

**THE DETERMINANTS OF AUDIT FEES:
THE CASE OF THE BANKING INDUSTRY IN MALAYSIA**

**A thesis submitted to the Graduate School in partial
fulfillment of the requirements for the degree
Master of Science (International Accounting)
Universiti Utara Malaysia**

**by
Rohami Bin Shafie**

PERMISSION TO USE

In presenting this thesis in partial fulfillment of the requirements of a post graduate degree from Universiti Utara Malaysia, I agree that the University Library may make it freely available for inspection. I further agree that permission for copying of this thesis in any manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purposes may be granted by my supervisor(s) or, in their absence, by the Dean of the Graduate School. It is understood that any copying or publication or use of this thesis or parts thereof for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission. It is also understood that due recognition shall be given to me and to Universiti Utara Malaysia for any scholarly use which may be made of any material from my thesis.

Requests for permission to copy or to make other use of materials in this thesis, in whole or in part, should be addressed to:

Dean of Graduate School
Universiti Utara Malaysia
06010 UUM Sintok
Kedah Darul Aman

FAKTOR-FAKTOR PENENTU BAGI YURAN AUDIT:

KES BAGI INDUSTRI PERBANKAN DI MALAYSIA

ABSTRACT (BAHASA MALAYSIA)

Isu yuran audit dan yuran bukan audit yang dikenakan oleh firma-firma audit kerap diperbincangkan di dalam bidang perakaunan and pengauditan. Baru-baru ini, disebabkan oleh skandal korporat di Amerika Syarikat, terutamanya skandal Enron, isu ini diperdebatkan bersama dengan kegagalan pengauditan yang dikatakan sebagai penyebab kepada kehancuran syarikat-syarikat. Ini disebabkan firma-firma audit lebih bergantung kepada perkhidmatan-perkhidmatan bukan audit dibandingkan pengauditan itu sendiri dan ini seterusnya mengakibatkan profesion pengauditan teruk dipersalahkan dan beberapa perubahan dicadangkan. Oleh itu, kajian ini berusaha untuk mencungkil situasi di Malaysia dengan menggunakan sektor perbankan sebagai tumpuan kajian. Secara spesifik, kajian ini cuba untuk mengenalpasti kesan bagi perkhidmatan-perkhidmatan bukan audit yang dilaksanakan oleh firma-firma audit untuk bank-bank ini.

Keputusan kajian menunjukkan secara signifikan bahawa pembolehubah yuran bukan audit menentukan yuran audit. Begitu juga dalam analisis sensitiviti, keputusan adalah konsisten. Disamping itu, kajian ini menunjukkan bahawa pembolehubah baru dalam bentuk “jenis” bank-bank, juga memberi kesan dalam menentukan yuran audit.

Kajian ini juga menyokong kajian-kajian Rose (1999) dan Ayoib (2001) yang mendapati bahawa syarikat-syarikat asing membayar lebih ke atas yuran audit

daripada syarikat-syarikat tempatan. Dengan itu, hasil kajian ini membuka peluang kepada pengkaji-pengkaji yang lain untuk mengkaji mengenai yuran audit dan yuran bukan audit dengan menggunakan saiz sampel yang lebih besar dan sektor-sektor yang lain.

**THE DETERMINANTS OF AUDIT FEES:
THE CASE OF THE BANKING INDUSTRY IN MALAYSIA**

ABSTRACT

The issue of audit fees and non-audit fees charged by the audit firms has been discussed regularly in accounting and auditing literature. Recently, due to the corporate scandals in United States, especially the Enron scandal, the issue is discussed together with a host of revelations about audit failures that led to companies' demise. Auditing profession is being badly blamed and suggested to change due to the audit firm's reliance more on non-audit services than the audit itself. Therefore, this study attempts to probe the situation in Malaysia using banking sector as the subject of interest. Specifically, it tries to examine the impact of non-audit services conducted by audit firms to these banks over audit fees.

The results show that the variable of non-audit fees is statistically significant in determining audit fees. Similarly, in the sensitivity analysis, the results are robust. Thus, the present study shows a new variable, in the form of the “types” of banks, that has significant impact on audit fees.

This study also supports Rose (1999) and Ayoib (2001) studies that foreign companies pay more on audit fees than the local companies. Hence, these findings give opportunity to the other researchers to study on audit fees and non-audit fees by using larger sample size and other sectors.

