

The copyright © of this thesis belongs to its rightful author and/or other copyright owner. Copies can be accessed and downloaded for non-commercial or learning purposes without any charge and permission. The thesis cannot be reproduced or quoted as a whole without the permission from its rightful owner. No alteration or changes in format is allowed without permission from its rightful owner.



**THE BALANCE SCORECARD PRACTICE AND PERFORMANCE IN XY
UNIVERSITY**



PETER U. ANUFORO

MASTER OF SCIENCE (INTERNATIONAL ACCOUNTING)

UNIVERSITI UTARA MALAYSIA

MAY 2018

**THE BALANCE SCORECARD PRACTICE AND PERFORMANCE IN XY
UNIVERSITY**

By



**Thesis Submitted to
Othman Yeop Abdullah Graduate School of Business,
Universiti Utara Malaysia,
in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirement for the Master of
Sciences (International Accounting)**



PERAKUAN KERJA KERTAS PENYELIDIKAN
(Certification of Research Paper)

Saya, mengaku bertandatangan, memperakukan bahawa
(I, the undersigned, certified that)

PETER U. ANUFORO (821579)

Calon untuk Ijazah Sarjana
(Candidate for the degree of)

MASTER OF SCIENCE (INTERNATIONAL ACCOUNTING)

telah mengemukakan kertas penyelidikan yang bertajuk
(has presented his/her research paper of the following title)

THE BALANCE SCORECARD PRACTICE AND PERFORMANCE IN XY UNIVERSITY

Seperti yang tercatat di muka surat tajuk dan kulit kertas penyelidikan
(as it appears on the title page and front cover of the research paper)

Bahawa kertas penyelidikan tersebut boleh diterima dari segi bentuk serta kandungan dan meliputi bidang ilmu dengan memuaskan.

(that the research paper acceptable in the form and content and that a satisfactory knowledge of the field is covered by the research paper).

Nama Penyelia : **DR. HAZELINE BINTI AYOUP**
(Name of Supervisor)

Tandatangan : 
(Signature)

Tarikh : **3/06/2018**
(Date)

Permission to Use

In presenting this dissertation/project paper in partial fulfillment of the requirements for a Post Graduate degree from the Universiti Utara Malaysia (UUM), I agree that the Library of this university may make it freely available for inspection. I further agree that permission for copying this dissertation/project paper in any manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purposes may be granted by my supervisor(s) or in their absence, by the Dean of Othman Yeop Abdullah Graduate School of Business where I did my dissertation/project paper. It is understood that any copying or publication or use of this dissertation/project paper parts of it for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission. It is also understood that due recognition shall be given to me and to the UUM in any scholarly use which may be made of any material in my dissertation/project paper.

Request for permission to copy or to make other use of materials in this dissertation/project paper in whole or in part should be addressed to:



Dean of Othman Yeop Abdullah Graduate School of Business

Universiti Utara Malaysia

06010 UUM Sintok

Kedah Darul Aman

Abstract

The intensity of competition among contemporary Higher Education Institution (HEIs) has led to many of such institutions to focus more on how to provide high quality education so as to attain a suitable position in the university world ranking by adopting a suitable performance management. This study aims to demonstrate how XY University (XYU) implements and uses the BSC to enhance and improve its strategic plans. This study employed a qualitative case study approach. Data were collected using interviews and analysis of documents and were analyzed qualitatively using thematic analysis. Consistent with Kaplan and Norton (1992) BSC model in public sector, findings indicates that the case institution has implemented the BSC ideology within its unique context. The study found that in implementing the BSC project, the university staff's buy-in, top management commitment, organizational culture and communication strategy is critical for its success. Also, findings revealed that the implementation of BSC ideology in XYU has improved its' performance in that it helps to improve the case institution's overall university rankings. The implementation of the BSC also helps the university's management to monitor its performance. Future study should consider more institution that implements BSC so as to get more detail results that may be generalized.

Keywords: Balance Scorecard; Critical Success Factor; Performance Indicators; Performance Management; Performance Measurement.

Abstrak

Persaingan yang sengit di antara Institusi Pengajian Tinggi (IPT) kontemporari telah menyebabkan banyak institusi memberi tumpuan kepada bagaimana menyediakan pendidikan yang berkualiti tinggi untuk mencapai kedudukan yang tinggi dalam ranking universiti di dunia dengan mengamalkan pengurusan prestasi yang sesuai. Kajian ini bertujuan untuk menunjukkan bagaimana Universiti XY (XYU) melaksanakan dan menggunakan BSC untuk meningkatkan dan memperbaiki rancangan strategiknya. Kajian ini menggunakan pendekatan kajian kes kualitatif. Data dikumpulkan menggunakan temubual dan analisa dokumen dan dianalisa secara kualitatif menggunakan analisis tematik. Sesuai dengan model BSC di sektor awam oleh Kaplan dan Norton (1992), penemuan menunjukkan bahawa institusi yang dikaji telah mengimplementasikan ideologi BSC dalam konteksnya yang unik dan tersendiri. Kajian ini mendapati bahawa dalam pelaksanaan projek BSC, penerimaan terhadap BSC di kalangan kakitangan universiti, komitmen pengurusan atasan, budaya organisasi dan strategi komunikasi adalah penting untuk memastikan kejayaan pelaksanaannya. Selain itu, penemuan juga mendedahkan bahawa pelaksanaan ideologi BSC di XYU telah meningkatkan prestasinya kerana ia membantu dalam meningkatkan kedudukan penarafan XYU secara keseluruhan. Pelaksanaan BSC di XYU juga membantu pihak pengurusan universiti untuk memantau prestasinya. Pada masa hadapan, kajian harus mempertimbangkan untuk mengkaji lebih banyak institusi yang mengimplementasikan BSC bagi mendapatkan hasil yang lebih terperinci yang boleh digeneralisakan.

Kata kunci: Balance Scorecard; Faktor Kejayaan Kritikal; Petunjuk Prestasi; Pengurusan Prestasi; Pengukuran prestasi.

Acknowledgement

First and foremost, I would like to ascribe all the praise to the Almighty King of Kings, Lord of Lords and the Alpha and Omega for His sustaining Grace, Mercy, provisions and for giving me the ability to complete this study successfully.

