGLISH TEXTBOOKS:
A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS**

ROHAIZA JUPRI

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the award of the degree of
M.A. in Applied Linguistics
(Department of Language and Linguistics)
UNIVERSITY OF ESSEX

UNIT KOLEKSI KHAS

September 1994

TABLE OF CONTENTS

			<u>Page</u>
ABSTRACT			iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS			iv
CHAPTER 1	-	INTRODUCTION	1
	1.1	-	3
		The Contemporary Pedagogical Scene: communicative approach	
	1.2	-	9
		Malaysian contemporary educational scene - KBSM and the English syllabus	
CHAPTER 2	-	EVALUATING ELT TEXTBOOKS - AN OVERVIEW	13
	2.1	-	14
		The Context of Evaluation	
CHAPTER 3	-	ASPECTS OF THE RESEARCH	19
	3.1	-	19
		Context of the Research	
	3.2	-	23
		Methodology	
	3.3	-	24
		The Questionnaire	
		3.3.1 Evaluative criteria checklist	27
		3.3.2 Close Questions	35
CHAPTER 4	-	FINDINGS OF THE RESEARCH	36
	4.1	-	37
		Comparative Display Forms	
	4.1.1	-	38
		How to read and interpret the VMP graph	
	4.1.2	-	44
		Pre-Analysis	
		a) Mean Evaluation Process	48
	4.1.3	-	52
		The analysis	
	4.1.4	-	69
		Summary of the findings	

	<u>Page</u>
4.2 - Comments on the Textbooks and Their Usage	75
4.2.1 Teachers' satisfaction with textbooks	77
4.2.2 The success of communicative approach to the teachers	80
4.2.3 Problems/constraints when using the textbooks	84
4.2.4 The frequency of using 'outside' materials	88
4.2.5 Summary on the teachers' general comments/opinions.	90
 CHAPTER 5 - CONCLUSION	 93
 BIBLIOGRAPHY	 100
 APPENDIXES	 103
1 - Questionnaire	
2 - CDF for "TITIAN"	
3 - CDF for "CREATIVE ENGLISH"	
4 - CDF for "LAUNCH INTO...."	
5 - CDF for "HEADSTART"	
6 - CDF for "NEW WAY ENGLISH"	
7 - CDF for "INTEGRATED APPROACH"	
8 - samples of exercise taken from "HEADSTART"	
9 - excerpt of vocabulary list taken from "HEADSTART"	
10 - excerpts from Form One Syllabus Specifications - English	
11 - samples of exercise taken from "HEADSTART"	
12 - samples of exercise taken from "Integrated Approach".	

ABSTRACT

Research in textbook and materials evaluation which was the major focus in many ELT published articles and books in the 1980s are still lacking, even though one cannot deny its important role when choosing an appropriate text for any particular language course. In this thesis, I will present the outcome of my attempt on using a formal evaluative checklist (based on Tucker's (1975) and William's (1983) textbook evaluation scheme) with the Malaysian teachers on six different Form One textbooks. The mini textbook evaluation survey aims to find out the values of the new English textbooks (which are written and published under the recently implemented KBSM curriculum) and how they compare with one another, after being used for about six years with the Form One pupils (hence, a summative evaluation).

33 teachers from 12 different schools throughout four states in Malaysia have participated and give their full cooperation by completing a Textbook Evaluation Form-cum-Questionnaire. 35 criteria in the checklist serves as the main evaluative framework which have been adapted to suit the Malaysian educational context.

On the overall, this research has been a very rewarding experience for me, as it not only finds out how the Form One KBSM English textbooks fare with one another in the assessment, as well as shedding us with some light on the communicative potential of the books with the pupils' needs. The research, which in a way, is an experimental application of Tucker's evaluative scheme, has also taught me much on the development of textbook evaluative framework and its importance to teachers, even though they may not be actively involved in the selection of their textbooks, as Malaysian teachers are.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Firstly, I would like to express my utmost gratitude to all the academic staff of the Department of Language and Linguistics, University of Essex, especially to Chris Shaw, my MA supervisor, for his advice and encouragement to proceed with my topic. Also, a special word of thanks to Dr. Roger Hawkins, Dr. Louisa Sadler, Jo and Steve Mc Donough, who, at some stage of the dissertation, have assisted and shown me their concern.