Acknowledgments

My sincere appreciation is extended to those whose have helped, encouraged, and showed understanding, and without their help this study could not have been possible.

First and foremost, to my Supervisor, Associate Professor Dr. Azham Bin Md. Ali, who has guided me and prodded with the project to its conclusion in a firm, gentle, and professional manner. I deeply appreciate his dedication of considerable time and attention to this undertaking and his precise ability when to step in and when to back away, allowing me to learn by experience. I especially thank him for his recognition and nurturing of my project idea while it was still in its early stages and through to its completion.

Dr. Ayoib Bin Che-Ahmad in his capacity as chairperson of my master degree, I thank him for providing me with wise counsel, and also an environment that encouraged productive interaction among researchers.

Many others have contributed in various ways to the completion of this Program, culminating in completion of this project. Special mention should be made of the Association of Bankers in Malaysia, which provided me with the samples of names and addresses from its Membership List. This made it possible to survey the many banks in Malaysia before period prior to the commencement of mergers among banks in 2000.

Further appreciation is also due to those who directly or indirectly helped me in gathering information and permission to use facilities in the Kuala Lumpur Stock Exchange, Institute of Bankers in Malaysia and the Bank Negara Malaysia.

As for the contributions of my family, I begin with my late father, Shafie Bin Ahmad and my mother, Noriah Binti Abdullah, my beloved wife, Atikah Binti Mohd Mahdzir, my father in law Mohd Mahdzir Bin Abdul Rashid, my mother in law Che Zaiton Binti Che Din, my eldest sister Rohana and other members of my family who have always stood by me ready to help. Their steady and supportive attitude has made a positively motivated me throughout this research.

I also wish to gratefully acknowledge the financial support provided for this study by my sponsor, the Universiti Utara Malaysia.

Finally, my grateful thanks are extended to all other parties and anonymous reader's contribution throughout this study.

TABLE OF CONTENT

<i>Content</i>	<i>Page</i>
PERMISSON TO USE	i
ABSTRACT (BAHASA MALAYSIA)	ii
ABSTRACT (ENGLISH)	iv
ACKNOWLEDMENTS	v
LIST OF TABLES	x
1.0 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 <i>Background of Banking Sector</i>	5
1.2 <i>Background of Non-Audit Services in Malaysia</i>	10
TABLE 1- Changes in Kuala Lumpur Stock Exchange Listing Requirements	11
2.0 THE MOTIVATION OF THE STUDY	12
3.0 THE OBJECTIVE OF THE STUDY	14
4.0 LITERATURE REVIEW	16
4.1 <i>Audit Fees</i>	16
4.2 <i>Non-Audit Fees</i>	25
5.0 HYPOTHESES DEVELOPMENT	31
6.0 RESEARCH DESIGN AND SAMPLE SELECTION	34
6.1 <i>Sample and Data</i>	34
TABLE 2- Sample Selection Summary	36
TABLE 3- Summary of Sample Coverage by Industry and Category	37
6.2 <i>Explanation of the Model</i>	38
6.3 <i>Explanation and Measurement of Variables</i>	40
6.3.1 Audit Fees	40
6.3.2 Non-Audit Services Fees	40
6.3.3 Auditee Size	40
6.3.4 Complexity	41
6.3.5 Opinion	42

<i>Content</i>	<i>Page</i>
6.3.6 Auditor	42
6.3.7 Foreign	42
6.3.8 Commercial	43
TABLE 4- Expected Signs of Independent Variables	44
7.0 RESULTS	45
7.1 <i>Qualitative Results and Descriptive Statistics</i>	45
TABLE 5- Summary of Descriptive Statistics	47
TABLE 6- Pearson's Correlation Among Independent Variables	50
7.2 <i>Ordinary Least Squares (OLS) Analysis</i>	51
TABLE 7- Summary of Ordinary Least Squares Regression for Audit Fees	52
7.3 <i>Sensitivity Analyses</i>	54
TABLE 8- Summary of Sensitivity Analysis of Ordinary Least Squares Regression for Audit Fees (Excluding LOGASSETS)	55
TABLE 9- Summary of Ordinary Least Squares Regression for Audit Fees (Non-Merger Data- Including LOGASSETS)	57
TABLE 10- Summary of Ordinary Least Squares Regression for Audit Fees (Non-Merger Data-Excluding LOGASSETS)	58
TABLE 11- Summary of Ordinary Least Squares Regression for Audit Fees (Changes LOGNAS to NASAU-Including LOGASSETS)	59
TABLE 12- Summary of Ordinary Least Squares Regression for Audit Fees (Changes LOGNAS to NASAU-Excluding LOGASSETS)	60
7.4 <i>Discussion</i>	63