Secondly, my sincere heartfelt gratitude goes to Dr. Hazeline bt. Ayoup for the resourceful knowledge impacted in me and her valuable supervision. I want to specially thank her for her kindness, patience and encouragement because I consider myself fortunate to work under her invaluable supervision. I would also like to use this medium to express my appreciation to all my lecturers and all the admin staff in TISSA.

Thirdly, my highest gratitude goes to my loving and caring Mom for her inestimable encouragement, prayers, concern and support. Also, I want to seize this opportunity to appreciate my siblings for their care, love, encouragement and support.

Lastly, my deepest gratitude goes to my university for giving me this rare opportunity and privilege to come and study in Universiti Utara Malaysia.

Table of Content

Permission to Use	ii
Abstract.....	iii
Abstrak.....	iv
Acknowledgement	v
Table of Content.....	vi
List of Tables	ix
List of Figures.....	x
List of Abbreviations	xi
CHAPTER ONE	1
INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Problem Statement	6
1.3 Research Questions	10
1.4 Research Objectives	10
1.5 Scope of the Study.....	11
1.6 Significance of the Study	11
1.7 Chapter Summary.....	14
CHAPTER TWO LITERATURE REVIEW	15
2.1 Introduction	15
2.2 BSC Implementation in XYU	15
2.2.1 Background of XYU.....	15
2.2.2 Organizational Structure of XYU.....	18
2.3 Historical Development of BSC.....	19
2.4 BSC Concept	20
2.5 Overview of BSC Perspectives	28
2.5.1 The Customer Value Perspective (CVP)	31
2.5.2 The Internal Business Process Perspective (IBPP).....	33
2.5.3 The Learning and Growth Perspective (LGP)	36
2.5.4 Financial Performance Perspectives (FPP).....	41
2.6 BSC and Strategic Management Tool in Institution	42

2.7 Application of BSC in Educational Institution.....	44
2.7.1 Application and Implementation of BSC in Institution of Higher Learning in Malaysia.....	47
2.7.2 BSC Implementation Process	51
2.8 Translation of an Institution’s Vision and Strategy into Objectives, Measures, Targets and Initiatives	53
2.9 Benefits of BSC Implementation in Educational Institution.....	56
2.10 Strategy Map - As a Strategic Tool in BSC Implementation in Institution.....	58
2.11 Impact of BSC Implementation on Performance	62
2.12 Chapter Summary.....	63
CHAPTER THREE RESEARCH METHODOLOGY.....	65
3.1 Introduction	65
3.2 Research Design	66
3.3 Data Collection Techniques	66
3.4 Instrumentation.....	68
3.5 Participants	69
3.6 Data Analysis	70
3.7 Chapter Summary.....	71
CHAPTER FOUR FINDINGS	72
4.1 Introduction	72
4.2 BSC Implementation in XYU	72
4.3 BSC Implementation Process	75
4.3.1 Action Plan	79
4.3.2 Performance Indicators (PIs) for academic staff	80
4.4 XYU KPIs and Performance	81
4.5 The Critical Success Factors Put in Place in the Implementation of BSC in XYU towards Improving the Non-Financial Performance	87
4.5.1 Critical Success Factors (CSF) of XYU	87
4.5.2 Translation of the University’s CSF (aims and objectives) into Goals, Measures, Targets and Initiatives	89
4.6 XYU Strategy Map.....	91
4.7 Chapter Summary.....	92
CHAPTER FIVE DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION.93	

5.1 Introduction	93
5.2 Discussion	94
5.2.1 BSC Implementation Process	94
5.2.2 Informant Experience in KPI Implementation Process from the 2010-till date (i.e. the Processes involved in Implementing BSC in XYU)	94
5.2.3 The Issues involved in the BSC implementation Process in XYU.....	96
5.2.4 BSC as a “living document” that requires steady and consistent monitoring of Performance after implementation	98
5.2.5 The Impact of BSC Implementation on XYU’s Performance and its Future Prospects	99
5.2.6 The Exceptional Relevance of Non-financial Performance	101
5.2.7 The BSC Perspectives Adopted/Adapted by XYU with Regards to the one Proposed by Kaplan and Norton	102
5.2.8 XYU’s Critical Success Factors (CSF).....	103
5.3 Conclusion.....	105
5.4 Implications	107
5.5 Recommendation for Future Study	108
5.6 Limitation	108
5.7 Chapter Summary	109
References	110
Appendix: Interview Schedule.....	125

List of Tables

Table 4.1	The Four (4) thrust	77
Table 4.2	Six Key Result Areas (KRA)	77
Table 4.3	7 Objectives	77
Table 4.4	12 Strategies	78
Table 4.5	16 Key Performance Indicators (KPIs)	78
Table 4.6	Performance Indicators (PIs) for academic staff	80



List of Figures

Figure 2.1	Translation of Vision and Strategy	54
Figure 2.2	Strategy Map	61
Figure 4.1	XYU's 2018 rank in QS Asia University Rankings	85
Figure 4.2	XYU's 2018 rankings among the top 25 universities in Southeast Asia	86



List of Abbreviations

The followings are the abbreviations used in this study

AASCB	Association of Advanced Collegiate School of Business
ABU	Ahmadu Bello University
AVC	Assistant Vice-Chancellors
BSC	Balance Scorecard
CAS	College of Arts and Science
CoAs	Center of Authorities
COB	College of Business
COLGIS	College of Law, Government and International Studies
CQI	Continual Quality Improvement
CSF	Critical Success Factor
CVP	Customer Value Perspective
DVCs	Deputy Vice-Chancellors
FPIs	Financial Performance Indicator
FPP	Financial Performance Perspectives
HEI	Institution of Higher Learning
IBPP	Internal Business Process Perspective
IPQ	Institute of Quality Management
JPU	University Management Committee
KPIs	Key Performance Indicators
KRA	Key Result Area
LGP	Learning and Growth Perspective
LPU	University Board of Directors
MOHE	Ministry of Higher Education