I would also like to thank Universiti Utara Malaysia for sponsoring me to pursue my M.A. at United Kingdom. To all the following schools (with regards to the Principals, Heads of the English Department, and participating teachers):

1. Sek. Menengah Changlun, KEDAH
2. Sek. Menengah Pulau Nyiur, KEDAH
3. Sek. Menengah Seberang Perak, KEDAH
4. Sek. Menengah St. Nicholas Convent (Alor Setar), KEDAH
5. Sek. Menengah Sultan Abdul Halim, KEDAH
6. Sek. Menengah Sultanah Asma, KEDAH
7. Maktab Mahmud (Puteri), KEDAH
8. Sek. Menengah Agama Melor, KELANTAN
9. Sek. Menengah Beaufort, SABAH
10. Sek. Menengah Keb. Gadong, SABAH
11. Sek. Menengah Bukit Bandaraya, KUALA LUMPUR,

I am greatly indebted to all of you for your cooperation in providing me with the data necessary for my thesis.

My words of appreciation also goes to all those who are, either directly or indirectly, involved in the data collection/questionnaire distribution, i.e. Hafidzah Omar, Noor Hafidzah Omar, Hadzrawiah Abu Kasim, Nur Hanim Khalili, Mutiara Mohammad, Zahyah Hanafi, Cikgu Rosli, Saodah Subhi and Ustazah Sopiah. Mutiara, who is an English KBSM textbook writer for Form Five, has also been resourceful for furnishing me with valuable information and insights of the contemporary scene of Malaysian English textbooks and their development.

To Sharon Goh and Kak Liza - a big thank you for all your help, and to Nilufer Demirkan, thanks for inspiring me initially to do the (mini) textbook evaluation project in Malaysia.

Last, but not least, to my parents (Abah & Mak), my husband (Mahreez) and my beloved daughters (Izreen & Aleeya), no words can adequately express my appreciation and gratitude for all your love, support and encouragement that have seen me through my 'student-mother year' - TERIMA KASIH.

**MALAYSIAN TEACHERS' EVALUATION OF FORM ONE (KBSM)
ENGLISH TEXTBOOKS: A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS**

CHAPTER 1 ■ INTRODUCTION

With the plethora of coursebooks available at present in the market for English language learners, it is not surprising if teachers, or course planners alike, find the task of selecting the appropriate book for their students difficult – be it a proper coursebook or only as a supplementary. This is because, as most ESL/EFL (English as a Second/Foreign Language) teachers are fully aware, the role of textbook is actually very important as it embodies the core of the English language course itself – the content/syllabus, aims, values, and perhaps, most importantly, the current pedagogical approach and learning theories behind it. (Dubin 1978; van Els, et al, 1984; Low, 1989).

This is especially more evident when the published material is intended to be the core textbook, and not merely as a supplementary. Teachers, as well as students, are known to be quite dependent on the use of textbook as their point of reference, either in classrooms or for revision, as their English syllabus usually revolves around it. It is not surprising then when Dubin (1978: 128) describes the textbook as the “basic ingredient in language courses”. This consequently requires teachers (and whoever is in the textbook selection committee) to be exceptionally selective when choosing a textbook, especially when there is a wide selection to choose from. The book selector has also to consider many factors that the book must meet such as the objectives of the course and the curriculum, the needs of the students, the course duration, the allocated budget, and many more. To sum it all up, choosing an appropriate textbook can be likened to making a sound investment, as highlighted by Sheldon (1988:237):

The contents of
the thesis is for
internal user
only

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. **BREEN, M. & CANDLIN, C.** (1979) The essentials of a communicative curriculum in language teaching. *Applied Linguistics*, 1/2:89-112.
2. **BREEN, M. & CANDLIN, C.** (1987) Which materials?: a consumer's and designer's guide, in L. Sheldon (ed.) *ELT Textbooks and Materials: ELT Documents 126*, Oxford : Modern English Publications/British Council.
3. **BRUMFIT, C.** (1980) *Problems and Principles in English Teaching*. Oxford: Pergamon.
4. **BRUMFIT, C.** (1984) Teaching the 'general' student, in K. Johnson and K. Morrow (eds.) *Communication in the Classroom*, London : Longman.
5. **BRUMFIT, C.** (1986) *The Practice of Communicative Teaching: ELT Documents 124*, Oxford: Pergamon/British Council.
6. **CUNNINGSWORTH, A.** (1984) *Evaluating and Selecting EFL Teaching Materials*, London : Heinemann.
7. **DUBIN, F.** (1978) The shape they are in now and the shape of textbooks to come, in H.D. Brown, C. Yorio and R.H. Crymes (eds.) *ON TESOL 1978-EFL Policies, Programs, Practices*, Washington : TESOL.
8. GRANT, N. (1987) *Making the Most of Your Textbook*, London : Longman.
9. **HARMER, J.** (1991) *The Practice of English Language Teaching*, London : Longman.
10. **HUTCHINSON, T.** (1987) What's underneath? : an interactive view of materials evaluation, in L. Sheldon (ed.) *ELT Textbooks and Materials : ELT Documents 126*, Oxford : Modern English Publications/British Council.
11. **KEM. PENDIDIKAN MALAYSIA** (1988a) *Falsafah Pendidikan Negara*. Kuala Lumpur : Pusat Perkembangan Kurikulum.
12. **KEM. PENDIDIKAN MALAYSIA** (1988b) *Huraian Sukatan Pelajaran Tingkatan 1 - Bahasa Inggeris*. Kuala Lumpur : Pusat Perkembangan Kurikulum.
13. **KEM. PENDIDIKAN MALAYSIA** (1989) *Compendium: A Concise Guide for Teachers of English - Vol. 1*. Kuala Lumpur : J/Kuasa Perancangan & Penyelarasan Program Bahasa Inggeris di Sekolah.