<i>Content</i>	<i>Page</i>
8.0 CONCLUSIONS, IMPLICATIONS AND LIMITATIONS	52
BIBLIOGRAPHY	54
APPENDIX 1- Questionnaire	58
SECTION A- Bankers Perspective on Non-Audit Services Performed by the Audit Firms	59
SECTION B- Non-Audit Services Fees Information	59

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1	Changes in Kuala Lumpur Stock Exchange Listing Requirements	11
Table 2	Sample Selection Summary	36
Table 3	Summary of Sample Coverage by Industry and Category	37
Table 4	Expected Signs of Independent Variables	44
Table 5	Summary of Descriptive Statistics	47
Table 6	Pearson's Correlation Among Independent Variables	50
Table 7	Summary of Ordinary Least Squares Regression for Audit Fees	52
Table 8	Summary of Sensitivity Analysis of Ordinary Least Squares Regression for Audit Fees (Excluding LOGASSETS)	55
Table 9	Summary of Ordinary Least Squares Regression for Audit Fees (Non-Merger Data- Including LOGASSETS)	57
Table 10	Summary of Ordinary Least Squares Regression for Audit Fees (Non-Merger Data-Excluding LOGASSETS)	58
Table 11	Summary of Ordinary Least Squares Regression for Audit Fees (Changes LOGNAS to NASAU-Including LOGASSETS)	59
Table 12	Summary of Ordinary Least Squares Regression for Audit Fees (Changes LOGNAS to NASAU-Excluding LOGASSETS)	60

1.0 INTRODUCTION

The issue of audit fees and non-audit fees has been discussed regularly in accounting and auditing fraternity as early as 1980s. Both are important in predicting future fees, investigating cost structures and measuring audit efficiency (Firth, 1997). Studies on non-audit fees issue also show a growing concern regarding the determinant of audit fees paid by client companies across several nations (Firth, 1997). Recently, the Enron scandal in the United States, had bristled with a host of revelations about the auditing leading the company to its demise. Andersen, the auditor of Enron was heavily criticised for its collapse. Such criticism was levelled against Andersen because they concentrated more on non-audit services rather than audit. In 1998, Andersen's total worldwide revenue for non-audit services was US\$ 3216.8 million as compared with US\$ 2,876.6 million only for audit (Andersen, 1998).¹ Andersen's total worldwide revenue had grown by about 13 percent annually since 1990 (Andersen, 1998). One of the reasons given by Andersen was the growth in new services they provided other than audit services.

¹ Under Malaysian Institute Accountant By Law (On Professional Conduct and Ethics) revised 2002 suggested that audit firms should not accept any appointment if they provide non-audit services, whereby the provision of non-audit services would create a significant threat to the professional independence, integrity and objectivity of the audit firms.

The contents of
the thesis is for
internal user
only

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Andersen. (1998). *Report to The People of Our Global Organization*. Chicago.

Ayoob, C.A. (2001). *The Effect of Ethnicity on Audit Pricing*. Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Melbourne.

Banking Act. (1973). Kuala Lumpur. Government Printer.

Banking and Financial Institutions Act. (1989). Kuala Lumpur. Government Printer.

Bruno, M. (2002, April). Broken Affair: Banks & Their Auditors. *USBanker*, 112(4): 34-38.

Butterworth, S. and Houghton, K.A. (1995). Auditor Switching: The Pricing of Audit Services. *Journal of Business Finance and Accounting*, 22(3): 323-344.

Chan, P., M. Ezzamel, and D. Gwilliam. (1993). Determinants of Audit Fees for Quoted UK Companies. *Journal of Business Finance & Accounting*, 20(6): 765-786.

Cliff, F. (2002). Majority of Britain's Top Companies Auditing Pay Goes for Consultancy Fees. *Knight Ridder Tribune Business News*, 1-2.

Craswell, A.T. and S.L.Taylor. (1991). The Market Structure of Auditing in Australia. *Research in Accounting Regulation*, 5: 55-77.

_____, S.L. Taylor and J.R. Francis. (1995). Auditor Brand Name Reputations and Industry Specializations. *Journal of Accounting & Economic*, 20(3): 297-305.