MyRA	Malaysian Research Assessment
NFPIs	Non-Financial Performance Indicators
NHEBP	National Higher Educational Blueprint
OYAGSB	Othman Yeop Abdullah Graduate School of Business
PhD	Doctor of Philosophy
PIs	Performance Indicators
PMS	Performance Management System
QS	Quacquarelli Symonds
RU	Research University
SETARA	Rating System for Malaysian Higher Education Institutions
THE	Times Higher Education
TISSA	School of Tunku Puteri Intan Safinaz School of Accounting
UQC	University Quality Council
XYU	XY University
UWSENE	United Way of Southeastern New England
WUR	World University Rankings

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

Performance management system (PMS) is a vital element in managing an institution. Various PMS models has been developed by researchers and practitioners. Among all, the Balance Scorecard (BSC) is one of the most popular PMS that has been used worldwide by a private as well as public institutions. This study is conducted to understand the BSC practices in a public institution in Malaysia. Specifically, this chapter discuss the background of the study. It consists of the following outlines that are the background of the study (i.e. introduction to BSC as both a performance and management tool), problem statement, research questions and research objectives, thereafter the scope and significant of the study and lastly chapter summary. This study aims to investigate and provide insight into how the BSC methodology is being implemented and its impact on performance.

1.1 Background

Globalization forces such as competition in terms of university rankings in the educational sector have brought to bear incessant changes and challenges that have heavily affected the performance of both private and public institutions across the globe (Vermaak and Cronje, 2001). As a result, educational institutions that plan to survive these dreaded issues and challenges have attempted to seek for suitable performance management such as the BSC.

References

- Adams, C., Hoque, Z., & Mcnicholas, P. (2006). Case Studies and Action Research. *Methodological Issues in Accounting Research: Theories and Methods*, 361-373.
- Ahmad, A. R., & Soon, N. K. (2015). Balanced Scorecard in Higher Education Institutions: What Should be Consider?. In *Technology Management and Emerging Technologies (ISTMET), 2015 International Symposium on* (Pp. 64-68). IEEE.
- Ahn, H. (2001). Applying the Balanced Scorecard Concept: An Experience Report. *Long Range Planning*, 34(4), 441-461.
- Albright, T., Brewer, P., & Davis, S. (2005). Building a Successful Balanced Scorecard Program. *Journal of Cost Management*, 19(1), 28-37.
- Al-Hosaini, F. F., & Sofian, S. (2015). A Review of Balanced Scorecard Framework in Higher Education Institution (Heis). *International Review of Management and Marketing*, 5(1), 26.
- Aljardali, H., Kaderi, M., & Levy-Tadjine, T. (2012). The Implementation of the Balanced Scorecard in Lebanese Public Higher Education Institutions. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 62, 98-108.
- Al-Zwyalif, I. M. (2012). The Possibility of Implementing Balanced Scorecard in Jordanian Private Universities. *International Business Research*, 5(11), 113.
- Ambras, A., & Tamosiunas, T. (2010). The Implementation of the Balanced Scorecard System in Strategic Management of Siauliai University Social Sciences Faculty. *Socialiniai Tyrimai.–Šiauliai: Šiaulių Universiteto Leidykla*, (1), 18.
- Atafar, A., Shahrabi, M., & Esfahani, M. (2013). Evaluation of University Performance Using BSC and ANP. *Decision Science Letters*, 2(4), 305-311.
- Atkinson, A. A., Balakrishnan, R., Booth, P., & Cote, J. M. (1997). New Directions in Management Accounting Research. *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, 9, 79.
- Atkinson, A. and Epstein, M. 2000. Measure for Measure, *CMA Management*, Vol. 74, No. 7, Pp.22-28.
- Atkinson, H. (2006). Strategy Implementation: A Role for the Balanced Scorecard?. *Management Decision*, 44(10), 1441-1460.

- Atrill, P., & McLaney, E. (2009). *Management Accounting for Decision Makers*. Pearson Education.
- Ax, C., & Bjørnenak, T. (2005). Bundling and Diffusion of Management Accounting Innovations—The Case of the Balanced Scorecard in Sweden. *Management Accounting Research*, 16(1), 1-20.
- Ayoub, H. (2009). Observational Assessment of the Balanced Scorecard Strategic Alignment Process: A Study of a Utility Company.
- Ayoub, H. (2015). *Organizational alignment using the balance scorecard approach: case study of a malaysian government-linked company* (Doctoral dissertation, Universiti Teknologi MARA).
- Ayoub, H., Omar, N. H., & Rahman, I. K. A. (2010, December). Strategy Maps as a Communication Tool in Balanced Scorecard Implementation: Study of a Malaysian Utility Company. In *Science and Social Research (CSSR), 2010 International Conference on* (Pp. 48-52). IEEE.
- Ayoub, H., Omar, N. H., & Rahman, I. K. A. (2012). Implementation of Balance Scorecard in a Malaysian GLC: Perceptions of Middle Managers. *Asia-Pacific Management Accounting Journal*, 7(2), 99-123.
- Ayoub, H., Omar, N., & Rahman, I. K. A. (2015a). Behavioural Factors Affecting Strategic Alignment Based on the Balanced Scorecard Framework: Evidence From a Malaysian Company.
- Ayoub, H., Omar, N., & Rahman, I. K. A. (2015b). Managing Strategic Alignment Using the Balanced Scorecard: A Malaysian Company's Experience.
- Ayoub, H., Omar, N., & Rahman, I. K. A. (2016). Balanced Scorecard and Strategic Alignment: A Malaysian Case. *International Journal of Economics And Financial Issues*, 6(4S).
- Azizan, H. (2007). Ready for the Big Leap. The Star Newspaper. 18 November, <http://thestar.com.my/news/story.asp?file=/2007/11/1/8/education/19484775&sec=education>
- Banker, R. D., Chang, H., & Pizzini, M. (2011). The Judgmental Effects of Strategy Maps in Balanced Scorecard Performance Evaluations. *International Journal of Accounting Information Systems*, 12(4), 259-279.
- Barlas, Y., & Diker, V. G. (2000). A Dynamic Simulation Game (UNIGAME) for Strategic University Management. *Simulation & Gaming*, 31(3), 331-358.
- Beard, D. F. (2009). Successful Applications of the Balanced Scorecard in Higher Education. *Journal of Education for Business*, 84(5), 275-282.