14. **KEM. PENDIDIKAN MALAYSIA** (1993) *Garis Panduan Menyediakan Pakej Buku Bahasa Inggeris Tahun 1 KBSR SWSRK*. Kuala Lumpur: Bahagian Buku Teks.
15. **LOW, G.** (1989) *Appropriate design : the internal organisation of course units*, in R.K. Johnson (ed.) *The Second Language Curriculum*, Cambridge: CUP.
16. **MALEY, A.** (1985) *On chinks, cheese, babies and bathwater and squared circles*, in Larsen, Judd and Messerschmitt (eds.) *ON TESOL 1984 - A Brave New World*, Washington : TESOL.
17. **MARIANI, L.** (1980) *Evaluating coursebooks*, *Modern English Teaching*, 8/1:27-31.
18. **MATTHEWS, A.** (1985) *Choosing the best available textbook*, in A. Matthews, M. Spratt & L. Dangerfield (eds.) *At the Chalkface : Practical Techniques in Language Teaching*, London : Edward Arnold.
19. **MC DONOUGH, J. & SHAW, C.** (1993) *Materials and Methods In ELT*. Oxford : Basil Blackwell.
20. **MITCHELL, R.** (1994) *The communicative approach to language teaching*, in A. Swarbrick (ed.) *Teaching Modern Languages*, London Routledge.
21. **MITCHELL, R.** (1988) *Communicative Language Teaching in Practice*, London : CILT.
22. **NEW STRAITS TIMES** - 1/12/1993. *Good results in first PMR* (by Azrin Azmi) .
23. **NEW STRAITS TIMES** - 9/4/1994. *Ways to write a good textbook* (by Tan Gim Ean)
24. **PLATT, J. & WEBER, H.** (1980) *English in Singapore and Malaysia - Status : Features: Functions*, Kuala Lumpur : Oxford University Press.
25. **SHAMIN, F.** (1992) *An interactive approach to using checklists for materials evaluation*, in S. Ramadevi, R. Matthew and R. Eapen (eds.) *The ELT Curriculum : Emerging Issues*, Delhi : B.R. Publishing.
26. **SHELDON, L.E.** (1987) *ELT textbooks and materials : ELT Documents 126*, Oxford : Modern English Publication/British Council.
27. **SHELDON. L.E.** (1988) *Evaluating ELT textbooks and materials*, *ELT Journal*, 42/4 : 237-46.
28. **TUCKER, A.** (1975) *Evaluating beginning textbooks*. *English Teaching Forum XIII/3/4* : 355-61.

29. **Van ELS, T.**, et al (1984) *Applied Linguistics & the Learning and Teaching of Foreign Lanugages*, London : Edward Arnold.
30. **Van LIER, L.** (1979) Choosing a new EFL course. *Mextesol Journal*, III/3:2-14.
31. **WALDEMAR, M.** (1988) *Methods in English Language Teaching*, London : Prentice-Hall.
32. **WILKINS, D.** (1976) *Notional Syllabuses*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
33. **WILLIAMS, D.** (1983) Developing criteria for textbook evaluation. *ELT Journal*, 37/3;25 1-55.
34. **YOUNG, R. & LEE, S.** (1985) EFL curriculum innovation and teachers' attitudes, in Larsen, Judd & Messerschmitt (eds.) *ON TESOL 1984 - A Brave New World*, Washington : TESOL.