De Angelo, L.E. (1981). Auditor Independence, 'Low-balling' and Disclosure Regulation. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 1(3): 113-127.

_____. (1981b). Auditor Size and Audit Quality. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 183-199.

Defond, M.L., Francis, J.R., and Wong, T.J. (2000). Auditor Industry Specialization on Market Segmentation: Evidence from Hong Kong. *Auditing*, 19(1): 49-66.

Ezzamel, M., Gwilliam, D.R., and Holland, K.M. (1996). Some Empirical Evidence From Publicly Quoted UK Companies on The Relationship Between The Pricing of Audit and Non-Audit Services. *Accounting and Business Research*, 27(1): 3-16.

Faber, S. (1988). The Value of Coastal Wetlands for Recreation: An application of Travel Cost and Contingent Valuation Methodologies. *Journal of Environmental Management*, 26: 299-312.

Fader, A. (2001). *A Study on The Performance of Malaysian Commercial Banks in Malaysia*. Unpublished Master Thesis, Universiti Utara Malaysia, Kedah.

Firth, M. (1985). An Analysis of Audit Fees and Their Determinants in New Zealand. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice and Theory*, 4(2), Spring: 23-37.

_____. (1993). Price Setting and The Value of a Strong Brand Name. *International Journal of Research in Marketing*, 10, 133-151.

_____. (1997). The Provision of Non-Audit Services and The Pricing Of Audit Fees. *The Journal of Business Finance and Accounting*, 24 (3) & (4): 511-525.

_____. (1997). The Provision of Non-Audit Services by Accounting Firms to Their Audit Clients. *Contemporary Accounting Research*, 14(2), Summer: pp. 1-21.

_____. (1999). Company Takeovers and Auditor Choice Decision. *Journal of International Accounting, Auditing and Taxation*, 8(2): 197-213.

_____. (2002). Auditor-Provided Consultancy Services and Their Associations With Audit Fees and Audit Opinions. *Journal of Business Finance & Accounting*, 29(5/6): 661-693.

Francis, J. (1984). The Effect of Audit Firm Size on Audit Prices: A Study of The Australian Market. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 133-151.

_____, and Simon, D. (1987). A test of Audit Pricing in The Small-Client Segment of The U.S. Audit Market. *The Accounting Review*, 145-157.

Frankel, R.M., Johnson, M.F., and Nelson, K.K. (2002). Non-Audit Fees Paid Auditors: Do They Lead to Managed Earnings? *Directorship*, 6-9.

Gerrard, I., Houghton, K., and Woodliff, D. (1994). Audit fees: The effects of Auditee, Auditor and Industry Differences. *Managerial Auditing Journal*, 9(7): pp. 3-16.

Gray, R.M. (1998). The Asian Financial Crisis. *International Financial Law Review*, 15-19.

Gul, F.A., and Teoh, H.Y. (1986). The Effects of Combined Audit and Management Services on Public Perception of Auditor Independence in Developing Countries: The Malaysia Case. *The International Journal of Accounting*, 95-107.

Haskins, M.E. and Williams, D.D. (1988). The Associations Between Client Factors and Audit Fees: A Comparison by Country and by Firm. *Journal of Accounting and Business Research*, 18(70): 183-190.

Hillison, W. and M. Kennelley. (1988). The Economics of Non-Audit Services. *Accounting Horizons*, 2: 32-40.

Houghton, K.A., and C.A.Jubb. (1999). The Cost of Audit Qualifications: The Role of Non-Audit Services. *Journal of International Accounting Auditing & Taxation*, 8 (2): 215-240.

Jensen, M. C. and Meckling, W. H. (1976). Theory of The Firm: Managerial Behavior, Agency Costs and Ownership Structure. *Journal of Financial Economics*, 3: 305-360.

Kaplan, S.E., Menon, K, and Williams David D. (1990). The Effect of Audit Structure on The Audit Market. *Journal of Accounting and Public Policy*, 9: 197-215.

Krishnan, J. (1994). Auditor Switching and Conservatism. *The Accounting Review*, 200-215.

Krishnan, J. and Krishnan, J. (1997). Litigation Risks and Auditor Resignations. *The Accounting Review*, October 1997, 72(4): 539-560.

Kuala Lumpur Stock Exchange. "Non-Audit Services." [Online] 26 May 2002. <<http://klse.com.my/search/non-audit services>>.