- Binden, W., Mziu, H., & Suhaimi, M. A. (2014). Employing the Balanced Scorecard to Measure Performance in Higher Education–Malaysia. *International Journal of Information and Communication Technology Research*, 4(1).
- Bititci, U. S., Carrie, A. S., & Mcdevitt, L. (1997). Integrated Performance Measurement Systems: A Development Guide. *International Journal of Operations and Production Management*, 17(5), 522-534.
- Bourne, M., Neely, A., Mills, J., & Platts, K. (2003). Implementing Performance Measurement Systems: A Literature Review. *International Journal of Business Performance Management*, 5(1), 1-24.
- Braam, G. J., & Nijssen, E. J. (2004). Performance Effects of Using the Balanced Scorecard: A Note on the Dutch Experience. *Long Range Planning*, 37(4), 335-349.
- Brudan, A. (2010). Rediscovering Performance Management: Systems, Learning and Integration. *Measuring Business Excellence*, 14(1), 109-123.
- Calderon Molina, M. A., Palacios Florencio, B., Hurtado Gonzalez, J. M., & Galan Gonzalez, J. L. (2016). Implementing the Balanced Scorecard: Its Effect on the Job Environment. *Total Quality Management & Business Excellence*, 27(1-2), 81-96.
- Campbell, A. (1997). Stakeholders: The Case in Favour. *Long Range Planning*, 30(3), 446-449.
- Campbell, D. (2008). 'Nonfinancial Performance Measures and Promotion-Based Incentives'. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 46: 297-332.
- Capelo, C., & Dias, J. F. (2009). A System Dynamics-Based Simulation Experiment for Testing Mental Model and Performance Effects of using the Balanced Scorecard. *System Dynamics Review*, 25(1), 1-34.
- Chang, O. H., & Chow, C. W. (1999). The Balanced Scorecard: A Potential Tool for Supporting Change and Continuous Improvement in Accounting Education. *Issues in Accounting Education*, 14(3), 395-412.
- Chen, S. H., Yang, C. C., & Shiau, J. Y. (2006). The Application of Balanced Scorecard in the Performance Evaluation of Higher Education. *The TQM Magazine*, 18(2), 190-205.
- Cobbold, I., & Lawrie, G. (2002). The Development of the Balanced Scorecard as a Strategic Management Tool. *Performance Measurement Association*.
- Crabtree, A. D., & Debusk, G. K. (2008). The Effects of Adopting the Balanced Scorecard on Shareholder Returns. *Advances in Accounting*, 24(1), 8-15.

- Creswell, J. W. (2007). Five qualitative approaches to inquiry. *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*, 2, 53-80.
- Cullen, J., Joyce, J., Hassall, T., & Broadbent, M. (2003). Quality in Higher Education: from Monitoring to Management. *Quality Assurance in Education*, 11(1), 5-14.
- Danesh Asgari, S., Haeri, A., & Jafari, M. (2017). Integration of Balanced Scorecard and Three-Stage Data Envelopment Analysis Approaches. *Iranian Journal of Management Studies*, 10(2), 527-550.
- Davis, S., & Albright, T. (2004). An Investigation of the Effect of Balanced Scorecard Implementation on Financial Performance. *Management Accounting Research*, 15(2), 135-153.
- Davis, T. R. (1996). Developing an Employee Balanced Scorecard: Linking Frontline Performance to Corporate Objectives. *Management Decision*, 34(4), 14-18.
- De Geuser, F., Mooraj, S., & Oyon, D. (2009). Does the Balanced Scorecard add Value? Empirical Evidence on Its Effect on Performance. *European Accounting Review*, 18(1), 93-122.
- De La Mano, M., & Creaser, C. (2016). The Impact of the Balanced Scorecard in Libraries: From Performance Measurement to Strategic Management. *Journal of Librarianship and Information Science*, 48(2), 191-208.
- Decoene, V., & Bruggeman, W. (2006). Strategic Alignment and Middle-Level Managers' Motivation in a Balanced Scorecard Setting. *International Journal of Operations and Production Management*, 26(4), 429-448.
- Del Sordo, C., Orelli, R. L., Padovani, E., & Gardini, S. (2012). Assessing Global Performance in Universities: An Application of Balanced Scorecard. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 46, 4793-4797.
- Dimitropoulos, P., Kosmas, I., & Douvis, I. (2017). Implementing the Balanced Scorecard in a Local Government Sport Organization: Evidence from Greece. *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management*, 66(3), 362-379.
- Douwe P. Flapper, S., Fortuin, L., & Stoop, P. P. (1996). Towards Consistent Performance Management Systems. *International Journal of Operations and Production Management*, 16(7), 27-37.
- Dubrovski, D. (2001). The Role of Customer Satisfaction in Achieving Business Excellence. *Total Quality Management*, 12(7-8), 920-925.

- Eftimov, L., Trpeski, P., Gockov, G., & Vasileva, V. (2016). Designing a Balanced Scorecard as Strategic Management System for Higher Education Institutions: A Case Study in Macedonia. *Ekonomika*, 62(2), 29-48.
- Eisenberg, P. (2016). The Balanced Scorecard and Beyond—Applying Theories of Performance Measurement, Employment and Rewards in Management Accounting Education.
- Farid, D., Nejati, M., & Mirfakhredini, H. (2008). Balanced Scorecard Application in Universities and Higher Education Institutes: Implementation Guide in an Iranian Context. *Universitatii Bucuresti. Analele. Seria Stiinte Economice Si Administrative*, 2, 29.
- Ferreira, A. M. S. C. (2017). How Managers Use the Balanced Scorecard to Support Strategy Implementation and Formulation Processes. *Tékhné-Review of Applied Management Studies*, (1), 2-15.
- Frigo, M. L., & Krumwiede, K. R. (2000). The Balanced Scorecard. *Strategic Finance*, 81(7), 50.
- Gamal, A., & Soemantri, A. I. (2017). The Effect of Balanced Scorecard on the Private College Performance (Case Study at the University of WR Supratman Surabaya). *Archives of Business Research*, 5(5).
- Gibbons, R., & Kaplan, R. S. (2015). Formal Measures in Informal Management: Can a Balanced Scorecard Change a Culture?. *American Economic Review*, 105(5), 447-51.
- Gmelch, W. H., & Wolverton, M. (2002). An Investigation of Dean Leadership.
- Greatbanks, R., & Tapp, D. (2007). The Impact of Balanced Scorecards in a Public Sector Environment: Empirical Evidence from Dunedin City Council, New Zealand. *International Journal of Operations & Production Management*, 27(8), 846-873.
- Grygoryev, K., & Karapetrovic, S. (2005). An Integrated System for Educational Performance Measurement, Modeling and Management at the Classroom Level. *The TQM Magazine*, 17(2), 121-136.
- Guba, E. G., & Lincoln, Y. S. (1994). Competing paradigms in qualitative research. *Handbook of qualitative research*, 2(163-194), 105.

- Habib-Uz-Zaman Khan, M., Ahmed, R., & Karim Halabi, A. (2010). The Roles of Degree of Competition and Types of Business Strategies in Adopting Multiple Performance Measurement Practices: Some Reflections from Bangladesh. *In Research in Accounting in Emerging Economies* (Pp. 201-232). Emerald Group Publishing Limited.
- Hendricks, K., Menor, L., Wiedman, C., & Richardson, S. (2004). The Balanced Scorecard: to Adopt or Not to Adopt? *Ivey Business Journal Online*, 11.
- Hoffecker, J., & Goldenberg, C. (1994). Using the Balanced Scorecard to Develop Companywide Performance Measures. *Journal of Cost Management*, 8(3), 5-17.
- Hoque, Z. (2014). 20 Years of Studies on the Balanced Scorecard: Trends, Accomplishments, Gaps and Opportunities for Future Research. *The British Accounting Review*, 46(1), 33-59.
- Horngren, C., S. Datar, And M. Rajan. (2012). *Cost Accounting: A Managerial Emphasis*. 14th Edition. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Hu, B., Leopold-Wildburger, U., & Strohhecker, J. (2017). Strategy Map Concepts in a Balanced Scorecard Cockpit Improve Performance. *European Journal of Operational Research*, 258(2), 664-676.
- Huang, C. D., & Hu, Q. (2007). Achieving IT-Business Strategic Alignment via Enterprise-Wide Implementation of Balanced Scorecards. *Information Systems Management*, 24(2), 173-184.
- Ittner, C. And Larcker, D. (1995). 'Total Quality Management and the Choice of Information and Reward Systems'. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 34 (Supplement): 1-34.
- Ittner, C. And Larcker, D. (1997a). 'Quality Strategy, Strategic Control Systems, and Organizational Performance'. *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, 22: 293-314.
- Ittner, C. And Larcker, D. (1997b). 'Are Nonfinancial Measures Leading Indicators of Financial Performance? An Analysis of Customer Satisfaction'. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 36 (Supplement): 1-35.
- Ittner, C. And Larcker, D. (2003). 'Coming Up Short on Nonfinancial Performance Measurement'. *Harvard Business Review*, 81 (11): 88-95.
- Ittner, C. And Larcker, D. (2005). 'Moving from Strategic Measurement to Strategic Data Analysis'. In C. Chapman (Ed.), *Controlling Strategy*, Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press: 86-105.

- Ittner, C. D., & Larcker, D. F. (1998). Are Nonfinancial Measures Leading Indicators of Financial Performance? An Analysis of Customer Satisfaction. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 36, 1-35.
- Ittner, C., Larcker, D. And Randall, T. (2003). 'Performance Implications of Strategic Performance Measurement in Financial Services Firms'. *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, 28: 715-741.
- Jassbi, J., Mohamadnejad, F., & Nasrollahzadeh, H. (2011). A Fuzzy DEMATEL Framework for Modeling Cause and Effect Relationships of Strategy Map. *Expert Systems with Applications*, 38(5), 5967-5973.
- Jordan, G. B., & Mortensen, J. C. (1997). Measuring the Performance of Research and Technology Programs: A Balanced Scorecard Approach. *The Journal of Technology Transfer*, 22(2), 13-20.
- Jusoh, R., & Parnell, J. A. (2008). Competitive Strategy and Performance Measurement in the Malaysian Context: An Exploratory Study. *Management Decision*, 46(1), 5-31.
- Kanji, G. K., Tambi, A. M. B. A., & Wallace, W. (1999). A Comparative Study of Quality Practices in Higher Education Institutions in the US and Malaysia. *Total Quality Management*, 10(3), 357-371.
- Kaplan R.S. And Norton D.P. (1992). The Balanced Scorecard - Measures that Drive Performance. *Harvard Business Review*, 70.1: 71-79.
- Kaplan R.S. And Norton D.P. (2004): Strategy Maps: Converting Intangible Assets into Tangible Outcomes. *Harvard Business School Press, Boston, MA*.
- Kaplan, A. M., & Haenlein, M. (2010). Users of the World, Unite! The Challenges and Opportunities of Social Media. *Business Horizons*, 53(1), 59-68.
- Kaplan, R. And Norton, D. (2001), "Transforming the Balanced Scorecard from Performance Measurement to Strategic Management: Part I", *Accounting Horizons*, Vol. 15 No. 1, Pp. 87-104.
- Kaplan, R. S., & Norton, D. P. (1996a). Using the Balanced Scorecard as a Strategic Management System.
- Kaplan, R. S., & Norton, D. P. (1996b). Linking the Balanced Scorecard to Strategy. *California Management Review*, 39(1), 53-79.
- Kaplan, R. S., & Norton, D. P. (1999). The Balanced Scorecard for Public-Sector Organizations. *Balanced Scorecard Report*, 15(11), 1999.