Lee, C.W.J. and Zhaoyang, G. (1988). Low Balling, Legal Liability and Auditor Independence. *The Accounting Review*, 73(4): 533-555.

Lewis, M.S. (1993). *Regression Analysis*. United Kingdom, (2): Sage Publication, Inc.

Low, L., P.H. Tan, H. Koh. (1990). Determination of Audit Fees: An Analysis in The Singapore Context. *Journal of Business Finance and Accounting*, 17(2): 285-295.

Malaysian Companies Act. (1965). Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia. Government Printer.

Malaysian Institute Accountant By Law. (2002). Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia. Government Printer.

Menon, K. and William, D.D. (2001). Long-Term Trends in Audit Fees. *Auditing*, 20(1): 115-136.

Ministry of Finance Malaysia. (2000). *Economic Report 1999/2000*. Kuala Lumpur.

Mohd Atef, M.D. and Ayoib. (2000). *Auditor's Fee, Change and Low-balling in Malaysia*. Paper presented at the Seminar on Accounting Information System, Universiti Utara Malaysia, Kedah.

Neter, J., Wasserman, W. and Krutner, M. (1991). *Applied Linear Regression Model*. United States, Homewood: Irwin.

Noordin, Hanifah. (1990). Ethical Standards in The Accountancy Profession. *Accountant Nasional*, 3-9.

Palmrose, Z. (1986). Audit Fees and Auditor Size: Further Evidence. *Journal of Accounting Research*, Spring: 97-110.

_____. (1986b). The Effect of Non-audit Services on The Pricing of Audit Services: Further Evidence. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 405-411.

Pearson T. and Trompeter, G. (1994). Competition in The Market for Audit Services: The Effect of Supplier Concentration on Audit Fees. *Contemporary Accounting Research*, 11(1-1), Summer: 115-135.

Pong, C.M., and G. Whittington. (1994). The Determinants of Audit Fees: Some Empirical Models. *Journal of Business Finance & Accounting*, 21(8): 1071-1095.

Rose, A.M. (1999). Audit Pricing and The Role of Multinational Factors: A Study of The Hong Kong and Malaysian Markets. *Advances In International Accounting*, 12:129-155.

Rubin, Marc A. (1988). Municipal Audit Fee Determinants. *The Accounting Review*, LXIII(2): 219-235.

Sekaran, U. (2000). *Research Methods For Business: A Skill Building Approach* (3d ed.). United States: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

Simon, D.T. (1985). The Audit Services Market: Additional Empirical Evidence. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice and Theory*, Fall: 71-78.

Simon, D.T. and Francis, J.R. (1988). The Effects of Auditor Change on Audit Fees: Test of Pricing Cutting and Price Recovery. *The Accounting Review*, LXIII (2): 255-269.

Simunic, D. (1980). The Pricing of Audit Services: Theory and Evidence. *Journal of Accounting Research*, Spring: 161-190.

_____. (1984). Auditing, Consulting and Auditor Independence. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 18:161-190.

Swartz, K. B. and Menon, K. (1985). Auditor Switches by Failing Firms. *The Accounting Review*, 248-261.

Teoh, H. Y. and Lim C. C. (1996). An Empirical Study of The Effects of Audit Committees, Disclosure of Non-audit fees, and Other Issues on Audit Independence: Malaysian Evidence. *Journal of International Accounting, Auditing & Taxation*, 5(2): 231-248.

The Association of Banks in Malaysia. (2000). *Bankers Directory 2000*. Kuala Lumpur.

The Prime Minister Department. (2001). *The Third Outline Perspective Plan 2001-2010*. Kuala Lumpur.

The Star. (2002, February 7). Deloitte Also Decides to Spin Off Consulting Arm. p.11.

_____. (2002, March 14). Bank to Change Audit Firms Every 5 years Under New Rules. p. 12.

_____. (2002, August 10). Accounting Firms- Is it Time for Transparency? p. 6.

_____. (2002, August 12). Auditing Profession Badly Needs Change. p. 9.

_____. (2002, September 25). Deloitte to be Largest Privately Owned Consulting Firm. p. 3.

_____. (2002, September 27). Accounting Firms Get New Blood, New Agendas at The Top. p. 11.

Wines, G. (1994). Auditor Independence, Audit Qualifications and The Provision of Non-Audit Services: A Note. *Accounting and Finance*, 34(1): 75-87.