- Kaplan, R. S., & Norton, D. P. (2000). Putting the Balanced Scorecard to Work. *Focusing Your Organization on Strategy—with the Balanced Scorecard*, 2, 2-18.
- Kaplan, R. S., & Norton, D. P. (2006a). Alignment: Using the Balanced Scorecard to Create Corporate Synergies (Vol. 1). Boston Massachusetts: *Harvard Business School Press*.
- Kaplan, R. S., & Norton, D. P. (2006b). How to Implement a New Strategy without Disrupting Your Organization. *Harvard Business Review*, 84(3), 100.
- Kaplan, R. S., Norton, D. P., & Barrows, E. A. (2008). Developing the Strategy: Vision, Value Gaps, and Analysis. *Balanced Scorecard Report*, 10(1), 1-5.
- Karathanos, D., & Karathanos, P. (2005). Applying the Balanced Scorecard to Education. *Journal of Education for Business*, 80(4), 222-230.
- Karpagam, U. P., & Suganthi, L. (2012). A Strategy Map of Balanced Scorecard in Academic Institutions for Performance Improvement. *IUP Journal of Business Strategy*, 9(3), 7.
- Kettunen, J. (2006). Strategic Planning of Regional Development in Higher Education. *Baltic Journal of Management*, 1(3), 259-269.
- Khomba, J. K., Vermaak, F. N., & Hanif, R. (2012). Relevance of the Balanced Scorecard Model in Africa: Shareholder-Centred or Stakeholder-Centred?. *African Journal of Business Management*, 6(17), 5773.
- Kim, J., Suh, E., & Hwang, H. (2003). A Model for Evaluating the Effectiveness of CRM Using the Balanced Scorecard. *Journal of Interactive Marketing*, 17(2), 5-19.
- Kshatriya, A., Dharmadhikari, V., Srivastava, D., & Basak, P. C. (2017). Strategic Performance Measurement Using Balanced Scorecard: A Case of Machine Tool Industry. *Foundations of Management*, 9(1), 75-86.
- Lawrie, G., & Cobbold, I. (2004). Third-Generation Balanced Scorecard: Evolution of an Effective Strategic Control Tool. *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management*, 53(7), 611-623.
- Lee, N. (2006). Measuring the Performance of Public Sector Organisations: A Case Study on Public Schools in Malaysia. *Measuring Business Excellence*, 10(4), 50-64.
- Li, W. (2011, January). Performance Evaluation for Private Colleges and Universities Based on the Balanced Scorecard. In *Management Science and Industrial Engineering (MSIE), 2011 International Conference on* (Pp. 603-606). IEEE.

- Liang, Y., & Wang, Y. (2010, July). Notice of Retraction an Innovation in the Performance Measurement System: The Reviews on Studies of the Balanced Scorecard. In *Advanced Management Science (ICAMS), 2010 IEEE International Conference on* (Vol. 3, Pp. 208-212). IEEE.
- Lilian Chan, Y. C. (2004). Performance Measurement and Adoption of Balanced Scorecards: A Survey of Municipal Governments in the USA and Canada. *International Journal of Public Sector Management*, 17(3), 204-221.
- Ling Sim, K., & Chye Koh, H. (2001). Balanced Scorecard: A Rising Trend in Strategic Performance Measurement. *Measuring Business Excellence*, 5(2), 18-27.
- Lipe, M. G., & Salterio, S. (2002). A Note on the Judgmental Effects of the Balanced Scorecard's Information Organization. *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, 27(6), 531-540.
- Low, L. (2000). Are College Students Satisfied? A National Analysis of Changing Expectations. *New Agenda Series [TM]*.
- Lubis, A., Torong, Z. B., & Muda, I. (2016). The Urgency of Implementing Balanced Scorecard System on Local Government in North Sumatra–Indonesia. *International Journal of Applied Business and Economic Research*, 14(11), 7575-7590.
- Lueg, R., & Vu, L. (2015). Success Factors in Balanced Scorecard Implementations–A Literature Review. *Management Revue*, 306-327.
- Lynch, R.L. And Cross, K.F. (1991), Measure Up - The Essential Guide to Measuring Business Performance, *Mandarin, London*
- Maiga, A. S., & Jacobs, F. A. (2003). Balanced Scorecard, Activity-Based Costing and Company Performance: An Empirical Analysis. *Journal of Managerial Issues*, 283-301.
- Maisel, L. S. (1992). Performance Measurement: The Balanced Scorecard Approach. *Journal of Cost Management*, 6(2), 47-52.
- Makhijani, N., & Creelman, J. (2008). How Leading Organizations Successfully Implement Corporate Strategy with the Balanced Scorecard. *The OTI Thought Leadership Series*, 1(1), 1-16.
- Malina, M. A., & Selto, F. H. (2001). Communicating and Controlling Strategy: An Empirical Study of the Effectiveness of the Balanced Scorecard. *Journal of Management Accounting Research*, 13(1), 47-90.

- Martello, M., Watson, J. G., & Fischer, M. J. (2016). Implementing a Balanced Scorecard in a Not-For-Profit Organization. *Journal of Business & Economics Research (Online)*, 14(3), 61.
- Mcdevitt, R., Giapponi, C., & Solomon, N. (2008). Strategy Revitalization in Academe: A Balanced Scorecard Approach. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 22(1), 32-47.
- Merriam, S. B. (1988). *Case Study Research in Education: A Qualitative Approach*. Jossey-Bass.
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook*. Sage.
- Modell, S. (2012). The Politics of the Balanced Scorecard. *Journal of Accounting & Organizational Change*, 8(4), 475-489.
- Mohamad, B. A. M. (2016). The Assessment of Accredited Faculties Performance at Assiut University by Using Balanced Scorecard. *European Scientific Journal, ESJ*, 12(22).
- Mohamed, M. (2007). Plan to Shape Varsities of World Class. The Star Newspaper, 14 November. [Http://Thestar.Com.My/News/Story.Asp?File=/2007/11/14/Nation/19464095&Se](http://Thestar.Com.My/News/Story.Asp?File=/2007/11/14/Nation/19464095&Se)
- Moon, P., & Fitzgerald, L. (1996). Delivering the Goods at TNT: The Role of the Performance Measurement System. *Management Accounting Research*, 7(4), 431-457.
- Nambi Karuhanga, B., & Werner, A. (2013). Challenges Impacting Performance Management Implementation in Public Universities: A Case of Uganda. *African Journal of Economic and Management Studies*, 4(2), 223-243.
- Neely, A. (2008). Investigating the Financial Consequences of the Servitization of Manufacturing. *Operations Management Research*, 1(2), 103-118.
- Neely, A., & Bourne, M. (2000). Why Measurement Initiatives Fail. *Measuring Business Excellence*, 4(4), 3-7.
- Neely, A., Adams, C., & Kennerley, M. (2002). The Performance Prism. *Financial Times, Prentice-Hall, London*.
- Neely, A., Gregory, M., & Platts, K. (2005). Performance Measurement System Design: A Literature Review and Research Agenda. *International Journal of Operations & Production Management*, 25(12), 1228-1263.

- Newing, R. (1994). Benefits of a Balanced Scorecard. *Accountancy*, 114(1215), 52-53.
- Newing, R. (1995). Wake Up to the Balanced Scorecard!. *Management Accounting: Magazine for Chartered Management Accountants*, 73(3), 22-23.
- Nielsen, S., & Nielsen, E. H. (2008). System Dynamics Modelling for a Balanced Scorecard: Computing The Influence of Skills, Customers, and Work in Process on The Return on Capital Employed. *Management Research News*, 31(3), 169-188.
- Nistor, C. S. (2009). An Empirical Research about the Possibility of Implementing Balanced Scorecard in Romanian Universities.
- Niven, P. R. (2002). *Balanced Scorecard Step-By-Step: Maximizing Performance and Maintaining Results*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Niven, P.R. (2008). Balanced Scorecard Step-By-Step For Government and Nonprofit Agencies, Organizational Performance in the Hotel Sector. *Tourism Management* 26 (5), 690-702.
- Nørreklit, H. (2003). The Balanced Scorecard: What Is The Score? A Rhetorical Analysis of The Balanced Scorecard. *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, 28(6), 591-619.
- Northcott, D., & Ma'amora Taulapapa, T. (2012). Using the Balanced Scorecard to Manage Performance in Public Sector Organizations: Issues and Challenges. *International Journal of Public Sector Management*, 25(3), 166-191.
- Ong, T. S., Teh, B. H., Lau, C. K., & Wong, S. L. S. (2010). Adoption and Implementation of Balanced Scorecard in Malaysia.
- Osewe, J. O., Gachunga, H., Senaji, T., & Odhiambo, R. (2018). Relationship between Rational Choice Rationale for Adoption of Balanced Scorecard and Organizational Performance of State Corporations in Kenya. *European Journal of Business and Strategic Management*, 3(1), 1-14.
- Othman, R. (2008). Enhancing the Effectiveness of the Balanced Scorecard with Scenario Planning. *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management*, 57(3), 259-266.
- Othman, R., Domil, A. K. A., Senik, Z. C., Abdullah, N. L., & Hamzah, N. (2006). A Case Study of Balanced Scorecard Implementation in a Malaysian Company. *Journal of Asia-Pacific Business*, 7(2), 55-72.
- Pandey, I. M. (2005). Balanced Scorecard: Myth and Reality. *Vikalpa*, 30(1), 51-66.

- Papenhausen, C., & Einstein, W. (2006). Implementing the Balanced Scorecard at a College of Business. *Measuring Business Excellence*, 10(3), 15-22.
- Parahoo, K. (2014). *Nursing Research: Principles, Process and Issues*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Park, S., Lee, H., & Chae, S. W. (2017). Rethinking Balanced Scorecard Measures: Formative Versus Reflective Measurement Models. *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management*, 66(1), 92-110.
- Parmenter, D. (2015). *Key Performance Indicators: Developing, Implementing, and Using Winning Kpis*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Philbin, S. P. (2011). Design and Implementation of the Balanced Scorecard at a University Institute. *Measuring Business Excellence*, 15(3), 34-45.
- Pienaar, H., & Penzhorn, C. (2000). Using the Balanced Scorecard to Facilitate Strategic Management at an Academic Information Service. *Libri*, 50(3), 202-209.
- Pietrzak, M. (2014). Using the Strategy Map as a Strategic Communication Tool in Higher Education: A Case Study of Warsaw University of Life Sciences. *Online Journal of Applied Knowledge Management*, 2(2), 26-42.
- Pietrzak, M., Paliszkiwicz, J., & Klepacki, B. (2015). The Application of the Balanced Scorecard in the Higher Education Setting of a Polish University. *Online Journal of Applied Knowledge Management*, 3(1), 151-164.
- Punniyamoorthy, M., & Murali, R. (2008). Balanced Score for the Balanced Scorecard: A Benchmarking Tool. *Benchmarking: An International Journal*, 15(4), 420-443.
- Quesado, P., Guzmán, B. A., & Rodrigues, L. L. (2018). Advantages and Contributions in the Balanced Scorecard Implementation. *Intangible Capital*, 14(1), 186-201.
- Ramachandran, S., & Foo, H. (2007). Public Universities Fail Outstanding Test. *New Straits Times*, 6.
- Sandhu, R., Baxter, J., & Emsley, D. (2008). The Balanced Scorecard and its Possibilities: The Initial Experiences of a Singaporean Firm. *Australian Accounting Review*, 18(1), 16-24.
- Serdar Asan, Ş., & Tanyaş, M. (2007). Integrating Hoshin Kanri and the Balanced Scorecard for Strategic Management: The Case of Higher Education. *Total Quality Management*, 18(9), 999-1014.

- Sharma, A. (2009). Implementing Balance Scorecard for Performance Measurement. *IUP Journal of Business Strategy*, 6(1), 7.
- Shukri, N. F. M., & Ramli, A. (2015). Organizational Structure and Performances of Responsible Malaysian Healthcare Providers: A Balanced Scorecard Perspective. *Procedia Economics and Finance*, 28, 202-212.
- Singh, R. K., & Arora, S. S. (2018). The Adoption of Balanced Scorecard: An Exploration of its Antecedents and Consequences. *Benchmarking: An International Journal*, (Just-Accepted), 00-00.
- Slavica, T., Ljubica, K., & Jelena, J. (2017). The Modern Concept of Measuring Efficiency-Implementation and Attitudes of BSC. *Tem Journal-Technology Education Management Informatics*, 6(3), 525-533.
- Stewart, A. C., & Carpenter-Hubin, J. (2001). The Balanced Scorecard. *Planning for Higher Education*, 37-42.
- Sudirman, I. (2012). Implementing Balanced Scorecard in Higher Education Management. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, 3(18).
- Tapinos, E., Dyson, R. G., & Meadows, M. (2011). Does the Balanced Scorecard Make a Difference to the Strategy Development Process?. *Journal of the Operational Research Society*, 62(5), 888-899.
- Tarigan, R. (2005). An Evaluation of the Relationship between Alignment of Strategic Priorities and Manufacturing Performance. *International Journal of Management*, 22(4), 586.
- Tayler, W. B. (2010). The Balanced Scorecard as a Strategy-Evaluation Tool: The Effects of Implementation Involvement and a Causal-Chain Focus. *The Accounting Review*, 85(3), 1095-1117.
- Taylor, J., & Baines, C. (2012). Performance Management in UK Universities: Implementing the Balanced Scorecard. *Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management*, 34(2), 111-124.
- Tseng, M. L. (2010). Implementation and Performance Evaluation Using the Fuzzy Network Balanced Scorecard. *Computers & Education*, 55(1), 188-201.
- Umashankar, V., & Dutta, K. (2007). Balanced Scorecards in Managing Higher Education Institutions: An Indian Perspective. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 21(1), 54-67.
- Vermaak, F. N., & Cronje, C. J. (2001). The Balanced Scorecard as a Potential Instrument for Supporting the Planning and Improvement of Accounting Education in South Africa. *Meditari: Research Journal of the School of Accounting Sciences*, 9(1), 301-312.

- Walker, K. B., & Ainsworth, P. L. (2007). Achieving Competitive Advantage in Departments of Accounting: Management Principles and the Balanced Scorecard. *Academy of Accounting and Financial Studies Journal*, 11(1), 65-82.
- Witcher, B. J., & Sum Chau, V. (2007). Balanced Scorecard and Hoshin Kanri: Dynamic Capabilities for Managing Strategic Fit. *Management Decision*, 45(3), 518-538.
- Wolverton, M., & Gmelch, W. H. (2002). *College Deans: Leading from within. American Council on Education/Oryx Press Series on Higher Education*. Oryx Press, 88 Post Road West, Westport, CT 06881-5007.
- Wong-On-Wing, B., Guo, L., Li, W., & Yang, D. (2007). Reducing Conflict in Balanced Scorecard Evaluations. *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, 32(4-5), 363-377.
- Wu, H. Y. (2012). Constructing a Strategy Map for Banking Institutions with Key Performance Indicators of the Balanced Scorecard. *Evaluation and Program Planning*, 35(3), 303-320.
- Yin, R. K. (1998). The Abridged Version of Case Study Research: Design and Method.
- Yin, R. K. (2017). *Case Study Research and Applications: Design and Methods*. Sage Publications.
- Yin, R.K. (2003), *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*, 3rd Ed., Sage Publications, New York, NY.
- Yu, M. L., Hamid, S., Ijab, M. T., & Soo, H. P. (2009). The E-Balanced Scorecard (E-BSC) for Measuring Academic Staff Performance Excellence. *Higher Education*, 57(6), 813-828.
- Zangoueinezhad, A., & Moshabaki, A. (2011). Measuring University Performance Using a Knowledge-Based Balanced Scorecard. *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management*, 60(8), 824-843.
- Zheng, C., Morrison, M., & O'Neill, G. (2006). An Empirical Study of High Performance HRM Practices in Chinese Smes. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 17(10), 1772-1803.
- Zhijun, L. I. N., Zengbiao, Y. U., & Zhang, L. (2014). Performance Outcomes of Balanced Scorecard Application in Hospital Administration in China. *China Economic Review*, 30, 1-15.

Zin, N. M., Sulaiman, S., Ramli, A., & Nawawi, A. (2012). Balanced Scorecard Implementation Within a Malaysian Government-Linked Company. *Asia-Pacific Management Accounting Journal*, 7(1).

Zolfani, S. H., & Ghadikolaei, A. S. (2013). Performance Evaluation of Private Universities Based on Balanced Scorecard: Empirical Study Based on Iran. *Journal of Business Economics and Management*, 14(4), 696-714.



Appendix: Interview Schedule

The Implementation of BSC and its Impact on Performance: Case of XYU

Time/Date: 3:35-4:10 21/12/16 (Wednesday) – First interview in IPQ

Time/Date: 11:30-11:45 17/01/17 - Second interview in TISSA

The objective of this research is to find out the implementation processes of BSC and its impact on performance in XYU (and to also access how the quality of services provided could be improved).

1. KPI implementation process from the 2010-till date (i.e. the processes involved in implementing BSC in XYU)
2. How you developed the planning process
3. Your role, responsibility and experience in the implementation process
4. The perspectives of the BSC adopted by XYU whether is exactly the same with the one proposed by Kaplan and Norton
5. The issues involved in the implementation of BSC
6. The impacts on performance
7. What is the critical success factors (CFS) i.e. what are the factors that contribute to the successful implementation of BSC e.g. Case evidence in Geomotion indicates that four critical factors are found to be the critical success factors in the successful implementation of BSC. These factors which consist of (1) top management commitment, (2) communication, (3) information technology, and (4) organizational culture.
8. How do you translate the university's aims and objectives into goals and measures? (I.e. objectives, measures, targets, initiatives).
9. What or how does the strategy map of the university looks like (please annotate with strategy map diagram)
10. How do you link performance measurement and the strategies you have put in place towards achieving the mission and vision of the university (strategy map).
11. The BSC is a "living document" that requires regular revision of objectives, measures, and initiative. How often do you do that?
12. In a business oriented organization the financial perspective is considered more important in contrast to the educational institution where customer perspective is regarded more. What are the measures put in place to ensure customer/stakeholder satisfaction?
13. Having said all these, where do you see XYU going in the future or does the BSC implementation indicate any positive impact on its performance towards improving the university institutional ranking?
14. Who can you possibly suggest to me that I can equally interview on the same topic?